

**State of Maine
Master Score Sheet**

RFP# 202411202					
Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project					
Bidder Name:		Haley Ward, Inc.	John Turner Consulting, Inc.	Pinchin, L.L.C	WSP USA Inc.
Proposed Cost:		\$2,192,000.00	\$904,786.40	\$2,550,300.00	\$4,045,669.86
Scoring Sections	Points Available	100	100	100	100
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	45	30	25	45
Section III: Proposed Services	25	23	5	3	20
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	10.33	25	8.87	5.59
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>78.33</u>	<u>60</u>	<u>36.87</u>	<u>70.59</u>
Bidder Name:		Tetra Tech			
Proposed Cost:		\$2,877,587.00			
Scoring Sections	Points Available	100			
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	Pass			
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	50			
Section III: Proposed Services	25	24			
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	7.90			
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>81.90</u>			

Award Justification Statement
RFP# 202411202 - Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl
Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

I. Summary

The Maine Department of Environmental Protection is seeking proposals to provide consulting services for a PFAS project as defined in this Request for Proposals (RFP) document. This document provides instructions for submitting proposals, the procedure and criteria by which the Awarded Bidder(s) will be selected, and the contractual terms that will govern the relationship between the State of Maine (State) and the awarded Bidder(s).

These services shall cover the entirety of the ongoing filter monitoring projects for the Fairfield PFAS Sites and Benton Woodworth PFAS Site. The Awarded Bidder shall complete sampling of filtration systems, provide environmental data analysis, assist in resident outreach, and aid in basic filtration system maintenance.

II. Evaluation Process

Prior to the initiation of the RFP process, an evaluation team was established, comprised of qualified reviewers, each with specific solid waste expertise, from the Bureau of Remediation and Waste Management. The evaluation team was trained in the RFP review/evaluation process and conducted their individual reviews of proposals.

Following individual reviews, the evaluation team met on March 7th, 2025, to discuss the merits of each proposal and rank them. Each proposal was then scored using a consensus-based evaluation system. The maximum achievable score was 100 points, based on the following categories:

- Preliminary Information/eligibility (Pass/Fail)
- Organization, Qualifications and Experience (50 points),
- Proposed Services (25 points), and
- Cost Proposal (25 points)

Scores were assigned based upon the following criteria:

- The applicant's ability to lay out clear and complete proposal,
- The applicant's ability to present specifics on project tasks and management of those tasks,
- The applicant's ability to provide notable related project experience, and
- Applicants have sufficient staffing capabilities.

III. Qualifications & Experience

- Lots of available staff with experience.

- Have experience with complex ground water monitoring experience.
- Have experience working with and contacting residents.
- Ability to do additional work for other PFAS projects.

IV. Proposed Services

- Ability to provide maintenance on filters, i.e. sediment filters.
- Provide evaluation of performance of filters and evaluate data.
- Willing to present at public meetings.

V. Cost Proposal

- Provided a cost proposal of \$2,877,587 which encompasses the full contract length compared to lower bids from John Turner Consulting, Inc. which did not provide a rate sheet.

VI. VI. Conclusion

Provided a full proposal for the full scope of work for all services asked for in the RFP. Also provided information about additional duties and services that they could provide to the Department. The proposal provided sufficient information about past project experience related to POET sampling experience. Proposal notes experience with resident outreach and communication. Overall proposal provided information in well laid out manner for project tasks and information.



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION



Janet T. Mills
Governor

Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

April 9th, 2025

Haley Ward, Inc.
One Merchants Plaza, Suite 701
Bangor, Maine 04401

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202411202,
Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter
Monitoring Project

Dear Haley Ward, Inc:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection for Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Tetra Tech, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,



Sarah Smith

Sarah Smith
Environmental Specialist III
Bureau of Remediation and Waste Management
Maine Department of Environmental Protection
Ph: (207) 881-7936, Email: Sarah.Smith@maine.gov

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION



Janet T. Mills
Governor

Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

April 9th, 2025

John Turner Consulting, Inc.
136 Maine Avenue
Bangor, ME 04401

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202411202,
Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter
Monitoring Project

Dear John Turner Consulting, Inc:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection for Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Tetra Tech, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,



