

**State of Maine
Master Score Sheet**

RFP# 202409168					
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets					
Bidder Name:		AARC	AECOM	Arup	CLEARresult
Proposed Cost:		\$760,758	\$420,000	\$420,000	\$99,394.45
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	20	30	30	5
Section III: Proposed Services	45	15	40	40	10
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	3.27	5.92	5.92	25
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>38.27</u>	<u>75.92</u>	<u>75.92</u>	<u>40</u>
Bidder Name:		Deloitte	ERG	ICF	IEM
Proposed Cost:		\$322,701	\$239,912	\$224,546	\$ 227,565
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	20	30	25	20
Section III: Proposed Services	45	15	40	30	10
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	7.7	10.36	11.07	10.92
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>42.70</u>	<u>80.36</u>	<u>66.07</u>	<u>40.92</u>

Bidder Name:		Resilient Analytics	Stantec	Tetra Tech	Thorton Thomasetti
Proposed Cost:		\$595,000	\$434,947	\$195,940	\$425,000
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	25	25	25	20
Section III: Proposed Services	45	30	40	30	25
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	4.18	5.71	12.68	5.85
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>59.18</u>	<u>70.71</u>	<u>67.68</u>	<u>50.85</u>
Bidder Name:		TRC	VHB	VIEWSHED	Weston & Sampson
Proposed Cost:		\$346,419	\$445,800	\$ 447,820	\$443,700
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	30	25	10	30
Section III: Proposed Services	45	45	25	15	35
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	7.17	5.57	5.55	5.60
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>82.17</u>	<u>55.57</u>	<u>30.55</u>	<u>70.6</u>

Award Justification Statement
RFP# 202409168

I. Summary

The State of Maine is seeking proposals for a climate vulnerability assessment of state assets. This project will include expanding the currently available information on the vulnerability of state assets to climate hazards, developing a framework for understanding and mitigating vulnerabilities, and developing strategies for state agencies to address asset vulnerabilities, in alignment with the State's climate action plan.

II. Evaluation Process

The evaluation team was comprised of a team of policy and technical leads from the Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future and the Department of Transportation. Evaluation team members collectively possess experience in climate risk and resilience, climate mitigation and adaptation, public services, infrastructure, and equity. Evaluation team members completed individual evaluations before proceeding to team consensus evaluations and scoring.

III. Qualifications & Experience

The selected bidder, TRC, has experience with climate vulnerability assessments and government agencies. Additionally, the selected bidder is currently engaged in a climate vulnerability assessment with projections set up in the state of Maine.

IV. Proposed Services

- The selected bidder has a strong technical team and an in-house climate data processing model set up for understanding climate hazards under multiple future scenarios and timelines.
- The selected bidder demonstrated a strong understanding of state agency roles, and proposed agency engagement would be an effective and efficient use of agency staff time for integrating input and prioritizing feasibility of any final recommendations.
- The selected bidder proposed robust deliverables including a roadmap for agencies to understand vulnerable facilities and the timeframe, costs, and metrics for potential solutions and implementation steps.

V. Cost Proposal

The selected bidder proposed a budget of \$346,419.

VI. **Conclusion**

The selected bidder has extensive technical experience and proposed a scope of work that was detailed and highly responsive to this RFP. The selected bidder clearly demonstrated their ability to complete the tasks requested by this proposal.



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Hannah Pingree
Director

12/20/2024

Dr. Pacia Diaz, Project Manager
AARC Consultants, LLC
63 Federal Street #15
Portland, ME 04101

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Pacia:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a horizontal line.

Hannah Pingree

Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Hannah Pingree
Director

Janet T. Mills
Governor

12/20/2024

Ellen Douglas, Project Manager
AECOM Technical Services, Inc
250 Apollo Drive
Chelmsford, MA 0182

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Ellen:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a horizontal line.

Hannah Pingree

Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Hannah Pingree
Director

Janet T. Mills
Governor

12/20/2024

Illana Judah, Associate Principal
Arup US, Inc.
77 Water Street
New York, NY 10005

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Illana:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a horizontal line.

Hannah Pingree

Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Hannah Pingree
Director

12/20/2024

Meghan Morgan
CLEAResult Consulting, Inc.
6504 Bridge Point Parkway, Suite 425
Austin, Texas 78730

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Meghan:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a horizontal line that tapers to the right.

Hannah Pingree

Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Hannah Pingree
Director

Janet T. Mills
Governor

12/20/2024

Tim Hurley, Project Sponsor
Deloitte & Touche, LLP
200 Berkeley St 10th floor
Boston, MA, 02116

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Tim:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a long horizontal stroke.

Hannah Pingree

Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Hannah Pingree
Director

12/20/2024

Lindy Lowe, Director of Climate and Hazard Resilience
Eastern Research Group, Inc. (ERG)
561 Virginia Road, Building 4, Suite 300
Concord, MA 01742

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Lindy:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a long horizontal line that tapers to a point on the right.

Hannah Pingree

Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Hannah Pingree
Director

Janet T. Mills
Governor

12/20/2024

Adeola Olasehinde
ICF Incorporated, L.L.C
1902 Reston Metro Plaza
Reston, VA 20190

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Adeola:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a long horizontal stroke.

Hannah Pingree

Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Hannah Pingree
Director

12/20/2024

Karen Ditz, Commercial Manager
Resilient Analytics
385 Interlocken Crescent, Suite 250
Broomfield, CO 80021

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Karen:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a horizontal line with a small dot above it, representing the initials 'H.P.'.

Hannah Pingree
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Hannah Pingree
Director

Janet T. Mills
Governor

12/20/2024

Matt Nixon
Tetra Tech, Inc
451 Presumpscot Street
Portland, ME 04103

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Matt:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a horizontal line with a small dot above it, representing the initials 'H.P.'.

Hannah Pingree
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Hannah Pingree
Director

Janet T. Mills
Governor

12/20/2024

Julie Pietrzak, Principal, Sustainability & Resilience Practice Leader
Thornton Tomasetti, Inc
120 Broadway
New York, NY 10271

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Julie:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a horizontal line with a small dot above it, representing the initials 'H.P.'.

Hannah Pingree
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Hannah Pingree
Director

12/20/2024

Allison Veillette, Senior Contract Administrator
IEM International, Inc.
801 Slater Road, Suite 200
Morrisville, North Carolina 27560

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Allison:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a horizontal line with a small dot above it, resembling a stylized 'P' or a flourish.

Hannah Pingree
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Hannah Pingree
Director

12/20/2024

Doug Stewart, PWS, Senior Principal
Stantec Consulting Services Inc
30 Park Drive
Topsham, ME 04086

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Doug:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a horizontal line with a small dot above it, representing the initials 'H.P.'.

Hannah Pingree
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Hannah Pingree
Director

12/20/2024

Dr. Rawlings Miller, VP Climate Risk and Resiliency
TRC Environmental Corporation
249 Western Avenue
Augusta, ME 04330

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Rawlings:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P.' followed by a long horizontal flourish.

Hannah Pingree
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Hannah Pingree
Director

12/20/2024

Donny Goris-Kolb, Senior Sustainability Planner - Environmental Planning
VHB/Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc.
260 Arsenal Place #2
Watertown, Massachusetts 02472

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Donny:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P.' followed by a long horizontal flourish.

Hannah Pingree
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Hannah Pingree
Director

Janet T. Mills
Governor

12/20/2024

Judy Colby-George, Principal/Owner
VIEWSHED
121 West Main St
Yarmouth, ME 04096

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Judy:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a horizontal line with a small dot above it, representing the initials 'H.P.'.

Hannah Pingree
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future

Hannah Pingree
Director

Janet T. Mills
Governor

12/20/2024

Joanna Nadeau, AICP
Weston & Sampson Engineers, Inc.
100 International Drive, Suite 152
Portsmouth, NH 03801

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202409168,
Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

Dear Joanna:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future for Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- TRC Environmental Corporation

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of the letters 'H' and 'P' followed by a horizontal line with a small dot above it, representing the initials 'H.P.'.

Hannah Pingree
Director, Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Office Phone: 207-624-7458

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: AARC Consultants
DATE: 11/20/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor’s Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine
Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	20
Section III. Proposed Services	45	15
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	3.27
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>38.27</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: AARC Consultants

DATE: 11/20/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: AARC Consultants

DATE: 11/20/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Experience with 19 climate vulnerability assessments of infrastructure assets and system services. Involved in assessing vulnerabilities of municipal assets, indicates experience with government agencies.
 - Project manager is based in Maine.
 - Project Examples
 - Western Municipal Water District, California: District level experience with all-hazards risk and resilience assessment.
 - Florida Department of Environmental Protection: City level assessment of asset and facilities inventory collection and recommendations for resilience.
 - Railroad Commission of Texas, Critical Infrastructure Weatherization: State level engineering services and recommendations.
 - Most projects include staff from proposed project team and subcontractor.
2. Subcontractors
 - GIS Analyst
 - Experience conducting climate vulnerability assessments, geospatial and flood modeling skills.
 - 15 years of experience.
3. Organizational Chart
 - 7 staff
 - Resilience professional, civil engineer, scientist, building performance, emergency/disaster preparedness.
 - Experience with vulnerability assessments.
4. Litigation
 - None
5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: AARC Consultants

DATE: 11/20/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	15

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall Approach
 - Would benefit from additional details on Bidder’s approach.
 - Includes specific previous work examples and external data sources.
- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Allowance for site-visits to confirm conditions.
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Using IPCC framework.
 - More detail about how climate analysis would incorporate multiple hazards would be helpful.
 - Familiar with critical infrastructure design, will be integrated early on.
- Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Would benefit from more details about how process will generate vulnerability score.
- Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Example of adaptive planning principles with tiered recommendations.
- Other
 - Would benefit from additional details on how state agencies would be engaged throughout the project.
 - Included quality control and quality assurance process through communication, cost control, and data security.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- 12 month project
- Mapping and scenario visualization may benefit from additional time.
- Gantt chart and tasks by project staff are provided.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: AARC Consultants

DATE: 11/20/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

			x		=	Score
99,394.45	,	760,758	x	25 points	=	3.27

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: AECOM

DATE: 11/20/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor’s Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	30
Section III. Proposed Services	45	40
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	5.92
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>75.92</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: AECOM

DATE: 11/20/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: AECOM
DATE: 11/20/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Experience conducting vulnerability assessments for state agencies in MA and NY.
 - i. Led development of the MA state hazard mitigation and climate adaptation plan, strong example of supporting high-level state project.
 - ii. Currently conducting vulnerability assessment for Southern Maine Planning and Development Commission for transportation and planning in Kittery.
 - Offices in Maine, experience with municipalities in Maine.
 - i. This effort would be led by New England staff.
 - ii. Currently conducting vulnerability assessment for Southern Maine Planning and Development Commission for transportation and planning in Kittery.
 - Project Examples
 - New York State Agency Climate Vulnerability Assessments and Climate Adaptation Planning: Completed climate vulnerability assessments for 35 New York State agencies. High relevance to RFP.
 - MBTA Red Line Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment: Relevant engineering and technical support for critical assets including short and long term climate adaptation measures.
 - Portsmouth Naval Shipyard Floodplain and Sea Level Rise: Assessment of sea level rise, potential impacts of future flooding conditions on infrastructure, adaptation options.
 - Overall: Included table of projects with indication of alignment with RFP tasks, and experience project staff and subcontractor have.
2. Subcontractors
 - Aon
 - Climate modeling capabilities.
 - Reinsurance broker for physical climate risk, specialized Climate Risk Advisory team.
3. Organizational Chart
 - 24 people

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: AECOM

DATE: 11/20/2024

- Staff assigned to specific project tasks. 13 staff on technical support including social equity/environmental justice.
- Staff experience with resilience, hazard mitigation, climate adaptation, climate modeling, infrastructure experience.
- Project Manager manages climate resilient infrastructure and climate vulnerability assessments.

4. Litigation

- Multiple pending and settled lawsuits up to \$10M.
- “None of our current claims could reasonably be expected to have a material adverse effect on ATS or its ability to perform under the contract contemplated by the proposal”.

