

State of Maine
Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202409175						
Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest						
Bidder Name:		Aroostook Arborculture Inc	B&L Construction Inc.	JL Rich Timber Harvesting, LLC	McQuade LLC	
Proposed Cost:		\$724,265.00	\$984,700.00	\$357,125.00	\$1,462,562.25	
Scoring Sections	Points Available					
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	35	32	35	30	
Section III: Proposed Services	35	35	35	27	25	
Section IV: Cost Proposal	30	14.79	10.88	30	7.33	
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>84.79</u>	<u>77.88</u>	<u>92</u>	<u>62.33</u>	

Award Justification Statement
RFP# 202409175 Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

I. Summary

The Maine Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management put out an RFP for the Woodville Fire Break and Timber Harvest in Woodville, Maine. Four proposals were received and scored.

II. Evaluation Process

The evaluation team consisted of Andrew Flint, Tim Bickford and Eric Wightman with Sara Thompson as the RFP coordinator.

After receiving the proposals, the RFP Coordinator sent the Acknowledgement and Disclosure Form to all to the team members. The RFP Coordinator also sent out the proposal packets minus the cost proposal section to all of the evaluation team members for review. The Evaluation Team members then met with the RFP Coordinator to discuss the packets received and to score the packets.

III. Qualifications & Experience

Based on the packets received, the Evaluation Team determined that all of the applicants were qualified to do the work. The team reviewed the past projects that each applicant submitted and determined that all of the applicants had listed projects similar to the work described in the RFP.

IV. Proposed Services

The Evaluation Team reviewed each proposal submitted and discussed the pros and cons of each applicants' proposed services. The team was interested in if the work could be completed in the time frame, equipment that would be used to complete the project and how the project site would be left once all of the work was completed. Based on the information received the Evaluation Team discussed the strengths and weaknesses of each proposal and assigned a score to each packet based on what was submitted.

V. Cost Proposal

The cost proposal was scored based on the formula in the RFP. The lowest proposal was given 30 points and the other applications were based on the cost submitted. Prices ranged from \$357,125.00 to \$1,462,562.25.

VI. Conclusion

The Evaluation Team scored all of the proposals received. They discussed all of the pros and cons of each proposal received and scored them based on the discussion of each proposal. JL Rich Timber Harvesting LLC was awarded 92 points out of 100.



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF Defense, Veterans
and Emergency Management
32 State House Station
Augusta, Maine 04333-0032**

**Diane L. Dunn
Brigadier General
Commissioner
Commissioner**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

March 27, 2025

Mr. Darren Donovan, President
Aroostook Arborculture Inc
177 Houlton Road
Presque Isle, ME 04769

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202409175,
Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest**

Dear Mr. Donovan:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management for Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- JL Rich Timber Harvesting, LLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Sara Thompson". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Sara Thompson, Procurement Manager

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF Defense, Veterans
and Emergency Management
32 State House Station
Augusta, Maine 04333-0032

Diane L. Dunn
Brigadier General
Commissioner
Commissioner

March 27, 2025

Mr. Brent Willette, President
B&L Construction, Inc
90 Houlton Road
Presque Isle, ME 04769

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202409175,
Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

Dear Mr. Willette:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management for Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- JL Rich Timber Harvesting, LLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Sara Thompson". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Sara Thompson, Procurement Manager

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF Defense, Veterans
and Emergency Management
32 State House Station
Augusta, Maine 04333-0032**

**Diane L. Dunn
Brigadier General
Commissioner
Commissioner**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

March 27, 2025

Mr. Josh Rich, Owner
JL Rich Timber Harvesting, LLC
86 B Road
Houlton, ME 04730

**SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202409175,
Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest**

Dear Mr. Rich:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management for Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- JL Rich Timber Harvesting, LLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Sara Thompson". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Sara Thompson, Procurement Manager

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF Defense, Veterans
and Emergency Management
32 State House Station
Augusta, Maine 04333-0032

Diane L. Dunn
Brigadier General
Commissioner
Commissioner

March 27, 2025

Mr. Benjamin R. McQuade
McQuade, LLC
954 US 1
Monticello, ME 04760

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202409175,
Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

Dear Mr. McQuade:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management for Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- JL Rich Timber Harvesting, LLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Sara Thompson". The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Sara Thompson, Procurement Manager

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: Aroostook Arborculture, Inc.
DATE: February 7, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management
Name of RFP Coordinator: Sara Thompson
Names of Evaluators: Andrew Flint, Tim Bickford, & Eric Wightman

<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	35
Section III. Proposed Services	35	35
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	14.79
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>84.79</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: Aroostook Arborculture, Inc.
DATE: February 7, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Aroostook Arborculture Inc has specific land-clearing/large scale mulching experience in ME, NH and VT. They have experienced staff with forestry pesticide and arborist licenses.