Sarah Smith

Sarah Smith
Environmental Specialist III
Bureau of Remediation and Waste Management
Maine Department of Environmental Protection
Ph: (207) 881-7936, Email: Sarah.Smith@maine.gov

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION



Janet T. Mills
Governor

Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

April 9th, 2025

Pinchin, Inc.
400 Commercial Street, Suite 404
Portland, ME 04101

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202411202,
Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter
Monitoring Project

Dear Pinchin, Inc:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection for Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Tetra Tech, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,



Sarah Smith

Sarah Smith
Environmental Specialist III
Bureau of Remediation and Waste Management
Maine Department of Environmental Protection
Ph: (207) 881-7936, Email: Sarah.Smith@maine.gov

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION



Janet T. Mills
Governor

Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

April 9th, 2025

WSP USA, Inc.
2 Monument Square, Suite 200
Portland, Maine 04101

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202411202,
Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter
Monitoring Project

Dear WSP USA, Inc:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection for Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Tetra Tech, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,



Sarah Smith

Sarah Smith
Environmental Specialist III
Bureau of Remediation and Waste Management
Maine Department of Environmental Protection
Ph: (207) 881-7936, Email: Sarah.Smith@maine.gov

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION



Janet T. Mills
Governor

Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

April 9th, 2025

Tetra Tech, Inc.
5 Industrial Way, Suite 2B
Salem, NH 03079

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202411202,
Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter
Monitoring Project

Dear Tetra Tech, Inc:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection for Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Tetra Tech, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,



Sarah Smith

Sarah Smith
Environmental Specialist III
Bureau of Remediation and Waste Management
Maine Department of Environmental Protection
Ph: (207) 881-7936, Email: Sarah.Smith@maine.gov

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Haley Ward, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Environmental Protection

Name of RFP Coordinator: Sarah Smith

Names of Evaluators: Joseph Maisonave, Louise Roy, Chris Evans

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	Pass	
• <u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	45
Section III. Proposed Services	25	23
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	10.33
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>78.33</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Haley Ward, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Have experience in working with POET systems and the area.
- Knowledge of what filter maintenance looks like.
- Familiarity with the area of the RFP.
- Will set up meeting the Department.
- Willing to participate in internal DEP meetings.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Haley Ward, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	45

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - Have plenty of staff and experience.
 - Lots of experience with project area and POET systems.
- II. Subcontractors
 - No Subcontractors
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Plenty of licensed and qualified staff.
- IV. Litigation
 - Provided information on coverage.
- V. Financial Viability
 - Provided sufficient information.
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided copies of licensures and certifications.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Haley Ward, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	23

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Data management for totalizer and electrical meter readings mentioned in scope of work.
- Streamline scheduling process with online scheduling.
- Photograph wells and GPS locations of them.
- Mentioned ability to respond to AFFF or landfill sites in the area if needed.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Haley Ward, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal		Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$908,786.40		\$2,192,000.00	x	25 points	=	10.33

Evaluation Team Comments:

Did not provide pricing for full scope of work, priced for 2029 end date.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: John Turner Consulting, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Environmental Protection

Name of RFP Coordinator: Sarah Smith

Names of Evaluators: Joseph Maisonave, Louise Roy, Chris Evans

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	Pass	
• <u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	30
Section III. Proposed Services	25	5
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	25
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>60</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: John Turner Consulting, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: John Turner Consulting, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Overview of the Organization

- Limited staffing
- Have POET system experience.

II. Subcontractors

- No subcontractors.

III. Organizational Chart

- Provided information on qualified staff.

IV. Litigation

- Provided information on coverage.

V. Financial Viability

- Provided information.