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Provided.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: AECOM
DATE: 11/20/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	40

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall Approach
 - Clear description of tasks, deliverables, and assumptions.
 - Thorough understanding of project needs and goals.
 - Bidder and subcontractor have extensive knowledge and experience of work to be done.
- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Assets receive numerical value to indicate consequence rating, degree of impact. Included clear example of how this would look for two different asset functions.
 - Experienced in developing and cleaning asset inventories.
 - Assumed no field work would be required to identify assets and characteristics.
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Climate hazards reflect existing and requested data.
 - Acute and chronic perils noted as distinct, modeling capabilities for both proposed.
 - Additional outputs proposed to inform Task 3 such as annualized statistics, event-based statistics, financial metrics. Beyond scope but potentially of value to the state.
- Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Analysis relates to existing plans across Maine.
 - 5x5 vulnerability matrix example is directly relevant to requested task.
 - Approach for equity screening includes priority population types and distinct benchmarks, incorporates Maine Won't Wait equity subcommittee definitions.
- Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Focus on high priority and high vulnerability assets for agencies to address with a suite of planning and programmatic options.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: AECOM

DATE: 11/20/2024

- Suggested useful and manageable metrics such as relative cost rankings and timeline.
 - Other
- 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - 12 months
 - Clear outline of key staff responsibilities by task
 - Some tasks are able to occur simultaneously

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: AECOM

DATE: 11/20/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal		Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45		420,000	x	25 points	=	5.92

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Arup

DATE: 11/20/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor’s Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	30
Section III. Proposed Services	45	40
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	5.92
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>75.92</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Arup

DATE: 11/20/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: Arup
DATE: 11/20/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Supported over 150 city climate and resilience plans worldwide, experience with statewide and island nation climate vulnerability and risk assessment.
 - Experience assessing climate and natural hazard impacts and exposure modeling.
 - Authored new guidelines on resilience-based design for infrastructure
 - Project Examples
 - Vulnerability Assessment and Climate Resilience Plan, New York City Health and Hospitals (Arup): Experience developing assessment framework for current and future climate vulnerabilities. Analyzed vulnerabilities from hazards that are similar to Maine, and complexities of hospital system are similar to complexities of Maine state assets.
 - i. 5 members of proposal team were staff on this project.
 - Climate Change Vulnerability and Risk Assessment, Caltrans (Arup): Relevant experience leading update of statewide climate change vulnerability assessment of Caltrans-owned or operated infrastructure.
 - Bath Flood Vulnerability Assessment (GEI): Experience with assessment of flood risk mitigation, and with assessment of assets and adaptation for city’s resilience.
2. Subcontractors
 - Not clear if the prime and subcontractors have worked together previously.
 - “Teaming Partners” listed in qualifications, both are based in Maine and have experience working with Maine municipalities.
 - GEI Consultants: Engineering firm, geotechnical expertise. Skills in flood vulnerability assessment, prioritization of infrastructure adaptation. Supported Maine Department of Marine Resources on Living Shorelines.
 - Siler Climate Consulting: Experience with resilience planning and community engagement.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Arup

DATE: 11/20/2024

3. Organizational Chart

- 19 staff
- Experience across resilience, large scale infrastructure projects, climate impacts, multi-hazard risk analysis, vulnerability assessments, geospatial analysis, engineering, municipal planning
- Inland Flood Model and Local Knowledge has multiple team members.

4. Litigation

- No current or pending claims, litigation or arbitration, which are not adequately covered by the firm's insurance policies.

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: Arup
DATE: 11/20/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	40

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided
 - Overall Approach
 - Reflective that Bidder has relevant skills and understands the context across Maine, takes semi-quantitative approach.
 - Embedded values are clear and aligned: collaborative model, local partners, capacity building, actionable metrics.
 - Outcome about building capacity and internal education in addition collecting asset data and filling gaps reflects the priorities of the RFP for integrating the use of findings in department work.
 - GEI has experience with consequence analysis for dam safety, applicable to analysis of assets.
 - Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Establish methodology before collecting data. Incorporated lesson learned from experience with a different portfolio-wide risk assessment.
 - Bidder recommends steering committee with “representatives from Maine based organizations”, which may be outside this project’s scope of work.
 - Database mutually agreed upon and supplemented by National Structure Inventory.
 - Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Propose combining the present-day and 2030 timeframe into near-term risk category and adding time horizon past 2050, such as 2070 or 2100. Insightful adjustment to prioritize assets for adaptation and align with other models that are being developed in Maine.
 - Key climate hazards are relevant and Maine-based.
 - Equity layer not included in this section.
 - Missing approach for analyzing risk of non-flooding hazards (e.g. fire or heat models) or need clarification about hazard exposure analysis and asset-hazard pairs.
 - Prepared for different data availability.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Arup

DATE: 11/20/2024

- Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Co-creation of metrics with GOPIF. Sample risk metrics are a mix of qualitative and quantitative options (e.g. repair costs and safety).
 - Equity assessment includes data and exposure analysis. Bidder has local knowledge.
 - Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - High impact strategies across physical, policy, organizational, and governance interventions
 - Included tracking metrics and KPIs, and proposed digital dashboard, would benefit from examples.
 - Task 4 approach seems underdeveloped compared to other Tasks.
 - Other
 - Robust structure for meetings and steering committee.
 - Proposed 3 in-person workshops, ability to travel for more or less.
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 11 months
 - Detailed Gantt chart with organizational roles and review time for GOPIF.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Arup

DATE: 11/20/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	÷	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45	÷	420,000	x	25 points	=	5.92

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: CLEAResult Consulting

DATE: 11/22/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	5
Section III. Proposed Services	45	10
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	25
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>40</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: CLEARresult Consulting

DATE: 11/22/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: CLEAResult Consulting

DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	5

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Experience with public sector clients.
 - Experience with Efficiency Maine and Maine specific challenges.
 - Firm is primarily focused on energy efficiency and decarbonization and working with state energy offices.
 - Recently (February 2024) acquired a full service energy and management firm with expertise in climate vulnerability and resilience planning.
- Project Examples
 - Efficiency Maine’s Residential Energy Efficiency Programs: Experience with quasi-state agency. Not directly relevant to RFP but displays Bidder’s experience in Maine.
 - Climate Change Infrastructure Resilience Analysis and Adaptation Strategies for the Tahoe Basin: Experience with assessment of transportation, telecommunications, energy, waste/water infrastructure systems to climate change. Risk-based qualitative ranking framework to prioritize infrastructure vulnerabilities, relevant to the RFP.
 - Planning for Resilience Across NYSERDA’s Programs: Experience evaluated program assets and creating toolkit for program managers to identify and respond to climate challenges

2. Subcontractors

- N/A

3. Organizational Chart

- 5 staff
- Experience working with government clients
- Experience with environmental planning, decarbonization, engineering
- Team’s experience with energy efficiency is clear, their experience with vulnerability assessments is less apparent.

4. Litigation

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: CLEAResult Consulting

DATE: 11/22/2024

- “The Company has been subject to legal proceedings, claims and litigation arising in the ordinary course of business. These matters have not materially impacted client work and the Company does not expect the ultimate costs to resolve these matters to have a material adverse effect on Company’s consolidated financial condition, results of operations or cash flows.”
5. Certificate of Insurances
- Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: CLEAResult Consulting
DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	10

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall Approach
 - Experience managing Efficiency Maine’s Residential Programs is background on state agencies in Maine but is not directly relevant to climate vulnerability of assets.
 - Overall approach is logical but lacks detail on specific activities, data sources, decision points for GOPIF, and potential challenges and limitations.
- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Would benefit from details on approach and tools for how this task will be accomplished.
 - No mention of the asset information sources provided by the RFP. Does not address asset condition and very little detail on how risk tolerance and asset criticality will be determined.
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Would benefit from more detail on approach and tools to develop climate scenarios and assess hazards risk. Lacked suggestion for specific hazards to be evaluated.
 - Technical communication for stakeholders would benefit from more explanation.
- Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Rephrased RFP content without details and methods to explain Bidder’s approach.
- Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Included cost-benefit analysis on adaptation measures, prioritized resilience and risk reduction strategies, and monitoring framework for metrics, but lacked details on how they would accomplish this task.
- Other

2. Implementation – Work Plan

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: CLEAResult Consulting

DATE: 11/22/2024

- 12 months
- 11 weeks allotted for primary and secondary hazards, but this is not reflected in the proposed services.
- Instead of ad-hoc questions from agencies, would benefit from structured engagement plan.
- Scale of team does not reflect scale of workload. Three staff assigned majority of the work, all of whom are identified as decarbonization specialists, not vulnerability assessment specialists.
- Intermediate and final deliverables are not clearly defined.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: CLEARresult Consulting

DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45	,	99,394.45	x	25 points	=	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Deloitte

DATE: 11/22/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	20
Section III. Proposed Services	45	15
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	7.70
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>42.70</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Deloitte

DATE: 11/22/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: Deloitte
DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Conducted critical infrastructure risk assessments at all levels of government and across sectors.
 - Experience in State of Maine.
 - Experience included data and research on climate change forecasts.
 - Cite skills across multiple FEMA projects. Would prefer more emphasis on experience with state governments.
 - Project Examples
 - Department of Navy: Asset inventory experience, mission criticality/utilization of assets, inventory guide, climate impact scenario development, experience with strategic guidance for government. Federal, larger in scope than this RFP.
 - US Coast Guard: Enterprise risk management framework, consistent guidance, developed risk appetite statements and risk tolerance levels, risk response strategies. Federal, larger in scope than this RFP.
 - Broward Metropolitan Planning Organization: Experience with digital platform managing data and modeling resiliency efforts.
 - Would prefer to see state project or climate vulnerability assessments examples. Cited projects are adjacent to but unsatisfactorily aligned with RFP.
 - Cited clients seem more technically savvy than many of our state agencies. Education will be key component of this State of Maine project.
2. Subcontractors
 - N/A
3. Organizational Chart
 - 7 staff, 5 project advisors
 - Experience with risk management, hazard mitigation, disaster resilience, geospatial technology.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Deloitte

DATE: 11/22/2024

- Senior team has less stated experience with climate and vulnerability, though very experienced in complex government environments.
 - Project manager and core team members have FEMA and other federal hazard mitigation backgrounds. Project advisors have more relevant expertise, still heavy on hazard mitigation. Only one advisor has stated extensive experience in climate adaptation.
4. Litigation
- “Within the past five (5) years, there has been no litigation brought by a state, local, or federal governmental client against Deloitte & Touche related to a Deloitte & Touche services engagement.”
5. Certificate of Insurances
- Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: Deloitte
DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	15

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided
 - Overall Approach
 - Approach includes viewing asset inventory and risk register as long-term products.
 - Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Taxonomy to match inventory needs for format, design, organization.
 - Process will be prepared to manage inconsistent data format and incorporating GIS.
 - Will choose user-friendly format, easy to navigate for range of stakeholders and expert levels.
 - Conduct reporting section includes many “as needed” items. The flexibility is appreciated but hard to assess how that would factor into cost/time.
 - Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Lacked transparency and did not explain how hazards would be selected. Would have been a relevant place to solicit input from the state or include details from hazard mitigation plan.
 - Included a Climate Risk Profiler Tool and Scenario Register deliverable that align with needs but would benefit from details in method.
 - Relying heavily on existing reports and working with state agencies to identify hazards.
 - Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Would benefit from details on tools and approach to conducting analysis.
 - Would benefit from inclusion of examples of relevant experience.
 - Task 3 would benefit from greater transparency into proposed processes for assessing vulnerability. The approach to equity integration is also vague.
 - Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Deloitte

DATE: 11/22/2024

- Drawing from construction and infrastructure knowledge will use sustainable design frameworks. Notes LEED and Envision standards but does not reflect how this would be incorporated into recommendations.
 - Includes “quick wins” for mitigation.
 - Notes robust capital planning model but does not explain.
 - Would benefit from more detail in approach for the State of Maine.
 - Call out box examples seem relevant but are not integrated into proposed services or background for how Deloitte will accomplish this specific scope of work.
 - Other
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 5 months / 19 weeks - timeline feels unrealistically short for this scope of work.
 - All work would be performed virtually.
 - Vague timeline description of meetings with GOPIF and state agencies. Does not reflect timing needed for agency survey proposed in task 1.
 - Deliverables and staff responsibilities provided clearly.
 - Would seek to negotiate certain provisions of the state service contract in riders B and C.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Deloitte

DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394,45	,	322,701	x	25 points	=	7.70

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: ERG

DATE: 11/22/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	30
Section III. Proposed Services	45	40
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	10.36
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>80.36</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: ERG

DATE: 11/22/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: ERG
DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Experience with federal, state, and local governments
 - Expertise in climate mitigation and adaptation models, approaches at multiple scales
 - Experience with climate hazard analysis (over 30 projects)
 - Designed Vermont’s Municipal Vulnerability Indicators Tool to help municipalities determine climate vulnerabilities
 - Staff skills included climate scientists, adaptation and resilience experts, communications
 - Project Examples
 - Massachusetts Emergency Management Agency: Developed ResilientMass Plan, identified climate and hazard data, conducted risk assessment, hazard analysis, vulnerability assessment across health, infrastructure, resources, governance, and economy, conducted survey and held workshops. Highly relevant for this project. Worked with state agencies to develop hazard mitigation and climate adaptation actions to address risks specific to MA. Experience with best available climate science and projections, including Northeast specific data.
 - State of Maine, GOPIF Climate Change Impact Analysis: Conducted economic analysis and developed adaptation strategies based on priority climate vulnerabilities in Maine. Developed products to help the State communicate results. Experience with climate hazards in Maine.
 - i. Only one staff from this past GOPIF project is carried over onto the proposed project team.
 - Installation Climate Resilience Plan for Department of Defense: Conducted resilience assessments for two buildings and 11 climate hazards. Experience with consequences for operation disruptions and with asset-level vulnerability assessment to climate hazards. Project in progress, not yet completed.
2. Subcontractors
 - N/A
3. Organizational Chart

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: ERG

DATE: 11/22/2024

- 9 staff
 - Experience in climate adaptation, climate resilience and vulnerability assessments, climate hazard and projections, metrics, flood resilience, infrastructure, economic modeling.
 - Project team members have 5-10 years of experience, project manager has been with ERG for 1 year.
 - Most of project team participated in MA and VT projects, bringing directly relevant experience.
 - None of the project team management leads are based in New England. Technical advisor in Maine
 - Would benefit from clarity of responsibilities across the organizational chart.
4. Litigation
- None
5. Certificate of Insurances
- Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: ERG
DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	40

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided
 - Overall Approach
 - Clear expectations, monthly project team virtual check-ins.
 - Scope of work is consistent with low-cost approach – desktop level evaluations, fully virtual process, and early to mid-career project team.
 - Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Plan for managing workshop invitations, tracking survey distribution, state agency engagement. More than necessary - GOPIF will manage.
 - Approach for assessing existing data includes QAQC, and Bidder would recommend granularity of assessment based on data and agency priorities.
 - Deliverables include staff agency contact list, not necessary - GOPIF will provide this.
 - Property inventory in excel format which is helpful to agencies.
 - Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Using tier 1 natural hazards from SHMP, includes draft list of tier 2 and STS impacts.
 - Time horizons recommended are 2040-2070 and 2070-2100. Recommends very high emissions and intermediate emissions scenarios.
 - Task 2 approach relies on existing data and models, minimal new modeling proposed. Historical data and literature review would fill potential gap in projections for hazards.
 - Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Develop relative vulnerability score, demonstrated clear understanding of asset exposure and consequences to public service interruptions.
 - Example of a resilience assessment of EPA laboratories with relevant hazards, exposure, and sensitivity.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: ERG

DATE: 11/22/2024

- State agency survey example from MA directly relevant for Maine state agencies. Agency survey plan includes training and office hours to help complete survey, may be out of scope.
- Equity questions in survey are strong approach. Step 3 equity implications are primarily geospatial, may miss impacts that are not geospatial in nature, or survey questions may mitigate this risk.
- Clear and relevant matrix example for prioritizing key vulnerabilities. Concern that vulnerability score relies on weighted averages which could be questioned.
- Provided some sample methods for evaluating exposure but sea level rise approach would need refinement given high variations in flooding.
- Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Recommend development of evaluation criteria before projects are identified. Evaluation criteria and project alternatives include range of cost estimates and co-benefits.
 - Sample of adaptation strategy evaluation including alignment with mission, consistency with other plans, feasibility, equity, timeframe.
 - Strategies reflect short, medium, long actions requested in RFP and incorporate strategies from SHMP to continue alignment for state agency actions.
 - Workshop 4 reflects collaboration across all state agencies involved and whole of government approach.
 - Solid attention to detail and process in Task 4.
- Other

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- 11 months
- Realistic distribution of tasks, multiple tasks occurring simultaneously
- Different leads for each task, not clear if project management task lead is the overall lead throughout the project.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: ERG

DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45	,	239,912.00	x	25 points	=	10.36

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: ICF

DATE: 11/22/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor’s Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	25
Section III. Proposed Services	45	30
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	11.07
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>66.07</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: ICF

DATE: 11/22/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: ICF
DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Expertise in infrastructure vulnerability assessments, and conducting climate vulnerability assessments for state and local governments
 - i. E.g., City of Philadelphia, Virginia DOT, State of Pennsylvania, US Fish and Wildlife Service
 - Experience providing adaptation strategies and plans
 - ClimateSight – In house climate analytical tool
 - Expertise in climate science, local flood risk analysis from GMRI, climate vulnerability assessment experience across Maine
 - Project Examples
 - Climate Change Vulnerability Study for Maine Energy Utility (ICF): Experience with climate change vulnerability of assets, consequences and impact analysis. Current project, not completed.
 - Military Installation Resilience Review, MWCOG (ICF): Experience with assessment of resilience threats to installation ability to perform mission, identifying risk mitigation actions, collaboration across stakeholders. Demonstrates skill with cascading impacts and interdependencies between institutions and communities – important for assessing ME service impairment impacts. Also demonstrates experience with co-development of methodologies.
 - Town of Tremont Climate Vulnerability Assessment (GMRI): Experience with town level assessment leveraging quantitative data and local knowledge of community identifying climate impacts.
2. Subcontractors
 - Gulf of Maine Research Institute (GMRI)
 - Experience with climate resilience and adaptation, based in Maine.
3. Organizational Chart
 - 16 staff
 - Project manager currently working on State of Hawaii’s vulnerability assessment.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: ICF

DATE: 11/22/2024

- Would benefit from seeing project team members' participation on the example projects.
 - Experience across climate risk and climate adaptations, vulnerability assessments, working with government stakeholders, climate science, data analysis, engineering
 - Two staff from GMRI. Roles include engagement with state agencies, and Coastal Flood Risk Expert.
4. Litigation
 - None
 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: ICF

DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall Approach
 - Regular check-ins conducted remotely.
 - Establish advisory committee of key stakeholders Scope of proposed committee seems larger than envisioned by the RFP.
 - Proposed GMRI to help establish and advise the advisory committee. GOPIF will be responsible for this effort.
- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Will develop an inventory for up to 10 critical and regionally significant asset types – unclear how these asset types get used throughout the remainder of the assessment.
 - Stakeholder engagement subtask appears to assume external stakeholder interviews, unclear who the audience is. Stakeholder engagement beyond state agency collaboration is outside of the scope of this RFP.
 - Developing risk tolerance framework with state agencies as part of asset inventory.
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Build on available data and couple with ClimateSight, in-house analytics tool (customized projections and enhanced computing).
 - Included example variables for climate hazard projections
 - Probabilistic projections from downscaled global climate models
 - Inland flooding model proposed will use “effective FEMA Flood Insurance Rate Maps” - these are out of date.
 - Deliverables and format are clear and usable for state agencies - slidedeck with variables, methods, tabular and spatial data files
- Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - IPCC framework.
 - Practical considerations for interdependency with critical infrastructure and impacts on overall system.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: ICF

DATE: 11/22/2024

- ICF listed to conduct stakeholder interviews to inform implications for use of asset, climate change impacts, vulnerabilities and resilience of system. Would benefit from clarifying if “government stakeholders” means state agencies.
 - Each asset would have scores for: exposure, sensitivity, adaptive capacity, impact and consequence, equity, vulnerability. Would benefit from clarification of scoring individual assets versus asset category.
 - Would benefit from some kind of aggregation of various requested scores to produce overall vulnerability score that is digestible for state agencies.
 - Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Literature review and internal adaptation experts will be consulted. Would benefit from details about how the results of this information would be incorporated into state agency strategies.
 - Facilitated discussions with advisory committee. Unclear who is in this advisory committee – if external beyond state agencies, then out of scope.
 - Strategies will include time horizon, category, cost consideration, implementing agency, tracking metrics.
 - Relies heavily on GOPIF and state agencies to develop recommendations.
 - Deliverable is limited to 40 adaptation measures and 15 prioritized strategies.
 - Other
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 11 months
 - Tasks occurring simultaneously
 - Staff leads and deliverables included

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: ICF

DATE: 11/22/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal		Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45		224,546	x	25 points	=	11.07

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: IEM

DATE: 11/25/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor’s Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	20
Section III. Proposed Services	45	10
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	10.92
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>40.92</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: IEM

DATE: 11/25/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: IEM
DATE: 11/25/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Adjacent but not directly relevant qualifications in disaster mitigation, preparedness, and recovery. Experience with federal, state, and local agency clients, emphasis on nature-based solutions for BRIC and FEMA.
 - Planning team integrates climate change and future conditions into local, state, and regional hazard mitigation plans.
 - Serving Maine since 2008 through projects with MEMA, Waldo County, Portland and Northern regional airports.
- Project Examples
 - New York State and New York City Emergency Management: Experience with performing vulnerability assessments hazards on state assets, experience with integrating resilience planning, statewide building codes, state risk maps. Conducted Hazus loss estimation modeling to assess potential loss from hazards on city.
 - Chittenden Multi-Jurisdictional All Hazards Plan: Experience with vulnerability assessment, experience integrating County’s environmental concerns with protection of assets and allowing for growth.
 - Delaware State Hazard Mitigation Plan: Experience with researching future conditions related to climate change and potential vulnerability to assets.
 - All projects are Hazard Mitigation Plan updates, two of which include vulnerability assessments, but the examples were unclear about use of climate projections and would have benefitted from further discussion of climate change projections, modeling, and associated skills.

2. Subcontractors

- None

3. Organizational Chart

- 14 staff
 - Project manager is former state hazard mitigation officer for Kansas

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: IEM

DATE: 11/25/2024

- Experience with hazard mitigation, climate resilience, emergency management, climate adaptation, engineering, GIS
 - Separated into planning team, geospatial team, support team (graphics/editing)
 - Subject matter expert is Director of Mitigation and Resilience
 - Organizational chart would benefit from indication of which staff would support which tasks
 - Project manager and day to day operations lead both have experience in hazard mitigation planning but not seeing strong experience in climate vulnerability assessments
4. Litigation
- Provided
 - 5 cases pending for wage disputes and breach of contract
5. Certificate of Insurances
- Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: IEM
DATE: 11/25/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	10

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided
 - Overall Approach
 - Mentions IEM Disaster Recovery Center of Excellence but unclear connection of skills to this project.
 - Hazus software would be used for assessing hazards and vulnerability.
 - Deliverables included SharePoint, a story map, and an at-glance dashboard.
 - Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - This section would benefit from emphasizing IEM’s approach specific to the RFP.
 - Multiple items were outside of the scope of the RFP such as analyzing transportation networks and conducting ongoing collaboration with universities.
 - Included comprehensive review of facility types and state agencies’ mission goals but unclear how this would be accomplished.
 - Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Has applied “Integrated Environmental approach” to other projects but lacks project examples. Would benefit from more specific details on approach for Maine.
 - Proposed services touts Bidder’s experience frequently but omits critical detail about execution and includes tangential or irrelevant information. For example, Task 2 does not discuss specifically how scenarios will be developed (as required by RFP) but says that it will “provide information on greenhouse emissions to raise awareness” (out of scope).
 - Proposed stakeholder engagement appeared to be outside of scope and lacked detail.
 - Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: IEM