Aroostook Arborculture is proposing to begin work after snow melts in order to better see obstacles and rocks (demonstrating experience/knowledge of the tasks). Proposed finish date September 15, 2025.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: Aroostook Arborculture, Inc.
DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - In business for over 20 years
 - Specific land-clearing/large scale mulching experience in ME, NH, and VT
 - Experienced staff with forestry, pesticide and arborist licenses
 - Projects were spot on relevant to this proposal
- II. Subcontractors
 - None proposed
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Provided
 - Listed personnel expected to work on this project
- IV. Litigation
 - No Litigation and no pending litigation
- V. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: Aroostook Arborculture, Inc.
DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	35	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

Aroostook Arborculture Inc. proposes using two specialized CMI mulching machines and no timber harvesting equipment unless marketable timber is found. They propose to leave the breaks as bushhog-able for easy maintenance in the future

Aroostook Arborculture is proposing to begin work after snow melts in order to better see obstacles and rocks demonstrating experience and knowledge of the task. The proposed finish date is September 15, 2025. Once the timber harvest is completed any marketable timber will be discounted and deducted from the total invoice.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: Aroostook Arborculture, Inc.
DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$357,125.00	,	\$724,265.00	x	30 points	=	14.79

Evaluation Team Comments:

The proposal was scored based on the formula provided in the RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: B&L Construction Inc.
DATE: February 7, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management
Name of RFP Coordinator: Sara Thompson
Names of Evaluators: Andrew Flint, Tim Bickford, & Eric Wightman

<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	32
Section III. Proposed Services	35	35
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	10.88
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>77.88</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: B&L Construction Inc.
DATE: February 7, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Provided qualifications and experience. Project provided is spot on and relevant to the RFP. A February to April timeframe for the project was listed.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: B&L Construction Inc.
DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	32

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - 4 years of experience with forestry mulching projects similar to our Statement of Work
 - Projects provided were spot on and relevant to this project
 - MaineDOT Projects along I-95 and Presque Isle bypass
- II. Subcontractors
 - CTL Land Management would handle the merchantable timber portion of the Statement of Work appear to be experienced, capable of harvest and trucking.
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Provided and clearly articulates the positions and roles of the organization.
- IV. Financial Viability
 - Provided
- V. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: B&L Construction Inc.
DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	35	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

Services include both forestry mulching and timber harvesting. Timber harvesting will be conducted by CTL Land Management using traditional equipment (feller-buncher and tracked chipper). Producing chips may reduce DVEM's cost. Mulching will be conducted using B&L's fleet of forestry mulchers.

The work plan the B&L put forth works for the scope of the project assuming timely approval of the contract. The final site restoration, erosion and QA/QC proposed to ensure that the site is left in a clean state is appreciated.

Concern is the availability of the sub. Will this be an issue when it comes time to perform the work?

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: B&L Construction Inc.
DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$357,125.00	,	\$984,700.00	x	30 points	=	10.88

Evaluation Team Comments:

Scoring for this proposal follows the scoring set forth in the RFP document.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: JL Rich Timber Harvesting, LLC
DATE: February 7, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management
Name of RFP Coordinator: Sara Thompson
Names of Evaluators: Andrew Flint, Tim Bickford, & Eric Wightman

<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	35
Section III. Proposed Services	35	27
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	30
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>92</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: JL Rich Timber Harvesting, LLC
DATE: February 7, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

Description of the services to be provided are very detailed.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER: JL Rich Timber Harvesting, LLC

DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - In business since 2015
 - Employees are appropriately certified/accredited.
 - Projects provided were relevant to the proposal
- II. Subcontractors
 - JL Rich is proposing using R&J logging to supplement both the timber portion of the RFP and the mulching portion of the RFP. R&J Logging does have the equipment and certifications to perform the work.
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Provided Organizational Chart.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: JL Rich Timber Harvesting, LLC
DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	35	27

Evaluation Team Comments:

Forester will apply for harvest notification and will flag property lines and harvest areas and make GPS maps operators. Thorough work ethics for environmental impact concerns. Will complete snow plowing on site when needed.