VI. Certificate of Insurances

- Provided copies of licensures and certifications.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: John Turner Consulting, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	5

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Limited staffing and limited in services they can provide.
- Overall gave vague descriptions on scope of work and no details on how they will be addressing that.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: John Turner Consulting, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal		Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$904,786.40		\$904,786.40	x	25 points	=	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Did not provide rate sheet or breakdown of costs.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Pinchin

DATE: March 7th, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Environmental Protection

Name of RFP Coordinator: Sarah Smith

Names of Evaluators: Joseph Maisonave, Louise Roy, Chris Evans

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	Pass	
• Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	25
• Section III. Proposed Services	25	3
• Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	8.87
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>36.87</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Pinchin

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Do not have POET specific experience.
- Not a lot of detail provided.
- Have staffing and qualified on paper.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Pinchin

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Overview of the Organization

- Did not provide information on experience
- Do not have experience on POET systems

II. Subcontractors

- No Subcontractors

III. Organizational Chart

- Have staffing and licensing

IV. Litigation

- Provided information on coverage.

V. Financial Viability

- Provided sufficient information.

VI. Certificate of Insurances

- Provided copies of licensures and certifications.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Pinchin

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	3

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Do not have POET system experience.
- Not a lot of details on how they will be working on this project.
- Do not describe in detail the scope of their work.
- Did not demonstrate specific experience that relates to this RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Pinchin

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal		Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$904,786.40		\$2,550,300.00	x	25 points	=	8.87

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Did not provide a cost breakdown with specifics.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: WSP USA Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Environmental Protection

Name of RFP Coordinator: Sarah Smith

Names of Evaluators: Joseph Maisonave, Louise Roy, Chris Evans

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	Pass	
• <u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
• Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	45
• Section III. Proposed Services	25	20
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	5.59
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>70.59</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: WSP USA Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Thorough with information provided on PFAS experience.
- Capable of handling data.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: WSP USA Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	45

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - PFAS work experience.
 - Plenty of staff.
- II. Subcontractors
 - Culligan Water Technologies
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Qualified staffing
- IV. Litigation
 - Provided information
- V. Financial Viability
 - Provided information
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided copies of licensures and certifications.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: WSP USA Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	24

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Explicit on number of samples and methods of samplings being done.
- Experience with scheduling and handling data.
- Could offer 3D visual capabilities,
- Suggested online scheduling system.
- Did not provide specific POET experience.
- Will be subbing fieldwork out to Culligan.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: WSP USA Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal		Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$904,786.40		\$4,045,669.86	x	25 points	=	5.59

Evaluation Team Comments:

Overall good proposal and meet requirements for project.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Tetra Tech, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Environmental Protection

Name of RFP Coordinator: Sarah Smith

Names of Evaluators: Joseph Maisonave, Louise Roy, Chris Evans

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	Pass	
• <u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
• Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	50
• Section III. Proposed Services	25	24
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	7.90
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>81.90</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Tetra Tech, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Lots of available staff.
- Lots of notable project experience.
- Presented specifics on big tasks and management of those tasks.
- Well laid out and clear proposal.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Tetra Tech, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	50	50

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - Have sufficient staffing at both the front and back end for project needs.
 - Lots of POET system experience.
 - Experience working with and communicating with public/residents.
- II. Subcontractors
 - No subcontractors.
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Plenty of licensed and qualified staff.
- IV. Litigation
 - Provided information on coverage.
- V. Financial Viability
 - Provided sufficient information.
- VI. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided copies of licensures and certifications.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Tetra Tech, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	25	24

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Data management for totalizer and electrical meter readings mentioned in scope of work.
- Have experience with complex ground watering experience.
- Willing to present at public meetings.
- Have POET system experience and mentioned specific projects that use POET systems.
- Can evaluate performance of filters and data of filters.
- Have outreach experience and contact experience with homeowners.
- Mentioned field qa/qc practices.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS) Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER: Tetra Tech, Inc.

DATE: March 7th, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal		Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$908,786.40		\$2,877,587	x	25 points	=	7.90

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Proposal was well laid out for the cost proposal.
- Well organized and clear on services they were providing.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Haley Ward, Inc.

DATE: 2/28/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Joesph Maisonave

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section 1 Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page (App A) YES
2. Responsible Bidder Certification (App B) YES
3. Eligibility Requirements – Licensed Geologist YES

Section 2 Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of the Organization (App C) YES
2. Subcontractors (If PE not on staff, must be subcontracted) YES
3. Organizational Chart YES
4. Litigation (list of anything in the last 5 years) None
5. Certificate of Insurance YES
6. Licensure and Accreditation – Licensed Geologist and 40hr HAZWOPER YES

HW have experienced LGs, Hydrogeologists and Engineers, with a wide breadth of services. They have a experience with PFAS investigations. They have experience working with DEP on LD1600 projects.