DATE: 11/25/2024

- Insufficient information about the approach the Bidder will take to accomplish this task.
 - Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Insufficient information about the approach the Bidder will take to accomplish this task.
 - i. Bidder included information about securing resources to support mitigation and adaptation initiatives, but this was beyond the scope of work and not paired with details about how to address the requested outcomes.
 - Other
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 12 months
 - The timeline does not specifically match the proposed services. It is not clear how the Bidder will complete the tasks in the time allotted in the workplan.
 - No meeting cadence proposed.
 - No discussion of whether this would be an in-state or virtual process.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: IEM

DATE: 11/25/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal		Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45	,	227,565	x	25 points	=	10.92

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/25/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	25
Section III. Proposed Services	45	30
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	4.18
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>59.18</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/25/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/25/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Experience in climate science, data analytics, engineering
 - Rail analysis methodology reflects combination of climate science and engineering principles to assess future climate impacts
 - Experience with federal and municipal projects
 - Project Examples
 - Boulder County Climate Impact, Equity and Localization Modeling: Assessed vulnerability across publicly owned assets, developed climate hazard mitigation and adaptation strategies, analyzed cost impacts, climate scenario projections, neighborhood level vulnerability scores
 - City of DeBary Vulnerability Assessment: Developed asset inventory of publicly owned assets, conducted flood exposure analysis
 - Climate Effects on US Infrastructure: Assessed economics of adaptation, multiple scenarios, experience with climate change projections and large quantity of assets, geographic scope and asset type very different than RFP
2. Subcontractors
 - Stanley Consultants
 - Engineering
 - Technical advisors
 - Included specialties not relevant to scope such as: roads, bridges, culverts, power generation transmission
3. Organizational Chart
 - 16 Staff
 - Distinct project leads per task
 - Staff on engineering technical advisory team are assigned specific topics that are not relevant to scope
 - Project management, scheduling, QAQC, climate vulnerabilities & resilience, engineering technical advisory

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/25/2024

- Experience with state-wide climate vulnerability analysis, adaptation strategies, adaptive capacity indices, climate impact scenarios, climate resilience, modeling
4. Litigation
 - “Resilient Analytics is not named in any current litigation, has not been named in any previous litigation and has no history of closed cases.”
 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/25/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall Approach
 - Discovery phase with emphasis on gaining clarity.
 - On-site kickoff meeting to establish collaboration.
- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Build dataset, identify any missing/incomplete items and adjust method as needed.
 - Data separated into two categories: assets owned or leased by state and assets not under state ownership but with potential for cascading impacts. Appreciate the distinction but concerned about the level of effort dedicated to assets not under state ownership which are a secondary focus of this RFP.
 - Compile dataset that encompasses social data for equity considerations.
 - Unclear what the format for deliverables will be.
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Use library of climate datasets to derive hazard variable calculations.
 - Includes steps for data selection and refinement, missing details on climate scenarios and time-horizons
 - More emphasis should be placed on the approach for state-owned assets with details on how outcomes will be met.
- Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Vulnerability assessment will be quantitative where possible, augmented by qualitative assessments
 - Exposure, sensitivity, and adaptive capacity scores would be combined to create asset-level, agency-level, and state-level vulnerability scoring metrics. Would benefit from explanation or example of how this is developed.
 - Incorporate equity assessment as a layer and effectively connect this to adaptation strategies in task 4.
- Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/25/2024

- Unclear what the role for Stanley Consultants will be in supporting engineered adaptation strategies.
 - Tracking progress is included as important but relies heavily on state agency input. Would benefit from recommended metrics tracking approaches.
 - Underdeveloped section, insufficient to meet outcomes requested in RFP.
 - Other
 - Appreciate in-person meetings but cost will likely be high due to travel from Colorado.
 - Referenced experience with creating siting and design tools but did not include examples.
 - Generally, moderately developed proposal, mostly sound approach but missing some key details.
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 12 months
 - Clear assignment of responsibilities
 - 4 stakeholder review sessions appropriately spaced
 - On-site meetings at the end of each task, monthly project team meetings
 - Would benefit from specific interim and final deliverables

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/25/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99394.45	,	595,000	x	25 points	=	4.18

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Stantec

DATE: 11/25/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor’s Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	25
Section III. Proposed Services	45	40
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	5.71
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>70.71</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Stantec

DATE: 11/25/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: Stantec
DATE: 11/25/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Skills in vulnerability assessment and planning, engineering, risk analysis, asset inventory, stakeholder engagement.
 - Located in Topsham, Maine with staff based in Maine. Experience with local and state vulnerability assessments in New England.
 - Experienced project team with 15+ years of experience for each of the key staff.
 - Experience tended to focus on coastal flood hazard assessment and vulnerability across New England. Would benefit from examples of inland flooding experience.
 - Project Examples
 - Connecticut DOT Vulnerability Assessment and Resilience Improvement Plan: Selected for project on supporting state agency to identify climate vulnerabilities and prioritize solutions.
 - MA State Parkways Climate Vulnerability Assessment: Assessed physical and economic impacts of current and future flooding, vulnerability scores for parkway segments and stakeholder engagement.
 - Eastern Michigan University Flood Responses and Hazard Mitigation Plan: Vulnerability assessment of campus assets, infrastructure, and populations, mitigation action strategy with options for reducing risk and increasing resilience.
 - Additional examples included:
 - i. Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan
 - ii. FEMA Risk Map Production and Technical Services
 - Examples have relevance to the RFP
 - Would like to know which of the project team members contributed to the project examples listed.
2. Subcontractors
 - Gulf of Maine Research Institute

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Stantec

DATE: 11/25/2024

- Advisory role with expertise on climate services, regional ecosystem, and Maine climate impacts
- Noted coastal flooding and sea level projection experience – overemphasized in relation to requested scope of work.

3. Organizational Chart

- 18 staff
- Skills in resiliency planning, natural hazards, vulnerability assessments, hazard mitigation, community engagement
- Staff listed for each RFP task
- Project manager has participated in at least 4 Maine projects but not climate vulnerability assessment

4. Litigation

- “There are no unsatisfied judgments or arbitration awards outstanding against Stantec. Stantec does have some legal proceedings, lawsuits, or claims pending. These are a normal part of professional services industries. All have been reported to Stantec’s insurers who are in the process of adjusting/managing them. None will have a material effect on the financial position of the company or its ability to undertake this assignment.”

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: Stantec
DATE: 11/25/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	40

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall Approach
 - Project tracking spreadsheet, communications plan, project website for data sharing.
 - Establish roles and communication early on.
 - Weekly meetings to start, then shift to biweekly meetings. Kickoff in person, all other meetings virtual.
- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Approach includes asset definition, data review, and agency data interviews.
 - 1.2 and 1.3 reflect outreach to agencies and address gaps. Included training state agencies on the proposed Survey123 tool, not a realistic use of time for state agency staff.
 - Social vulnerability index embedded in Task 1 to help inform Task 3.
 - Asset archetype development is useful but would need to be pared down to fewer, broader categories.
 - Sample asset table and evaluation criteria are relevant.
 - Clear list of deliverables with some meetings in-person and some virtual. Task 0 indicated that most meetings would take place virtually, clarification needed for Task 1
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Identify hazards and data gaps, using information from State Hazard Mitigation Plan as a starting point.
 - Select climate scenario together - Stantec preference is SSP5-8.5, STS Subcommittee uses 5th ICC report.
 - 5 point rating scale for sample asset archetypes.
 - Process suggestions for likelihood scoring includes example with occurrence, qualitative descriptor recurrence vs. single event
 - Bidder recommends 2050 and 2080 time horizons. Time horizon noted to coincide with end of asset life or 30 year climate period.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Stantec

DATE: 11/25/2024

- Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Bidder has specialized tool for quantitative vulnerability assessment scoring. Uses ArcGIS, Python, SQL to automate information and provide spatial results. Relevant example of tool use included.
 - Proposing use of adaptive deficit instead of capacity for consistency in formula.
 - Suggestion for initial assessment, then more detailed consequence and impact assessment for medium/high vulnerability assets.
 - Risk rating matrix and sample risk timing table were useful graphics.
 - Overall high level of details and examples to reflect how the Bidder would accomplish the task.
 - Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - For estimating relative costs for state agencies, includes considering costs of strategies through using similar project examples.
 - Whole of government strategies developed using FEMA community lifeline and asset archetypes.
 - Individual strategies include timeframe, costs, potential funding source, co-benefits with whole of government actions.
 - Outcome metrics include top-tier and sub-tier indicators.
 - Deliverables include single spreadsheet with hazard mitigation and adaptation strategies, which is a helpful and applicable tool for state agency use.
 - Other
 - Overall, very detailed, quantitative approach that accommodates a large number of assets and asset types. Some concern that Maine’s asset data may not be sufficiently complete and detailed to work within Bidder’s assessment system
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 12 months
 - Data collection takes up to 16 weeks, high but likely realistic. Task 2 starting in parallel.
 - GMRI listed on tasks 1-3 but not clear in proposed services what their specific role would be.
 - Gantt chart is detailed with tasks, deliverables, and meetings.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Stantec

DATE: 11/25/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45	,	434,947.00	x	25 points	=	5.71

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Tetra Tech

DATE: 11/26/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor’s Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	25
Section III. Proposed Services	45	30
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	12.68
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>67.68</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Tetra Tech

DATE: 11/26/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: Tetra Tech
DATE: 11/26/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Leading with Science approach
 - Engineers, scientists, planners, policy analysts, subject matter experts for vulnerability analysis
 - Experience across state and local government vulnerability assessments
 - Additional examples included that reflect hazard mitigation plans and vulnerability assessments
 - Project manager and deputy project manager have experience in offshore wind and hazard mitigation, less direct experience with climate vulnerability assessments
 - Project Examples
 - California State University Chancellor’s Office Resiliency Framework: Experience in system wide resiliency, analyzed hazards to specific infrastructure types across the system, identified financial and operational risk, mitigation strategies
 - MBTA Comprehensive Emergency Management Planning: Risk assessment in face of climate change to ensure resilience and reliability of services, prioritization scoring for decision making process, custom quantitative model
 - Palm Beach County Climate Risk Assessment and Action Plan: Prioritization framework to evaluate and rank adaptation and mitigation strategies, analysis using Hazus, GIS, HEC-RAS, SLAMM, outreach plans
 - Would benefit from knowing which project team members worked on which previous project examples.
2. Subcontractors
 - None
3. Organizational Chart
 - 12 staff

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Tetra Tech

DATE: 11/26/2024

- Staff listed by task
 - Energy resilience, hazard mitigation specialist, GIS support
 - Vulnerability assessment SMEs
 - Financial management
 - Additional skills include facility life cycle assessment, floodplain management, energy modeling
4. Litigation
- “For at least the past five (5) years: (1) Proponent has not had any regulator or court impose any fines, penalties, disciplinary actions or measures on the Proponent; (2) there has not been and is not any ongoing or outstanding litigation relating to conflict of interest resulting from any action or lack thereof by the Proponent or any of its senior management team and Board of Directors from any jurisdiction in which the Proponent does business; and (3) there have not been any findings of non-compliance by a regulator, internal or external auditor, a court or ongoing litigation in any jurisdiction and at any level against the Proponent.”
5. Certificate of Insurances
- Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: Tetra Tech
DATE: 11/26/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Classification of categories may include critical infrastructure, emergency facilities, transportation, cultural resources, etc.
 - Collect and process data, establish file sharing and tracking early on.
 - Included request for “as-built drawing for key assets within the scope”, would need clarification about the purpose of this step in data collection.
 - Included step to “coordinate with municipalities to obtain CPRG information to support analysis”, would need clarification about the purpose of this step. Focus of RFP is state agency coordination and data.
 - Portfolio database for baseline inventory, includes data gap analysis.
 - Evaluation of categories through workshop with GOPIF and state agencies.
 - Anticipate numerous meetings with GOPIF and state agencies to assess asset criticality, exposure, and risk-tolerance. Unclear how many meetings would be requested of agency staff.
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Analyzing up to 5 hazards, up to 4 climate scenarios, with considerations for cascading impacts.
 - i. RFP requested continuation of hazards consistent with the State Hazard Mitigation Plan which includes 9 tier 1 hazards.
 - ii. Four climate scenarios include present day, 2030, 2050, 2100
 - iii. Where spatial or modeling data is not available, hazard exposure indicators will be discussed.
 - Spatial hazards would be presented in ArcGIS.
 - Meeting minutes saved to Microsoft Teams for review, one round of comments, then final version uploaded.
- Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Tetra Tech