A feller buncher, wheeled processor, forwarder center mount log trucks and two excavator mounted mulchers will be employed to complete the work. May be slower & less smooth surface than a dedicated mulcher machine. Forestry machines used to reduce erosion is forwarder 8-wheel low ground impact carries logs instead of dragging and low ground pressure mulchers as well.

Should meet the project timeline if the contract is funded in a timely manner. Thorough with specific timelines, and specific personnel involved.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: JL Rich Timber Harvesting, LLC
DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$357,125.00	,	\$357,125.00	x	30 points	=	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

This proposal was scored according to the method listed in the RFP

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: McQuade LLC
DATE: February 7, 2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Department of Defense, Veterans and Emergency Management
Name of RFP Coordinator: Sara Thompson
Names of Evaluators: Andrew Flint, Tim Bickford, & Eric Wightman

<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	30
Section III. Proposed Services	35	25
Section IV. Cost Proposal	30	7.33
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>62.33</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: McQuade LLC
DATE: February 7, 2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

McQuade LLC has been in business for 3 years and has relevant experience with mulching and harvesting. Plans to hire additional personnel and buy new equipment in order to meet the scope of this project (i.e., contingent on the unknown).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: McQuade LLC
DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

- I. Overview of the Organization
 - In business for 3 years with relevant experience mulching and harvesting
 - Plans to hire additional personnel and buy new equipment in order to meet the scope of this project (i.e., contingent on the unknown).
 -
- II. Subcontractors
 - KA Tuttle & Sons will subcontract to truck merchantable timber, has significant experience trucking and logging.
- III. Organizational Chart
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: McQuade LLC
DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	35	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

Will file all permits required, confirm blazing with owner (property lines or work area?). Proposed using a processor to cut breaks, a forwarder to move logs to landing area and a subcontractor to haul logs. Following this, 3 mulchers will be used to mulch the remaining brush and subsoilers to mix brush into surface soils. Stumps will be left at 6" high or less. The contractor proposed using a processor to cut breaks, a forwarder to move logs to landing areas and a subcontractor to haul the logs. Following this, 3 mulchers will be used to mulch the remaining brush and subsoilers to mix brush into surface soils.

The implementation plan seems reasonable based on the assumptions made in the proposal (hiring additional personnel and buying equipment).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest
BIDDER: McQuade LLC
DATE: February 7, 2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$357,125.00	,	\$1,462,562.25	x	30 points	=	7.33

Evaluation Team Comments:

This proposal was scored based on the formula in the RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: Aroostook Arboriculture Inc

DATE: 7-FEB-2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Andrew Flint

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. *Overview of Organization*

- Aroostook Arboriculture Inc has been in business for over 20 years.
- Specific land-clearing/large scale mulching experience in ME, NH and VT.
- Experienced staff with forestry, pesticide and arborist licenses.

2. Subcontractors

- No subcontractors proposed.

3. Organizational Chart

Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Aroostook Arboriculture proposes using two specialized CMI mulching machines and no timber harvesting equipment unless marketable timber is found.
- They propose to leave the breaks as bushhog-able for easy maintenance in the future.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Aroostook Arboriculture is proposing to begin work after snow melt in order to better see obstacles and rocks (demonstrating experience/knowledge of the task)
- Proposed finish date of 15 SEP 2025.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: Aroostook Arboriculture Inc

DATE: 5-FEB-2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Timothy Bickford

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Aroostook Arboriculture Inc has been in business for over 20 years.*
- *They have a great deal of experience in this line of work throughout Maine, NH and VT.*
- *Experienced staff with forestry, pesticide and arborist licenses.*

2. Subcontractors

- *No subcontractors proposed.*

3. Organizational Chart

The personnel expected to work on the project is listed.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Aroostook Arboriculture proposes using two mulching machines and no timber harvesting equipment unless marketable timber is found.*
- *They propose to leave the breaks as bushhog-able for easy maintenance in the future.*
-

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Aroostook Arboriculture is proposing beginning work after snow melt in order to better see obstacles and rocks.*
- *Proposed finish date of 15 SEP 2025.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: Aroostook Arboriculture Inc

DATE: February 7, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Eric Wightman