Section 3 Proposed Services

1. Description of Services as per Part II of RFP

HW demonstrates that they have experience with MEDEP SOPs, HASPs and required sampling and reporting procedures. They provide a good description for contacting homeowners and implementing sampling plans. They provide a brief description of additional responsibilities they can provide.

Section 4 Cost Proposal

1. Description
2. App D Costs associated with tasks in Part II of RFP

\$2,192,000

It is unclear exactly what was used to calculate the proposed cost in the proposal. It seems that the cost includes one SAP, one HASP and one residential well will be sampled. The amount of times that well is sampled is unknown. Did they calculate each home is sampled at the assigned frequency for the duration of the contract (February 20, 2025 to December 31, 2029)? It would have been helpful if an itemized cost proposal was submitted.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Haley Ward, Inc.

DATE: 3/4/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Louise Roy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Staffing Requirements

1. Positive:

- Plenty of staff from many offices in Maine
- Pace Analytical Services – Subcontractor is qualified by the State of Maine
- All staff up to date with HAZWOPR/other certifications
- Have experience delivering data to the State in required formats

2. Negative:

3. Questions:

4. Interesting:

- Lots of PFAS experience, including filter monitoring

II. Initial Meeting

1. Positive:

- Meeting will occur as outlined in RFP

2. Negative:

3. Questions:

4. Interesting:

III. Sampling Requirements

1. Positive:

- Will contact homeowners as requested by the DEP
- Will research contact info if MEDEP does not have up-to-date info
- Will document all outreach efforts
- Will develop SAPs and HASPs which DEP and HW staff will review
- Will follow DEP SOPs
- Will meet required timeline for sampling as outlined by the DEP

2. Negative:

3. Questions:

- Will photograph wells- needed?

4. Interesting:

- Will GPS well locations
- Will continue to track contact information for the DEP

IV. Routine Monitoring

1. Positive:

- Will attempt to streamline the scheduling process
- Will collect appropriate amount of field blanks and duplicates.
- Will provide enough staff for sampling to meet DEP request of 2/day
- Will document field activities
- Will schedule filter maintenance as needed
- Will submit a tracking sheet to the DEP with the results from sampling events
- Have preferences on how to divide sampling efforts in the area

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Haley Ward, Inc.

DATE: 3/4/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Louise Roy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

2. Negative:
 3. Questions:
 4. Interesting:
- V. Additional Responsibilities
1. Positive:
 - Willing to assist with public or internal meetings
 2. Negative:
 3. Questions:
 4. Interesting:
 - Able to respond to sites that may also contain PFAS: AFFF and landfills

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Haley Ward, Inc.

DATE: 3/6/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Chris Evans

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- *Staffing Requirements-listed proj experience*
 - *Positive: PFAS RFB proj, filter POET exper – addressed all specifics*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note: long term work in Fairfield Benton area*

- *Project Implementation*
 - *Positive: overall proposed tasks reflect experience with the filter sampling process, field procedures DEP recommends, and data mgt/reporting to DEP/residents*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note:*

- *Initial Meeting*
 - *Positive: addressed specifically and in detail*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note:*

- *Sampling Requirements*
 - *Positive: addressed in detail related tasks noted in RFP*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note: noted totalizer and meter readings*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Haley Ward, Inc.

DATE: 3/6/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Chris Evans

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

- *Routine Monitoring*
 - *Positive: RFB experience, addressed project specifics in detail based on their RFB experience*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note: included details on reporting*

- *Additional Responsibilities*
 - *Positive:*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions: other types of sites? Generally state ability to work on other types of proj but examples all directly relate to work similar to the RFP*
 - *Interesting/note:*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: John Turner Consulting, Inc.