DATE: 11/26/2024

- Vulnerability formula developed by adjusting weights and benchmark values.
 - Desktop analysis, composite exposure score through GIS. Using all available data and providing analysis. No additional modeling included.
 - Survey of stakeholders to assess adaptive capacity of assets. Would benefit from additional detail about stakeholder engagement and clarifying if stakeholders reflect state agency staff or any other entities.
 - Equity implications for public services not mentioned.
 - Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Insufficient information to indicate how Bidder would accomplish outcomes.
 - Deliverable includes consolidating work from previous tasks into Vulnerability Assessment report.
 - Bidder indicates engagement with GOPIF and state agencies but does not explain approach beyond a two-hour report review session.
 - Other
 - Proposal is only moderately responsive to the RFP.
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 12 months
 - QAQC process integrated
 - Proposed to complete draft vulnerability assessment report by September for contingency planning if earlier tasks require more time.
 - No tasks are marked for May, June, and July.
 - Omits key interim and final deliverables, roles and responsibilities.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Tetra Tech

DATE: 11/26/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45	,	195,940.00	x	25 points	=	12.68

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Thorton Tomasetti

DATE: 11/26/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	20
Section III. Proposed Services	45	25
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	5.85
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>50.85</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Thorton Tomasetti

DATE: 11/26/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Thorton Tomasetti

DATE: 11/26/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	20

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Skills in climate vulnerability assessments, life-cycle resilience, effective communication.
 - Experience with multi-hazard area-wide master plans,
 - Experience with local, state, federal government.
 - Bidder demonstrates examples with specific sites of climate vulnerability, but not hundreds or thousands of sites in a portfolio.
 - Include a project advisory team with Maine knowledge and expertise.
- Project Examples
 - Roux Institute: Engineering, sustainability, and resilience consulting for Institute’s Sustainability Charter, climate risk and resilience assessment with current and future natural hazards.
 - McKinley Properties Climate Vulnerability Assessment: Evaluating properties for climate hazards and ensure operational continuity, recently kicked off.
 - Myrtle, Property Flood Risk and Resilience Assessment South Portland: Single property flood risk assessment for current and future risk, objective to exceed code requirements with resilient design criteria.
 - Example projects have moderate relevance to the hazards, but do not demonstrate an approach that would manage a large and varied asset portfolio like the State of Maine’s.

2. Subcontractors

- Flycatcher
 - Land-use consulting, based in Maine, GIS skills, nature-based solutions.
 - Projects largely related to environmental permitting, which is not directly relevant to the RFP.
- Forerunner
 - Floodplain management software

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Thorton Tomasetti

DATE: 11/26/2024

- Unclear why this tool is necessary for the scope of services.
 - Roux Institute
 - Advisory services for data visualization.
 - Not frequently referenced in scope of services.
 - GMRI
 - Advisory services with Coastal Dynamics Lab.
 - Not frequently referenced in scope of services.
- 3. Organizational Chart
 - 28 staff
 - 3 key personnel, not based in Maine, but advisory team is.
 - Climate resilience team with climate resilience leads, regional scale assessment, benefit-cost analysis, climate analysis, risk mitigation, climate equity, and transportation.
 - Data platform listed on chart without a staff member identified. Who owns or is responsible for the platform?
 - Would benefit from description of how subject matter experts and project managers support each of the four RFP tasks.
- 4. Litigation
 - "From time to time our firm has been brought into lawsuits involving projects on which we have performed services. Most of these cases involve personal injury / site safety issues, which are not our responsibility. Accordingly, we have often had the cases dismissed as against our firm by filing an affidavit of non-involvement or by speaking with the plaintiff's attorney. In other instances, we decided to contribute towards settlement to avoid litigation costs, expending the time of our key staff, or the risk of an adverse court decision."
- 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Thorton Tomasetti

DATE: 11/26/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall Approach
 - Would benefit from improved clarity across all tasks and specific approach.
 - Multiple items outside of scope of work such as external management and maintenance of dashboard on the State’s behalf.
 - Includes understanding of co-benefits from this project intersecting with work from other agencies and organizations.
 - Emphasized specialized team for transportation and municipal waste and water which are not an emphasis for this RFP.
 - Biweekly project calls.
- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Incorporating approach for aligning hazards with State asset profile.
 - Proposes a very detailed asset inventory – concerned that this might not be feasible with existing agency information and within state’s project budget.
 - References useful life considerations and integration of climate data projections with the anticipated lifespan of assets but would benefit from explanation of how this matches the task and deliverables requested in RFP.
 - Includes agency engagement for data collection. Standardized data collection templates and support for data reformatting as needed.
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - This phase will include “data collection on local community characteristics, businesses, property, assets, infrastructure, and natural resources”, part of which is out of scope.
 - Identified list of key data sources and included hazards relevant to Maine.
 - Forerunner could be used in this task to develop high resolution mapping and flood risk for Maine.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Thorton Tomasetti

DATE: 11/26/2024

- Proposal overemphasized the development of communication materials instead of focusing on assessment.
 - Includes agency review to validate findings and identify discrepancies. Unclear what technical support to agencies “as needed” would encompass.
 - Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Phase 1: Screening framework generalized to identify priorities. Equity implications for service interruptions is included as a sub-analysis but would benefit from details for how the Bidder would conduct the analysis and accomplish this task. Sensitivity analysis conducted using criteria from American Society of Civil Engineers.
 - Phase 2: Vulnerability of specific asset typologies and hazards per agency. Unclear what tool is used for multi-hazard analysis.
 - Agency engagement matches the phases of analysis.
 - Resilience categories for “low risk”, “investigation needed”, “investigation of resilience viability” are used to indicate where retrofits are needed.
 - Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Undeveloped section. Would benefit from details about state agency engagement, and specific approach to and metrics for developing relevant mitigation and adaptation strategies.
 - Other
 - Graphics throughout the proposal were not always relevant to the task or proposed service.
 - Generally, proposal seems at times confused on whether this is a broad assessment of hundreds of facilities, or a detailed asset level engineering assessment, it is doubtful that both are possible within the state’s project budget.
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 12 months
 - Gantt chart includes subcontractors, but the role and responsibilities of subcontractors are not mentioned throughout the scope of services.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Thorton Tomasetti

DATE: 11/26/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal		Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45		425,000.00	x	25 points	=	5.85

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: TRC
DATE: 11/26/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor’s Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine
Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	30
Section III. Proposed Services	45	45
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	7.17
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>82.17</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: TRC

DATE: 11/26/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: TRC
DATE: 11/26/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Provided environmental and construction services to industry and government clients.
 - Conducted climate vulnerability assessments, holds technical knowledge of climate hazards, impacts, mitigation strategies.
 - 3 offices in Maine, 200 employees in Maine.
 - Strong project examples, principal-in-charge renowned in the field.
 - Current and previous work for Maine state agencies including GEO, BGS, Maine CDC, and MEMA.
 - Project Examples
 - MA Executive Office of Labor and Workforce Development : Evaluated climate-related physical and operational risks and developed strategies to ensure continuity of services, identified facilities potentially at risk under recent and future conditions, developed roadmap and implementation tracker, highly relevant to RFP.
 - Maine Utility: Project currently in progress and will give Bidder strong sense of climate hazards and projections in Maine, developing a climate change protection plan and climate vulnerability assessment of climate impacts on utility’s assets and operations.
 - Maine Governor’s Energy Office and Maine Emergency Management Agency: Provided subject matter expertise and project management for state’s Energy Emergency Response Plan, calculated hazards and vulnerabilities, and responses actions and procedures.
2. Subcontractors
 - None
3. Organizational Chart
 - 12 key staff, 8 SMEs
 - Principal-in-charge has over 28 years of experience in relevant topics, technical lead for climate impact scenarios, will participate in all project team meetings.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: TRC

DATE: 11/26/2024

- Climate Vulnerability Assessment and Climate Hazard Mitigation Technical Lead has over 18 years experience and worked on MA Executive Office project example.
- Same team supporting Maine utility climate hazard selection will work on this project.
- Roles include project manager, emergency management services advisors, inventory support, climate hazard assessment support.
- SME topics: Emergency response planning, public safety, facility responses, stormwater management, landscape architecture, utility resilience, EJ, property assessment

4. Litigation

- “No past or current litigation against State of Maine in past 5 years”
- “Adequately insured for ... pending claims and lawsuits”.

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: TRC
DATE: 11/26/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	45

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall Approach
 - Project approach is clear and aligned with RFP scope of work.
 - Bidder applies direct experience with state government and Maine.
 - Provides options for virtual, hybrid, and in-person meetings.
 - Effective project management steps and format proposed. Will create SharePoint site for sharing data and deliverables.
 - The Principal-in-Charge and Project Manager will participate in biweekly check-in calls with the GOPIF to provide project updates and status reports.
- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Reflects understanding of RFP-informed roles such as “throughout this process, it is understood that the GOPIF is responsible for coordinating engagement with participating state agency representatives.”
 - Useful approach for “Tier 1” and “Tier 2” layers for data collection, demonstrates strong understanding of state-owned assets.
 - Very effective approach for streamlined data collection from agencies that doesn’t overburden agencies with involvement.
 - Data format available as GIS file and as CSV with taxonomy that can be used across state agencies.
 - Risk tolerance and criticality concepts include clear examples for how agencies will assign the labels to their data.
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - TRC already has climate projections and climate processing tool set up for Maine through other project, starting with relevant project knowledge.
 - Selected hazards align with State Hazard Mitigation Plan.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: TRC

DATE: 11/26/2024

- Recommend three climatic zones. 12 climate stressors, 3 time horizons, 2-3 future scenarios consistent with best practices. Time horizons align with RFP, may suggest additional 2070 time period.
 - Maintain screening level assessment for stressor exposure to assets, matches requested scope of work.
 - Solid approach for integrating disadvantaged communities into exposure analysis.
 - Deliverables included hazard assessment data and summary memo and hazard assessment presentation.
- Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Simple and effective approach to scoring on low, medium, high scale.
 - Multiple options for scoring rubrics available. Vulnerability catalog will indicate scores and can be adjusted in real-time.
 - Consequence assessment calculated through relative cost, safety, disruption. Equity score included. Team’s environmental justice experts would review the recommendations.
 - Operational risk deep dive, two per agency, to discuss assets with the highest risk scores. Included questions regarding day-to-day operations that will result in detailed risk profile.
 - Emphasis on consistency across scoring that will provide streamlined and holistic understanding of climate impact metrics.
- Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Three measures proposed for each asset type/hazard combination
 - Roadmap tracker as “living document” is valuable for agencies.
 - Relevant examples for facility and operational risks strategies.
 - Equity considerations included in mitigation measures.
 - Approach for recommendations and final products aligns with RFP.
- Other
 - Overall, bidder has a very strong understanding of processes for and experience in assessing climate vulnerability and offers a very thorough description of services to be provided.
 - Bidder's approach to working with state government is conscientious and highly aligned with the RFP scope.
 - Strong understanding of Maine climate hazards and already has modeling and projections set up as a starting point for analysis.
 - Clear and highly relevant deliverables identified for each task.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- 12 months
- Gantt chart provides task leads and descriptions of their roles.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: TRC

DATE: 11/26/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45	,	346,419	x	25 points	=	7.17

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: VHB

DATE: 12/4/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor’s Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine

Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	25
Section III. Proposed Services	45	25
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	5.57
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>55.57</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: VHB

DATE: 12/4/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: VHB
DATE: 12/4/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Experience with state government agencies
 - Vulnerability assessments, resiliency and adaptation plans across New England
 - Skills include: GIS, data analytics, graphics, net-zero designing
 - Offices in Augusta, South Portland, Westbrook
 - Project managers each have 10+ years of experience with projects in the state of Maine and across New England
 - Project Examples
 - SMRT, Maine Bureau of General Services, Augusta State Facilities Master Plan: Assessment of Augusta area infrastructure to align with Maine’s 2020 Climate Action Plan goal, priority ranking of risk, recommendations for occupancy, strategy for modernizing buildings, toured and inventoried assets to assess condition and vulnerabilities, most relevant to RFP
 - City of Philadelphia Department of Aviation, Climate Vulnerability Assessment, Climate Adaptation and Resiliency Plan, H&H Resiliency Study, Design Standards: Vulnerability assessment with asset vulnerabilities to climate impacts and stakeholder engagement, climate adaptation and resiliency plan will be identifying high-risk/high-criticality assets, currently under development
 - Metropolitan Transportation Plan Resilience Strategy, Orlando, FL: Strategic long-range planning through literature review and best practices, developing climate adaptation and equitable resilience strategies, analyzed federal, state, identified vulnerable assets, created user-friendly GIS platform
2. Subcontractors
 - SMRT Architects and Engineers
 - Architecture, mechanical, electrical, and plumbing, mitigating carbon emissions