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. *Organization Qualifications and Experience*
 1. *Overview of Organization*
 - *Provided organization overview, history, and services.*
 - *20 years of service in business.*
 - *Projects provided were spot on relevant to this proposal.*
 2. *Subcontractors*
 - *None to be used.*
 - *Organizational Chart -No organizational chart submitted just owners name.*
 3. *Etc.-Insurance, and litigation Included with no Lit. pending.*
- II. *Proposed Services*
 1. *Services to be Provided*
 - *Service to be provided included in a paragraph description.*
 2. *Implementation – Work Plan*
 - *Provided with specific timeline, billing, and employees expected to work on site.*
 - *Timber harvest of markable timber contractor will discount and deduct from total invoice.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: B&L Construction Inc

DATE: 7-FEB-2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Andrew Flint

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - 4 years experience with forestry mulching projects similar in to our SOW.
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - CTL Land Management would handle the merchantable timber portion of the SOW, appears experienced, capable of harvest and trucking.
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Provided
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Per SOW: forestry mulching and timber harvesting.
 - Timber harvesting will be conducted by CTL Land Management using feller-buncher and tracked chipper (*producing chips may reduce DVEM's cost*).
 - Mulching via B&L's dedicated forestry mulcher machines
 - 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Schedule will work (if DVEM can fund promptly).
 - Thoughtful addition of final site restoration task, erosion & QA/QC minded.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: B&L Construction Inc

DATE: 4-FEB-2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Timothy Bickford

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *B&L has relevant experience with forestry mulching projects similar in scope to this RFP.*
- *DOT projects along I-95 and Presque Isle bypass.*

2. Subcontractors

- *B&L proposes to use CTL Land Management as a subcontractor to handle merchantable timber portion of the RFP.*
- *CTL Land Management appears capable of handling timber portion of the RFP.*

3. Organizational Chart

- *An organizational chart was provided and clearly articulates the positions and roles of the organization.*

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Services include both forestry mulching and timber harvesting.*
- *Timber harvesting will be conducted by CTL Land Management using traditional equipment (feller-buncher and tracked chipper).*
- *Mulching will be conducted using B&L's fleet of forestry mulchers.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *The work plan that B&L put forth works for the scope of the project assuming timely approval of the contract.*
- *Appreciate the final site restoration proposed to ensure the site is left in a clean state.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: B&L Construction Inc

DATE: February 7, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Eric Wightman

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Provided organization of Qualifications and Experience.*
- *Project were provided and spot on relevant to this project.*

2. Subcontractors

- *Yes. CTL Land Management Services, INC*
- *CTL will cut and bring timber to market that is of value.*

3. Organizational Chart -Provided and Detailed chart

4. Etc. – Insurance, litigation, Etc. All addressed and provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Detailed Service Provided.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Thorough with specific timelines, and specific personnel involved in Initial assessment and preparation phase 1 (Feb 2025), and timber harvest and operations phase 2 (Feb -Apr 2025)*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: JL Rich Timber Harvesting, Inc

DATE: 7-FEB-2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Andrew Flint

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - In business since 2015. Employees appropriately certified/accredited.
 2. Subcontractors
 - JL Rich is proposing using R&J Logging to supplement both the timber portion of the RFP and the mulching portion.
 - R&J Logging has the equipment and staff certifications to perform the work.
 3. Organizational Chart
Provided.
- II. Proposed Services
 1. Services to be Provided
 - Forester will apply for harvest notification and will flag property lines and harvest areas and making GPS maps operators.
 - A feller-buncher, wheeled processor, forwarder center mount log trucks and two excavator-mounted mulchers will be employed to complete work. (*May be slower & less smooth surface than dedicated mulcher machine*)
 - Complete snow plowing on site when needed.
 2. Implementation – Work Plan
Should meet the project timeline if the contract is funded in a timely manner.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: JL Rich Timber Harvesting, Inc

DATE: 4-FEB-2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Timothy Bickford

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *JL Rich has experience in the timber and land clearing business since 2015. Employees are appropriately accredited in their line of work.*
- *Logging equipment is well suited to the project, the two excavator mounted mulchers may take some time to complete work.*

2. Subcontractors

- *JL Rich is proposing using R&J Logging to supplement both the timber portion of the RFP and the mulching portion.*
- *R&J Logging does have the equipment and certifications to perform the work.*

3. Organizational Chart

- *An organizational chart was provided that shows how the project will be managed.*

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Forester will apply for harvest notification and will flag property lines and harvest areas and making GPS maps operators.*
- *A feller-buncher, wheeled processor, forwarder center mount log trucks and two excavator based mulchers will be employed to complete work.*
- *Complete snow plowing on site when needed.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *The implementation plan is well laid out and should meet the project timeline should the contract be processed in a timely manner.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: JL Rich Timber Harvesting, Inc