DATE: 3/3/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Joesph Maisonavé

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section 1 Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page (App A) YES
2. Responsible Bidder Certification (App B) YES
3. Eligibility Requirements – Licensed Geologist YES

Section 2 Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of the Organization (App C) YES
2. Subcontractors (If PE not on staff, must be subcontracted) Yes. Labs, subsurface investigation contractors, Geophysics and UST Removal (not applicable)
3. Organizational Chart YES
4. Litigation (list of anything in the last 5 years) NONE
5. Certificate of Insurance YES
6. Licensure and Accreditation – Licensed Geologist and 40hr HAZWOPER YES???

Worked on PFAS investigations for DEP as well as other Phase IIs. All listed. Does a lot with UST closures. Not much in terms of additional services related to PFAS investigation, mitigation or remediation.

Section 3 Proposed Services

1. Description of Services as per Part II of RFP

Brief description but does not describe how they will provide the required services as per Part II of RFP.

Section 4 Cost Proposal

1. Description
2. App D Costs associated with tasks in Part II of RFP

\$904,786.40 total cost. Does not provide a description of the cost proposal.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: John Turner Consulting, Inc.

DATE: 3/5/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Louise Roy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Staffing Requirements

1. Positive:

- *Have qualified staff to manage the project*
- *Staff have managed large scale PFAS sampling events before, competent with reporting process to MEDEP*
- *Have worked on a range of sites with DEP*

2. Negative:

3. Questions:

4. Interesting:

- *Examples provided of sites in Maine that they have investigated for PFAS*
- *Various labs to work with, provided list of contractors*

II. Initial Meeting

1. Positive:

2. Negative:

3. Questions:

- *Did not mention meeting with DEP prior to site work*

4. Interesting:

III. Sampling Requirements

1. Positive:

- *Familiar with MEDEP SOPs*
- *States that they will meet the requirements of the SOP*

2. Negative:

3. Questions:

4. Interesting:

IV. Routine Monitoring

1. Positive:

2. Negative:

- *Did not mention any specific methods or processes they would use*

3. Questions:

4. Interesting:

V. Additional Responsibilities

1. Positive:

2. Negative:

3. Questions:

- *Nothing mentioned for additional services that they could offer*

4. Interesting:

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: John Turner Consulting, Inc.

DATE: 3/5/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Chris Evans

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- *Staffing Requirements – listed proj experience*
 - *Positive:*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions: small firm, mostly small proj exper – adequate staff to meet proj needs*
 - *Interesting: have exper with 2 small filter RFBs and septage RFB/ SAP/HASP devel*

- *Project Implementation*
 - *Positive: exper with CSMs*
 - *Negative: only provided general info- no detail*
 - *Questions: suffic staff?*
 - *Interesting:*

- *Initial Meeting*
 - *Positive:*
 - *Negative: no mention of meeting as required in the descript of sect III proposed services*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting:*

- *Sampling Requirements*
 - *Positive: experience with subcontr labs and providing EDDs and req'd information*
 - *Negative: lack of detail – didn't address details in RFP*
 - *Questions/note: listed general comm and DEP SOPs*
 - *Interesting:*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: John Turner Consulting, Inc.

DATE: 3/5/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Chris Evans

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

- *Routine Monitoring*
 - *Positive: ran 2 PFAS RFBs*
 - *Negative: no other LTM type experience or POET experience*
 - *Questions: acceptable performance on the 2 RFBs?*
 - *Interesting:*

- *Additional Responsibilities*
 - *Positive:*
 - *Negative: limited experience with other PFAS proj*
 - *Questions: lots of VRAP/Phi/II experience less with PFAS projects*
 - *Interesting:*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Pinchin, LLC

DATE: 3/3/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Joesph Maisonave

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section 1 Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page (App A) YES
2. Responsible Bidder Certification (App B) YES
3. Eligibility Requirements – Licensed Geologist YES

Section 2 Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of the Organization (App C) YES
2. Subcontractors (If PE not on staff, must be subcontracted) NONE
3. Organizational Chart YES
4. Litigation (list of anything in the last 5 years) One case settled in 2024
5. Certificate of Insurance YES
6. Licensure and Accreditation – Licensed Geologist and 40hr HAZWOPER YES

Pinchin has experience with investigating landfills, spills, AFFF releases and schools. They demonstrated experience with conducting site investigations for PFAS related impacts to drinking water wells around a school (confidential).