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: VHB

DATE: 12/4/2024

- Experience with multi-campus vulnerability and risk mitigation study for Department of Veterans Affairs to support operational and sustainability goals
 - Partnered with VHB on State of Maine Augusta Area Facilities Master Plan
 - Senior Principal engaged in Maine Climate Council climate risk work
 - Colby College
 - History of collaboration on climate and environmental challenges in Maine
 - Computational infrastructure, geospatial analysis library, research assistants and interns
 - Stakeholder engagement, GIS, Coastal & Marine energy
 - No direct experience with climate vulnerability assessment listed
- 3. Organizational Chart
 - 35 staff listed
 - Project manager worked on all three project examples.
 - Project management, climate risk and analysis, stakeholder engagement, graphics and deliverables.
 - Climate solutions team has staff for each topic (built, social, and natural environments, regulations and policy). Most likely wouldn't need transportation and water solutions specialists for scope.
 - Seems like a larger staff than is needed for this scale of a project, may be challenging to coordinate and streamline.
- 4. Litigation
 - Pending cases provided.
- 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: VHB

DATE: 12/4/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall Approach
 - Assumes coordination with Lead by Example coordinators and up to 6 different agencies.
 - Utilizing Envision sustainability framework and rating system.
 - Includes a set of workshops for interagency discussion, and agency-specific workshops for critical assets and solutions. Plan to use faculty and students from Colby college to manage questionnaires that would be distributed before workshops.
 - Biweekly engagement with GOPIF.
- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Colby College faculty students will help validate location and metadata and undertake supplemental data collection effort. Would need additional information on project timeline and data quality for tasks involving students.
 - Risk-tolerance and criticality assessment would start with reviewing asset type first, then individual assets. Incorporates Maine Social Vulnerability Index.
 - Proposed narrowing vulnerability assessment to critical assets identified by agencies.
 - Using multi-criteria decision analysis to work with state agencies on evaluating asset type importance. Would need clarification about what analysis the Bidder is providing and what additional input the agencies are contributing during workshops.
 - Task 1 deliverables include: crosswalk analysis source document, data collection requirements, asset GIS inventory, MCDA evaluation framework, list of critical asset types and assets by agency, workshops and notes
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Primary climate hazards organized by three climate zones.
 - Organized hazards by event, would benefit from further details.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: VHB

DATE: 12/4/2024

- Includes workshop for interagency working group to review findings and confirm primary hazards. Agency time may be better used elsewhere.
 - Would use existing data sources, not proposing new climate modeling.
 - Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Proposal to use “commit to manage” and “prepare to manage” targets to align with Maine’s existing goals.
 - Sensitivity analysis and adaptive capacity rely heavily on agency working group without providing initial evaluation. May not be most effective use of state agency time.
 - This task proposes a predominantly qualitative risk assessment of probability scores.
 - Intervention analysis developed from the combination of vulnerability and risk assessment scores. Intervention types include: immediate response, strategic planning, resilience building, monitoring for change.
 - Multiple scoring steps and multiple points of engagement for data, would need an extremely thorough QAQC process.
 - Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Potential categories for agency recommendations include physical modifications, operational adjustments, ecosystem-based approaches etc., with options across three levels of intervention.
 - Evaluation will include risk reduction benefits, co-benefits, and cost considerations. Example metrics align with scope.
 - For strategy development, VHB will concentrate on planning areas related to infrastructure and land, while SMRT will focus on buildings. Faculty and students from the Colby College Environmental Studies program will contribute to the development of all options.
 - Other
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 12 months
 - Organized biweekly across 26 weeks
 - Mitigation and adaptation strategy development covers March to Nov, possibly to encompass student involvement? Would need to clarify integration of tasks and amount of time needed per task.
 - Summary of job descriptions clearly reflects responsibilities across each team, but the scale of staff is a concern for the cohesiveness and timeliness of the project.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: VHB

DATE: 12/4/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45	,	445,800	x	25 points	=	5.57

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: VIEWSHED
DATE: 12/4/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor’s Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine
Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	10
Section III. Proposed Services	45	15
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	5.55
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>30.55</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: VIEWSHED

DATE: 12/4/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: VIEWSHED
DATE: 12/4/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	10

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Experience with state and local governments
 - Landscape architecture, GIS, planning
 - Subcontractors have experience with vulnerability assessments
 - VIEWSHED has staff of 11, has worked in Maine for over 20 years
 - Project Examples
 - Casco Bay Regional Shellfish Working Group, Community Intertidal Data Portal (VIEWSHED): Data products to support planning and management decisions in intertidal zone, Public outreach and user testing for accessible tools
 - Architect of the Capitol (Cultivate Geospatial): Asset management and prioritization, risk analysis, hazard mitigation, consequence of failure assessments, GIS
 - City of Richmond Climate Vulnerability and Risk Assessment (Planning Communities): Developed GIS analysis of heat and flooding risks to communities, built assets, and natural features, produced StoryMap, video series, graphic handout, most relevant to this RFP
2. Subcontractors
 - Cultivate Geospatial Solutions
 - GIS and asset management, data services
 - Did not describe climate vulnerability assessment skills
 - Planning Communities
 - Planning and geospatial services
 - Sustainable and equitable practices for communities
 - Climate vulnerability and risk assessment primarily at the local level
 - State level projects matched the scale of this RFP
3. Organizational Chart
 - 10 staff
 - VIEWSHED listed as project lead, subcontractors responsible for main tasks

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: VIEWSHED

DATE: 12/4/2024

- Project manager, GIS analyst, landscape designer/resilience planner, asset management, community planner
 - Would benefit from specialists in topics such as climate vulnerability, climate adaption and mitigation, risk assessment.
4. Litigation
 - None
 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: VIEWSHED
DATE: 12/4/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	15

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall Approach
 - Clear steps to ensure alignment, establish protocols, assess process and results through regular check-ins that add information.
 - Planning to meet in person whenever feasible.
 - Each task will have a report, and at the end of the project all data and reports will be combined into a final report.
- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Data capture, integration, QAQC documentation were all noted, but the Bidder did not explain how they would address gaps in asset data.
 - Agency review for risk tolerance/criticality is mentioned, but it is unclear how the Bidder would accomplish this task.
 - Includes deliverables for GIS inventory, risk tolerance and criticality assessment, and final report.
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Would benefit from details about approach beyond RFP content.
 - Climate hazard modeling through simulated projected impacts, provide location-specific risk assessments. Model would create flexible rapid assessment and dynamic climate hazard simulation tool. Unclear if these are in-house tools.
 - Would benefit from more information about the output from the model and how it applies to the RFP.
- Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Vulnerability scoring tool using Weighted Overlay Analysis.
 - Equity implications for public services topic makes sense but approach is unclear. Proposed using national indicators and indicators revised to be specific to Maine, would benefit from further details on indicators.
 - Bidder makes frequent reference to “aligning with FEMA’s risk model” without describing their approach to alignment.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: VIEWSHED

DATE: 12/4/2024

- Outcomes would include data visualization through a story map and comprehensive report.
 - Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Action timeline would include short, medium, and long term actions, but unclear how actions would be tailored to specific state agencies.
 - Proposed development of visualization tools to evaluate and track adaptation options. RVAgreen2050 example of story map is relevant to potential outcomes.
 - Beyond conducting literature review, Bidder did not include sufficient details for how they would develop adaptation and mitigation strategies.
 - Other
 - Project team would meet with GOPIF on biweekly basis.
 - Overall, underdeveloped tasks that do not sufficiently describe processes and methodologies. Outputs seem focused on creating visualizations rather than a feasible methodology.
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 12 months
 - Gantt chart identifies which task the subcontractors will contribute to, but there is no discussion of how Viewshed will manage the team and ensure smooth integration of subs' work, especially where both subs are contributing to the same task (e.g., Tasks 2 and 3 rely on components from all subs).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: VIEWSHED

DATE: 12/4/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45	,	447,820.00	x	25 points	=	5.55

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets
BIDDER: Weston & Sampson
DATE: 12/4/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Governor’s Office of Policy Innovation and the Future
Name of RFP Coordinator: Hannah Silverfine
Names of Evaluators: Hannah Silverfine, Brian Ambrette, Sierra Millay

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	N/A	N/A
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	30
Section III. Proposed Services	45	35
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	5.60
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>70.6</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 12/4/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 12/4/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	30	30

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Overview of the Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Resiliency planning and infrastructure projects across New England
 - Experience with state agencies and municipal governments
 - Experience with climate change vulnerability assessments
 - Experience with climate hazard mitigation & adaptation strategies, hazard mitigation plans, municipal vulnerability preparedness projects
 - Climate scientists with in-house predictive modeling. Experience with developing climate models and tools.
 - Skill with large asset portfolios.
- Project Examples
 - MA Executive Office of Energy and Environmental Affairs, Climate Resilience Design Standards Tool: Developed tool for screening level exposure and risk analysis for state-owned and municipal buildings, infrastructure and natural resources, GIS application, robust public engagement process.
 - Town of Chebeague Island Maine, Wharf improvements: Partnered with Woods Hole Group on mitigation and adaptation strategies into infrastructure design, model flood scenarios under various conditions.
 - NH Department of Environmental Services: With SLR Consulting, conducted CCVAs throughout NH for current and future climate change impacts on infrastructure, gathered asset data and assessed adaptive capacity, incorporating vulnerabilities into HMP and asset management platforms, developed an exposure, sensitivity, and adaptive capacity scoring framework to determine a vulnerability score.
 - Previous relevant projects collaborating with at least two of the subcontractors.

2. Subcontractors

- SLR Consulting
 - Technical consulting such as engineering, environmental assessment, permitting, natural resources management and planning

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 12/4/2024

- Woods Hole Group
 - Developing Maine Coast Flood Risk Model for MaineDOT
 - Engineering solutions related to climate change planning
 - Siler Climate Consulting
 - Community engagement
 - Quantified Ventures
 - Innovative funding and financing strategies
 - Consensus Building Institute
 - Stakeholder engagement
 - Maine Won't Wait
 - Offshore Wind Roadmap
 - Some redundancy across skills/qualifications of subcontractors and of the Bidder.
3. Organizational Chart
- 29 staff
 - Project management, state asset inventory, climate impact scenarios, vulnerability and impact assessment, climate hazard mitigation and adaptation recommendations, agency engagement
 - Proposed team with 5 subs is perhaps too complex for project scope.
4. Litigation
- Details provided
5. Certificate of Insurances
- Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 12/4/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	45	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall Approach
 - Significant resources devoted to engagement, interagency working group included as engagement strategy.
 - Approach includes relevant experiences that reflect their qualifications, and steps for accomplishing technical support.
- Task 1 – Develop an inventory of state assets
 - Will create a standardized, pre-populated template to use across agencies for inventory. Commitment to data accuracy and completeness. Would ask agencies to confirm data.
 - Determine risk-tolerance and criticality through framework of criteria and agency workshops to identify specific needs and vulnerabilities with social vulnerability as a lens.
 - Drawing from experience from Climate Resilient Design Standards Tool for MA state agencies.
 - Steering committee would be asked to consider additional organizations. Would need to clarify alignment with scope.
 - Deliverables included template, GIS asset inventory, bimonthly steering committee meetings, stakeholder engagement plan, three agency-specific meetings, two interagency working group workshops.
- Task 2 – Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Three future planning horizons aligned with Maine Won't Wait.
 - Included tier 2 hazards and cascading impacts from State Hazard Mitigation Plan.
 - GIS exposure assessment to track shifts over time. Detailed approach for exposure for flooding and heat but not for other hazards like wildfire.
 - Compile exposure data into user-friendly Excel categorized by region and planning horizon, focus on usability.
 - Comprehensive set of modeling and data analysis proposed for each of the hazards. Using SHMP to interpret assets for prioritization in