DATE: February 7, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Eric Wightman

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Organization overview, history, and services provided.*
- *Projects provided were relevant to proposal.*

2. Subcontractors

- *Yes. RT Logging.*

3. Organizational Chart -Provided and detailed.

4. Etc. -Insurance, litigation, etc. All addressed and provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Very detailed services to be provided.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Thorough work ethics for environmental impact concerns.*
- *Forestry machines used to reduce erosion. Ie. Forwarder 8-wheel low ground impact carries logs instead of dragging., and low ground pressure mulcher as well.*
- *Thorough with specific timelines, and specific personnel involved.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: McQuade, LLC

DATE: 7-FEB-2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Andrew Flint

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Been in business for 3 years with relevant experience mulching & harvesting.
 - Plans to hire additional personnel and buy new equipment in order to meet the scope of this project. (*i.e., contingent on unknowns*)
 2. Subcontractors
 - K A Tuttle & Sons will subcontract to truck merchantable timber, has significant experience trucking and logging.
 3. Organizational Chart
Provided.
- II. Proposed Services
 1. Services to be Provided
 - Will file all permits required, confirm blazing with owner.
 - Proposed using a processor to cut breaks, a forwarder to move logs to landing areas and a subcontractor to haul logs.
 - Following this, 3 mulchers will be used to mulch remaining brush and subsoilers to mix brush into surface soils. Stumps will be left at 6" high or less.
 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - The implementation plan seems reasonable based on the assumptions made in the proposal (hiring additional personnel and buying equipment).

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: McQuade, LLC

DATE: 4-FEB-2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Timothy Bickford

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *McQuade LLC has been in business for 3 years with some relevant experience in clearing and mulching as well as timber harvesting.*
- *McQuade proposes bringing in additional personnel and equipment in order to meet the scope of this project.*

2. Subcontractors

- *K A Tuttle & Sons, LLC will be subcontracted for trucking merchantable timber.*
- *K A Tuttle & Sons, LLC has lengthy experience in trucking and logging operations.*

3. Organizational Chart

An organizational chart is provided showing the structure of the operation.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *McQuade LLC will file all permits required. McQuade will confirm blazing with owner (property lines? Or work area?)*
- *Contractor proposed using a processor to cut breaks, a forwarder to move logs to landing areas and a subcontractor to haul logs.*
- *Following this, 3 mulchers will be used to mulch remaining brush and subsoilers to mix brush into surface soils. Stumps will be left at 6" high or less.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *The implementation plan seems reasonable based on the assumptions made in the proposal (hiring additional personnel and buying equipment).*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409175

RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

BIDDER NAME: McQuade, LLC

DATE: February 7, 2025

EVALUATOR NAME: Eric Wightman

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- *Very thorough organizational overview, history, and services.*
- *Detailed information regarding this specific service type of project.*
- *Project provided were spot on relevant to this proposal.*

2. Subcontractors

- *Yes. KA Tuttle and Son LLC*

3. Organizational Chart -Provided and included.

4. Etc. -Insurance, litigation, etc. all addressed and provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *Very detailed services provided.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *Thorough with specific timelines and specific personnel involved at each stage.*



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF Defense, Veterans &
Emergency Management**

**Brigadier General Diane L.
Dunn,
Commissioner**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest**

I, ANDREW FLINT accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

**FLINT.ANDREW.CHARLES.1465
704566**

Digitally signed by
FLINT.ANDREW.CHARLES.1465704566
Date: 2025.02.04 08:38:57 -05'00'

Signature

Date



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF Defense, Veterans &
Emergency Management**

**Brigadier General Diane L.
Dunn,
Commissioner**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest**

I, Timothy Bickford, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

**BICKFORD.TIMOTHY.A.129083
0423**

Digitally signed by
BICKFORD.TIMOTHY.A.1290830423
Date: 2025.02.04 06:27:48 -05'00'

Signature

Date



Janet T. Mills
Governor

STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF Defense, Veterans &
Emergency Management

Brigadier General Diane L.
Dunn,
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

I, Eric Wightman _____
accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Eric Wightman
Signature

Feb 4 2025
Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF Defense, Veterans &
Emergency Management

Brigadier General Diane L.
Dunn,
Commissioner

Janet T. Mills
Governor

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202409175
RFP TITLE: Woodville Fire Break Timber Harvest

I, Sara Thompson accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Defense, Veterans & Emergency Management. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Sara Thompson

Signature

2/4/2025

Date