Section 3 Proposed Services

1. Description of Services as per Part II of RFP

Pinchin provided a brief (less than half page) description of their proposed services with no context. They then included copies of DEP SOPs.

Section 4 Cost Proposal

1. Description
2. App D Costs associated with tasks in Part II of RFP

No description was provided. \$2,550,300 total. Fee schedule included.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Pinchin, LLC

DATE: 3/5/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Louise Roy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Staffing Requirements

1. Positive:

- The applicant has plenty of qualified staff to complete the work
- The applicant provided examples of projects that they have completed
- They provided examples of PFAS work

2. Negative:

3. Questions:

4. Interesting:

II. Initial Meeting

1. Positive:

2. Negative:

- No information

3. Questions:

4. Interesting:

III. Sampling Requirements

1. Positive:

- Will follow Maine DEP SOPs

2. Negative:

- No other information

3. Questions:

4. Interesting:

IV. Routine Monitoring

1. Positive:

- No information

2. Negative:

3. Questions:

4. Interesting:

V. Additional Responsibilities

1. Positive:

2. Negative:

- No information

3. Questions:

4. Interesting:

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Pinchin, Inc.

DATE: 3/6/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Chris Evans

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- *Staffing Requirements-listed proj experience:*
 - *Positive:*
 - *Negative: unclear they have the staff sufficient to complete the tasks in the RFP*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note:*

- *Project Implementation*
 - *Positive:*
 - *Negative: not addressed in any detail, just mirrored DEP SOPs back at us*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note:*

- *Initial Meeting*
 - *Positive:*
 - *Negative: not mentioned*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note:*

- *Sampling Requirements*
 - *Positive:*
 - *Negative: not detailed*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note:*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Pinchin, Inc.

DATE: 3/6/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Chris Evans

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

- *Routine Monitoring*
 - *Positive:*
 - *Negative: not detailed*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note: did not address any of the scope details in the RFP*

- *Additional Responsibilities*
 - *Positive: other projects listed show ability/experience with range of DEP projects*
 - *Negative: briefly described, no detail*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note: other projects not include much direct POET experience*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: WSP USA Inc.

DATE: 3/5/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Joesph Maisonave

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section 1 Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page (App A) YES
2. Responsible Bidder Certification (App B) YES
3. Eligibility Requirements – Licensed Geologist YES

Section 2 Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of the Organization (App C) YES
2. Subcontractors (If PE not on staff, must be subcontracted) PE on staff, Pace and Culligan listed.
3. Organizational Chart YES
4. Litigation (list of anything in the last 5 years) ??? WSP did not disclose but said they are “subject to various legal proceedings from time to time.”
5. Certificate of Insurance YES
6. Licensure and Accreditation – Licensed Geologist and 40hr HAZWOPER YES

WSP has extensive experience in investigating and mitigating PFAS contamination for high profile sites. They have also implemented remedial measures including pump and treat with GAC and regen IX. They have also been involved in evaluating treatment and destruction. Finally they have implemented mitigation plans including the installation of POET systems in communities. Projects of note: Pease, Cutler, Coakley Landfill in Portsmouth, NH, and 3M site in Minnesota.

Section 3 Proposed Services

1. Description of Services as per Part II of RFP

Described sampling method. Will be using Culligan to conduct sampling which provides an expert in POET systems inspecting systems at each event. Also will perform simple maintenance like sediment filter changes and salt refills. Quality proposal with a good description of services.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: WSP USA Inc.

DATE: 3/5/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Joesph Maisonave

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection
Section 4 Cost Proposal

1. Description
2. App D Costs associated with tasks in Part II of RFP

\$4,045,669 Total cost. This only includes contract period through 12/31/2029? 1 year shorter than requested in the RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: WSP USA Inc.