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 12/4/2024

- planning. Some tools are beyond the scope of work such as enhanced modeling of marsh migration.
 - Proposed workshops with training sessions on technical information. This may be beyond scope for state agency engagement.
 - Task 3 – Conduct a screening-level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset or asset type
 - Combination of quantitative and qualitative analysis, assess redundancies at system level.
 - Clear example of evaluation criteria for adaptive capacity. Adaptive capacity indicators align with RFP goals.
 - Proposal for on-the ground observations of sites for adaptive capacity. This would not be feasible for more than a handful of assets for each agency. Would need to set parameters for criticality/need.
 - Vulnerability and risk scores for assets would be combined to prioritize different assets for resiliency improvements.
 - Equity implications for public service interruptions would be addressed through working group impact scenarios and discussion of impacts on assets and services. Relies heavily on agency input.
 - Conduct agency-specific engagement workshops to discuss climate hazard impacts on operations and assets. Would prioritize key assets for further study.
 - Deliverable for integrated model for one priority pilot site is out of scope, or unclear how it fits within scope.
 - Task 4 – Recommend climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the State and individual agencies
 - Bidder says they will “advocate for nature-based solutions”. We are seeking objective recommendations and not advocacy.
 - Approach distinguishes between structural and non-structural adaptations.
 - Before, during, after adaptation planning horizon framework is useful for agencies. Would benefit from more details about how the adaptation evaluation would be attached to and communicated for assets.
 - Section of recommendations includes potential funding and financing pathways for agencies to implement recommendations. Includes example from supporting other government agencies but would benefit from additional information for how this would apply to Maine.
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 12 months
 - 1 project manager, multiple task leads
 - Tasks able to take place concurrently
 - Development of metrics likely need to happen earlier than the final month

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 12/4/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	÷	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
99,394.45	÷	443,700	x	25 points	=	5.60

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AARC Consultants

DATE: 11/4/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Experience with 19 climate vulnerability assessments of infrastructure assets and system services.
- Examples of climate risk assessment, exposure and sensitivity analysis, hazard mitigation plan update, climate adaptation and resilience plan.

• *Project Examples*

- Western Municipal Water District, CA
 - a. District level experience with all-hazards risk and resilience assessment.
- Florida DEP
 - a. City level assessment of asset and facilities inventory collection and recommendations for resilience.
- Critical infrastructure weatherization
 - a. State level engineering services and recommendations.

2. Subcontractors

• *GIS Analyst*

- Experience conducting climate vulnerability assessments, geospatial and flood modeling techniques.

3. Organizational Chart

• *7 staff*

- Resilience professional, civil engineer, scientist, building performance, emergency/disaster preparedness

4. Litigation

• *None*

5. Certificate of Insurances

• *Yes*

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

• *Task 1*

- Would benefit from details beyond rephrasing RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AARC Consultants

DATE: 11/4/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Proposed potential for on-site data collection for inspecting critical facilities and high priority assets.
 - Task 2
 - IPCC definitions and approach.
 - Emphasis on "critical thresholds" is useful to assess state asset failure or malfunction.
 - Familiar with critical infrastructure design for adaptation.
 - Task 3
 - Would benefit from details beyond rephrasing RFP.
 - Task 4
 - Would benefit from more detail on what type of framework is used.
 - Draft goals related to safety, reliability, reducing risk of failure.
 - Example of adaptive planning principles with tiered recommendations.
 - Metrics will track progress on improvements, public service continuity, cost savings.
 - Project Management
 - QAQC through regular communication, cost control schedule, data security.
2. *Implementation – Work Plan*
- 12 month project
 - Mapping and scenario visualization may benefit from additional time.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AECOM

DATE: 11/4/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Experience conducting vulnerability assessments for state agencies in MA and NY
 - a. Led development of MA State Hazard Mitigation and Climate Adaptation Plan. Experience conducting vulnerability assessments for and coordinating across 8 MA state agencies
 - b. Clear sample of a climate vulnerability matrix that highlights climate variables and impacts on physical assets by category, developed for New York State climate vulnerability assessments
- Experience and knowledge of Maine's infrastructure, climate risks and vulnerabilities
 - a. Currently supporting Southern Maine Planning and Development Commission in an infrastructure vulnerability assessment (town level)
- Examples of projects across the following relevant services: inventory of assets, climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards, screening level assessments of vulnerability, climate hazard mitigation and adaption options

• *Project Examples*

- New York State Agency Climate Vulnerability Assessments and Climate Adaptation Planning
 - a. Completed climate vulnerability assessments for 35 New York State agencies, experience with physical facility assessment and policy prioritization, analysis of how climate impacts can affect agency's ability to carry out its mission successfully
- MBTA Red Line Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment
 - a. Engineering and technical support for critical assets including short and long term climate adaptation measures
- Portsmouth Naval Shipyard Floodplain and Sea Level Rise

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AECOM

DATE: 11/4/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- a. Assessment of sea level rise, potential impacts of future flooding conditions on infrastructure, adaptation options

2. *Subcontractors*

- Aon – climate modeling capabilities
 - “Largest reinsurance broker for physical climate risk”
 - Climate Risk Advisory - team that quantifies and mitigates physical risk and vulnerability, reporting and disclosure obligations, growth opportunities

3. *Organizational Chart*

- 24 people
- Led by staff with resilience, hazard mitigation, climate adaptation, climate modeling, infrastructure experience
- Project Manager manages climate resilient infrastructure and climate vulnerability assessments

4. *Litigation*

- “None of our current claims could reasonably be expected to have a material adverse effect on ATS or its ability to perform under the contract contemplated by the proposal”.

5. *Certificate of Insurances*

- Yes

II. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

- Overall Approach
 - Clear description of tasks, deliverables, and assumptions
 - Project start up includes round of a review for workplan, hybrid kickoff meeting hosted by the State
- Task 1
 - Compile existing data, group assets by category, flexibility to work with Maine project team to address issues
 - Clear example of how consequence rating and degree of impact would look for two different asset functions
- Task 2
 - Climate hazard summary organized by primary and secondary hazard types, modeling basis, and cascading impacts

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AECOM

DATE: 11/4/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Acute perils modeling using insurance industry catastrophe models, chronic perils modeling using proprietary global hazards tool
 - Outputs could also include: annualized statistics, event based statistics, financial metrics such as “occurrence exceedance probability”
 - Task 3
 - Assets overlaid with potential hazard impacts, assigned probability rating
 - Vulnerability matrix: probability and consequence
 - Includes equity considerations based on MWW equity subcommittee definitions, proposed distinct benchmarks per priority population
 - Task 4
 - Focus on high priority and high vulnerability assets
 - Suite of planning and programmatic options including relative cost rankings, timeline applicability
 - Proprietary federal fund navigator tool
2. *Implementation – Work Plan*
- 12 months
 - Clear outline of tasks and responsibilities

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Arup US, Inc

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Supported over 150 city climate and resilience plans worldwide
- Experience assessing climate and natural hazard impacts, statewide and island nation climate vulnerability and risk assessments, exposure modeling
- Authored new guidelines on resilience-based design for infrastructure
- Teaming with
 - a. GEI Consultants Inc
 - i. Engineering firm, geotechnical expertise, experience with Maine municipalities, skills in flood vulnerability assessment, prioritization of infrastructure adaptation
 - b. Siler Climate Consulting
 - i. Experience with Maine municipalities, experience with resilience planning and community engagement

• *Project Examples*

- Vulnerability Assessment and Climate Resilience Plan, New York City Health and Hospitals (Arup)
 - a. Experience developing assessment framework for current and future climate vulnerabilities, prioritization process for the system to protect assets from climate hazards and ensure critical services get to residents
- Climate Change Vulnerability and Risk Assessment, Caltrans (Arup)
 - a. Experience leading update of statewide climate change vulnerability assessment of Caltrans-owned or operated infrastructure, stakeholder engagement.
- Bath Flood Vulnerability Assessment (GEI)
 - a. Experience with assessment of flood risk mitigation, assessment of assets and adaptation for city's resilience.

2. Subcontractors

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Arup US, Inc

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- GEI Consultants
- Siler Climate Consulting
- 3. *Organizational Chart*
 - 19 staff
 - Experience across resilience, large scale infrastructure projects, climate impacts, multi-hazard risk analysis, vulnerability assessments, geospatial analysis, engineering, municipal planning
- 4. *Litigation*
 - No current or pending claims, litigation or arbitration, which are not adequately covered by the firm's insurance policies.
- 5. *Certificate of Insurances*
 - Yes

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Project Understanding
 - Reflective that Bidder has skills relevant to project and understanding of context for Maine.
 - Proposed including a state-wide inland flood model to support risk-based prioritization, and advance missing information from the SHMP.
 - Appreciate the inclusion of an outcome about building capacity and internal education, in addition collecting asset data and filling gaps
 - GEI has experience with consequence analysis for dam safety, applicable to analysis of assets.
 - Provided climate risk assessment approach with actionable metrics and transparent analysis.
- Task 1
 - Establish methodology before collecting data
 - Helpful incorporation of lesson learned from relevant experience with a different portfolio-wide risk assessment.
 - Steering committee of Maine state agencies. Bidder also recommends steering committee include "representatives from Maine based organizations", which is outside this project's scope of work.
 - Database mutually agreed upon and supplemented by National Structure Inventory.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Arup US, Inc

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Task 2
 - Will align time horizons with ME-CFRM.
 - Proposed development of inland flood model to address data gap.
 - Task 3
 - Co-creation of metrics. Sample risk metrics across qualitative and quantitative options such as repair costs, downtime, safety.
 - Equity assessment as additional layer for prioritizing investments and actions.
 - Task 4
 - High impact strategies across physical, policy, organizational, and governance interventions
 - Establish ownership, clearly define steps, prioritize environmental justice communities, prioritize actions most critical to state operations
 - Tracking metrics, KPIs, and proposed Digital Dashboard
2. *Implementation – Work Plan*
- 11 months
 - Clear indication of drafts, deliverables, review period for GOPIF

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: CLEAResult Consulting

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Experience with public sector clients.
- Experience with Efficiency Maine and Maine specific challenges.
- Acquired a full service energy and management firm with expertise in climate vulnerability and resilience planning.

• *Project Examples*

- Efficiency Maine's Residential Energy Efficiency Programs
 - a. Experience with quasi-state agency
- Climate Change Infrastructure Resilience Analysis and Adaptation Strategies for the Tahoe Basin
 - a. Experience with assessment of transportation, telecommunications, energy, waste/water infrastructure systems to climate change, evaluated climate change hazard projections, exposure
 - b. Risk-based qualitative framework to prioritize infrastructure vulnerabilities
- Planning for Resilience Across NYSERDA's Programs
 - a. Experience evaluated program assets and creating toolkit for program managers to identify and respond to climate challenges

2. Subcontractors

- N/A

3. Organizational Chart

- 5 staff
- Experience working with government clients
- Experience with environmental planning, decarbonization, engineering

4. Litigation

- "The Company has been subject to legal proceedings, claims and litigation arising in the ordinary course of business. These matters have not materially impacted client work and the Company does not expect the ultimate costs to resolve these matters to have a material adverse effect on Company's consolidated financial condition, results of operations or cash flows."

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: CLEARResult Consulting

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

5. *Certificate of Insurances*

- Yes

II. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

- Task 1
 - Experience managing Efficiency Maine's Residential Programs provides background on state agencies in Maine but is not directly relevant to climate vulnerability of assets.
 - Will work with stakeholders on decision support tools and determine risk tolerance and criticality.
- Task 2
 - Would benefit from more detail on approach and tools to develop climate scenarios and assess hazards risk.
 - Proposed development of tools to identify region-specific natural climate hazards.
 - Technical communication for stakeholders would benefit from more explanation.
- Task 3
 - Would benefit from explanation of methods and specific approach for accomplishing tasks.
 - Determine relative vulnerability score through geospatial analysis and FEMA dataset.
 - Vulnerability scoring matrix included along with visualizations for likelihood.
 - Census-based vulnerability data used for equity implications.
 - Targeted engagement applied for agencies to understand asset impairments.
- Recommendations for agencies
 - Cost-benefit analysis on adaptation measures.
 - Prioritized resilience and risk reduction strategies.
 - Monitoring framework for metrics would benefit from more detail.