DATE: 3/4/3025

EVALUATOR NAME: Louise Roy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Staffing Requirements

1. *Positive:*

- *Have plenty of qualified staff to manage the project*
- *Pace Analytical- qualified by the State of Maine*

2. *Negative:*

3. *Questions:*

4. *Interesting:*

- *WSP has experience working with the US Air Force, Army Corps of Engineers, and other state agencies on large PFAS projects*
- *Have provided litigation support in the PFAS world*
- *3D visualization capabilities*

II. Initial Meeting

1. *Positive:*

- *Plan to have a meeting with DEP staff*

2. *Negative:*

3. *Questions:*

4. *Interesting:*

III. Sampling Requirements

1. *Positive:*

- *Will write a SAP*
- *Will write a HASP*
- *Will follow DEP SOPs*
- *Will send results to homeowners*
- *Will contact DEP when results exceed the defined contamination limit*

2. *Negative:*

3. *Questions:*

- *Subbing out sampling work to Culligan- potential communication issues?*

4. *Interesting:*

- *Potential use of an online scheduling system*

IV. Routine Monitoring

1. *Positive:*

- *Will send results to homeowners*
- *Will contact filter vendors to schedule filter maintenance*
- *Will carry and supply salt and sediment filters to distribute*
- *Will contact DEP when results exceed the defined contamination limit*

2. *Negative:*

3. *Questions:*

4. *Interesting:*

- *Provided a potential schedule for quarterly/biannual/yearly sampling*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: WSP USA Inc.

DATE: 3/4/3025

EVALUATOR NAME: Louise Roy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

- *Sampling process could also work if guidelines are dropped*

V. *Additional Responsibilities*

1. *Positive:*

2. *Negative:*

3. *Questions:*

4. *Interesting:*

- *Experience with modeling, surface and borehole geophysical methods, drilling programs, groundwater modelling, and 3D visualization for PFAS*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: WSP USA Inc.

DATE: 3/6/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Chris Evans

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- *Staffing Requirements-listed proj experience:*
 - *Positive: depth of PFAS proj experience incl in ME, investing and resid-POET, large # staff in Ptl'd office*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note: good CSM refs, Big projects listed as refs, complex PFAS studies but not as much with focus on POET, though some have resid sampling and outreach components*

- *Project Implementation*
 - *Positive: schedule support staff thought out, and noted contact with DEP*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions: Culligan able to implement this level of fieldwork?*
 - *Interesting/note:*

- *Initial Meeting*
 - *Positive: note meeting and plan to finalize details*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note:*

- *Sampling Requirements*
 - *Positive: SAP/HASP addressed, Culligan to handle sed filters and softener maint*
 - *Negative:*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: WSP USA Inc.

DATE: 3/6/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Chris Evans

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

- *Questions:*
- *Interesting/note:*

- *Routine Monitoring*
 - *Positive: detailed schedule and handling of data, data mgt; note transmittal to residents in conjunction with DEP;*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note: subbing all sampling to Culligan -potential communication issues*

- *Additional Responsibilities*
 - *Positive: with depth of experience clearly can support other types of potential work; addressed with detailed text*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note: deep mgt chart such that field staff not ID'd*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Tetra Tech

DATE: 3/4/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Joesph Maisonave

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section 1 Preliminary Information

1. Proposal Cover Page (App A) YES
2. Responsible Bidder Certification (App B) YES
3. Eligibility Requirements – Licensed Geologist YES

Section 2 Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of the Organization (App C) YES
2. Subcontractors (If PE not on staff, must be subcontracted) Eurofins and Pace
3. Organizational Chart YES
4. Litigation (list of anything in the last 5 years) NONE
5. Certificate of Insurance YES
6. Licensure and Accreditation – Licensed Geologist and 40hr HAZWOPER YES

Tetra Tech demonstrates extensive experience in PFAS investigation, remediation for multiple entities. They have experience in Fate and Transport studies, Risk Evaluation and evaluating treatment and destruction technologies. Work with Brunswick NAS, Cutler, VTDEC. They developed Performance monitoring reports for POET systems, which evaluated monitoring results, developed PFAS Breakthrough curves, and recommended sampling and changeout frequency. They developed outreach program and Risk Communication Strategies. “Triad Approach”.

Much more capacity for Additional Services and evaluating data. Valuable experience in modeling and statistical analysis for site evaluation. Also evaluated treatment and destruction technologies. The team has a lot of experience and provided many examples for Federal and State government projects of the same nature as this RFP.

Section 3 Proposed Services

1. Description of Services as per Part II of RFP

Group homes and sample every 2 months. Methodical approach. Familiar with EDDs. TT provides a detailed description of their project management including SAP and HASP development. Provided Ghant chart. Cost proposal built assuming Term through December 31. 2030 (proposal doc 3 section 3C “Schedule”?)

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Tetra Tech

DATE: 3/4/2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Joesph Maisonave

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Section 4 "Additional Responsibilities" can be useful, specifically 4g. Tetra Tech can evaluate data for system performance.

Section 4 Cost Proposal

1. Description
2. App D Costs associated with tasks in Part II of RFP

\$2,877,587 total cost.

Quality Proposal.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 2

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Tetra Tech

DATE: 3/6/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Louise Roy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Staffing Requirements

1. *Positive:*

- *Have plenty of qualified staff to manage the project*
- *Have outreach experience communicating with homeowners*

2. *Negative:*

3. *Questions:*

4. *Interesting:*

- *Have experience installing and maintaining PFAS filter systems in many states and also in Australia*
- *Can do complex GW modeling*
- *Experienced in many programs*

II. Initial Meeting

1. *Positive:*

- *Mention importance of having an initial meeting and good communication*
- *Will develop a SAP*
- *Will follow DEP SOPs*
- *Will create a HASP*

2. *Negative:*

3. *Questions:*

4. *Interesting:*

III. Sampling Requirements

1. *Positive:*

- *See below*

2. *Negative:*

3. *Questions:*

4. *Interesting:*

IV. Routine Monitoring

1. *Positive:*

- *Will follow all requirements for duplicate and blank collection*
- *Noted that they will carry salt and sediment filters*
- *Will have an in-house chemist review data*

2. *Negative:*

3. *Questions:*

- *Have two labs they work with?*

4. *Interesting:*

- *Included a thorough timeline*
- *Have a Resident Communication Manager*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 2

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Tetra Tech

DATE: 3/6/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Louise Roy

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

V. *Additional Responsibilities*

1. *Positive:*

- *Willing to present at public meetings*
- *Willing to assist in the development of fact sheets and other social media/web pages*
- *Can evaluate performance of filters*

2. *Negative:*

3. *Questions:*

4. *Interesting:*

- *Willing to assist in additional studies*
- *Able to assist in AFFF and landfill sites if requested*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Tetra Tech

DATE: 3/6/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Chris Evans

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- *Staffing Requirements-listed proj experience:*
 - *Positive: experienced group of licensed staff, 2 DoD proj for PFAS treatment in ME, 1 is POETs; ME and NE staff*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note: national and ME/NE experience PFAS incl POET/treatment systems*

- *Project Implementation*
 - *Positive: well thought out proposal to meet scope, staff and subs experienced*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note: experience with POETs and residential communication ME/VT/MA; relevant projects listed as examples (PFAS, POETs, resid sampling...)*

- *Initial Meeting*
 - *Positive: noted meeting to finalize scope and schedules addressed in detail*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note:*

- *Sampling Requirements*
 - *Positive: SAP/HASP elements addressed in detail, along with monit tasks*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

BIDDER NAME: Tetra Tech

DATE: 3/6/25

EVALUATOR NAME: Chris Evans

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Environmental Protection

- *Interesting/note:*

- *Routine Monitoring*
 - *Positive: detailed prop, noted QC, assist with sed filter and softeners, data mgt and reporting*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note:*

- *Additional Responsibilities*
 - *Positive: company experience with wide range of PFAS investigations and other projects; potential tasks detailed in proposal*
 - *Negative:*
 - *Questions:*
 - *Interesting/note:*



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION



Janet T. Mills
Governor

Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

I, Joseph Maisonave _____ accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

3/18/2025

Signature

Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION



Janet T. Mills
Governor

Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202411202

**RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project**

I, Louise Roy accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Signature

3/18/25
Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION



Janet T. Mills
Governor

Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202411202

RFP TITLE: Fairfield and Benton Area Per- and Polyfluoroalkyl Substances (PFAS)
Ongoing Filter Monitoring Project

I, Chris Evans
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Chris Evans

3/18/25

Signature

Date