2. *Implementation – Work Plan*

- 12 months
- Unclear why 11 weeks are needed to develop primary and secondary hazards, not reflected in proposed services.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: CLEAResult Consulting

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Instead of ad-hoc questions from agencies, would benefit from structured engagement plan.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte

DATE: 11/4/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Conducted critical infrastructure risk assessments at all levels of government and across sectors. Conducted data analysis and research on climate change forecasts.
- Large scale asset inventories with DHHS reflects strong data management skills but not skill of developing climate impact scenarios.
- Experience in developing strategies and priorities through FEMA Office of Emerging Threats. Strategies focused on resilience services for critical infrastructure, cost of inaction, decision support.

• *Project Examples*

- Department of Navy
 - a. Asset inventory experience, mission criticality/utilization of assets, inventory guide, climate impact scenario development, experience with strategic guidance for government.
- US Coast Guard
 - a. Enterprise risk management framework, consistent guidance, developed risk appetite statements and risk tolerance levels, risk response strategies. Skills for but not direct example of climate impact scenarios.
- Broward Metropolitan Planning Organization
 - a. Experience with digital platform managing data and modeling resiliency efforts.

2. Subcontractors

- N/A

3. Organizational Chart

- 7 staff, 5 project advisors
- Experience with risk management, hazard mitigation, disaster resilience, geospatial technology
- Advisors with additional experience in climate and risk adaptation strategy, critical infrastructure risk

4. Litigation

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte

DATE: 11/4/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- “Within the past five (5) years, there has been no litigation brought by a state, local, or federal governmental client against Deloitte & Touche related to a Deloitte & Touche services engagement”

5. *Certificate of Insurances*

- Yes

II. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

• Task 1

- Approach includes viewing asset inventory and risk register as long-term products.
- Create taxonomy to match inventory needs for format, design, organization. Process will be prepared to manage inconsistent data format.
- Conduct reporting section includes many “as needed” items. The flexibility is appreciated but hard to assess how that would factor into cost/time etc.

• Task 2

- Included a Climate Risk Profiler Tool and Scenario Register deliverable that align with needs but would benefit from details in method.

• Task 3

- Would benefit from details on tools, methodology, and approach.
- Would benefit from approach to narrative development on public service interruptions and adaptive capacity of system-wide resilience.

• Task 4

- Drawing from construction and infrastructure knowledge, sustainable design frameworks.
- “Quick wins” for mitigation is a useful category for state agencies.
- Would benefit from more detail in approach.

2. *Implementation – Work Plan*

- 5 months / 19 weeks

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte

DATE: 11/4/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- 1.5 months for state asset inventory.
- 2 months for resilience recommendations.
- Overall timeline does not seem to reflect the scope of tasks for this RFP.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ERG

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Experience with federal, state, and local governments
- Expertise in climate mitigation and adaptation models, approaches at multiple scales, climate hazard analysis
- Designed Vermont's Municipal Vulnerability Indicators Tool to help municipalities determine climate vulnerabilities

• *Project Examples*

- Massachusetts Emergency Management Agency
 - a. Developed ResilientMass Plan, identified climate and hazard data, conducted risk assessment, hazard analysis, vulnerability assessment across health, infrastructure, resources, governance, and economy, worked with state agencies to develop hazard mitigation and climate adaptation actions to address risks specific to MA, experience with best available climate science and projections, including Northeast specific data
- State of Maine, GOPIF Climate Change Impact Analysis
 - a. Conducted economic analysis, developed adaptation strategies based on priority climate vulnerabilities in Maine, developed products to help the State communicate results, experience with climate hazards in Maine
- Installation Climate Resilience Plan for Department of Defense
 - a. Conducted resilience assessments for two buildings and 11 climate hazards, experience with consequences for operation disruptions and with asset-level vulnerability assessment to climate hazards

2. Subcontractors

- N/A

3. Organizational Chart

- 9 staff

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ERG

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Experience in climate adaptation, climate resilience and vulnerability assessments, climate hazard and projections, metrics, flood resilience, infrastructure, economic modeling

4. *Litigation*

- None

5. *Certificate of Insurances*

- Yes

II. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

- Project Management
 - Clear proposal for expectations.
 - State agency engagement approach would use workshops to identify metrics and gather feedback.
- Task 1
 - Manage workshop invitations and track survey distribution for state agency engagement.
 - Will assess data, QAQC, then recommend granularity of assessment based on data and agency priorities.
 - Documentation for developing inventory that aligns with agency assets.
- Task 2
 - Draft list of hazards and related impacts using existing Maine information.
 - Emissions scenarios would cover very high and intermediate scenarios.
 - Time horizons would include 2040-2070 and 2070-2100.
 - Includes example of metrics for different hazards. Deliverable would result in excel workbook.
- Task 3
 - Approach for relative vulnerability score demonstrated clear understanding of asset exposure and consequences to public service interruptions.
 - Clear example of a resilience assessment of EPA laboratories with relevant hazards, exposure, and sensitivity
 - Workbook of information with option to provide interactive map.
 - State agency survey developed using experience from effective and directly relevant example in MA.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ERG

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Equity implications would be developed based on resources across Maine and best practices from other projects.
 - Prioritizing of key issues shown through a matrix with adaptive interventions for two different time frames.
 - Workshop with agency partners will solicit feedback to refine understanding of vulnerability and consequence and inform task 4 interventions.
 - Task 4
 - Sample of evaluation including alignment with mission, consistency with other plans, feasibility, equity, and timeframe.
 - Workshop 4 would solicit input from agencies, partners, SMEs on draft strategies and opportunities/gaps.
 - Includes analysis of cost estimate and co-benefits.
2. *Implementation – Work Plan*
- 11 months
 - Realistic distribution of tasks

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ICF

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Experience in infrastructure vulnerability assessments, conducting climate vulnerability assessments for state and local governments, providing adaptation strategies and plans
 - a. E.g., City of Philadelphia, Virginia DOT, State of Pennsylvania, US Fish and Wildlife Service
- Expertise in climate science, local flood risk and Maine climate analysis from GMRI

• *Project Examples*

- Climate Change Vulnerability Study for Maine Energy Utility
 - a. Experience with climate change vulnerability of assets, consequences and impact analysis
- Military Installation Resilience Review
 - a. Experience with assessment of resilience threats to installation ability to perform mission, identifying risk mitigation actions, collaboration across stakeholders
- Town of Tremont Climate Vulnerability Assessment
 - a. Experience with town level assessment leveraging quantitative data and local knowledge of community identifying climate impacts.

2. Subcontractors

- Gulf of Maine Research Institute (GMRI)
 - Experience with climate resilience and adaptation, based in Maine.

3. Organizational Chart

- 16 staff
- Experience across climate risk and climate adaptations, vulnerability assessments, working with government stakeholders, climate science, data analysis, engineering

4. Litigation

- None

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Yes

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ICF

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Project Management
 - Regular check-ins
 - Establish advisory committee of key stakeholders
- Task 1
 - Collect data, streamline, identify priorities. If needed, will identify proxy variables.
 - Develop risk tolerance framework with state agencies.
 - External stakeholder engagement is out of scope.
- Task 2
 - Build on available data and couple with ClimateSight, in-house analytics tool. Included example variables for climate hazard projections.
 - Probabilistic projections from downscaled global climate models.
 - Deliverables include slidedeck with variables, methods, tabular and spatial data files.
- Task 3
 - Practical considerations for interdependency with critical infrastructure and impacts on overall system.
 - Individual assets would be scored on relative exposure, example table from coastal flooding in Maine.
 - Sensitivity matrix would be developed with input from Advisory Committee.
 - Interruptions on public services will include five stakeholder interviews to inform implications for use of asset, climate change impacts, vulnerabilities and resilience of system. Likely out of scope.
 - Each asset would have scores for exposure, sensitivity, adaptive capacity, impact and consequence, equity, vulnerability. Not clear if this is in reference to assets or asset type.
 - Strong method for each score and analysis, example from US Fish and Wildlife Service.
- Task 4

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ICF

DATE: 11/5/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- ICF would conduct literature review, GMRI would lead facilitated discussions with advisory committee.
- Strategies will include: time horizon, category, cost consideration, implementing agency, tracking metrics. Deliverable would include Excel spreadsheet.
- Relies heavily on GOPIF and state agencies to develop recommendations
- Deliverables include list of up to 40 adaptation measures, prioritized list of 15 adaptation strategies, and one workshop for buy-in and input from state agencies.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- 11 months
 - 4 months for task 1

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: IEM

DATE: 11/6/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Experience in disaster mitigation, preparedness and recovery, emphasis on mitigation and rebuilding in communities
- Experience with federal, state, and local agency clients

• *Project Examples*

- New York State and New York City Emergency Management
 - a. Experience with performing vulnerability assessments hazards on state assets, experience with integrating resilience planning, statewide building codes, state risk maps, conducted Hazus loss estimation modeling to assess potential loss from hazards on city
- Chittenden Multi-Jurisdictional All Hazards Plan
 - a. Experience with vulnerability assessment, experience integrating County's environmental concerns with protection of assets and allowing for growth
- Delaware State Hazard Mitigation Plan
 - a. Experience with researching future conditions related to climate change and potential vulnerability to assets

2. Subcontractors

- None

3. Organizational Chart

- 14 staff
- Experience with hazard mitigation, climate resilience, emergency management, climate adaptation, engineering, GIS

4. Litigation

- Included

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Yes

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: IEM

DATE: 11/6/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Would benefit from a more concise and clear explanation of approach.
- Mentions IEM Disaster Recovery Center of Excellence but unclear connection of skills to this project.
- Hazus software would be used for assessing hazards and vulnerability.
- Task 1
 - This section would benefit from emphasizing IEM's approach specific to the RFP.
 - A few factors labeled as meeting the requirements were outside of scope – transportation networks, power supplies, communication systems.
 - Comprehensive review of facility types and state agencies' mission goals was included but unclear how this would be accomplished.
- Task 2
 - Has applied "Integrated Environmental approach" to other projects, but lacks project examples.
 - Would benefit from more specific details on approach for Maine rather than summarizing general information.
- Task 3
 - General example of assessing vulnerability through impact, adaptative capacity, and vulnerability rating.
 - Would benefit from specifics of how IEM approaches this for Maine.
- Task 4
 - Would benefit from specifics for integration of vulnerability assessment and adaptation/mitigation measures into the approach.
 - Methods include scheduling meetings and establish clear communication channels, lacks explanation of how approach would accomplish deliverables.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- 11 weeks
- The timeline does not specifically match the proposed services – it is not clear how the Bidder will complete the tasks in the time allotted in the workplan.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/7/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Experience in climate science, data analytics, engineering
- Rail analysis methodology reflects combination of climate science and engineering principles to assess future climate impacts

• *Project Examples*

- Boulder County Climate Impact, Equity and Localization Modeling
 - i. Assessed vulnerability across publicly owned assets, developed climate hazard mitigation and adaptation strategies, analyzed cost impacts, climate scenario projections, neighborhood level vulnerability scores
- City of DeBary Vulnerability Assessment
 - i. Developed asset inventory of publicly owned assets conducted flood exposure analysis
- Climate Effects on US Infrastructure
 - i. Assessed economics of adaptation, multiple scenarios, experience with climate change projections

2. Subcontractors

- Stanley Consultants
 - Engineering, technical advisors

3. Organizational Chart

- 16 Staff
- Project management, scheduling, QAQC, climate vulnerabilities & resilience, engineering technical advisory
- Experience with state-wide climate vulnerability analysis, adaptation strategies, adaptive capacity indices, climate impact scenarios, climate resilience, engineering/modeling

4. Litigation

- None

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Yes

II. Proposed Services

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/7/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

1. *Services to be Provided*

- Task 1
 - Emphasis on gaining clarity and establishment of collaboration
 - Build dataset, identify any missing/incomplete items and adjust method as needed
 - Separate data into two categories: assets owned or leased by state and assets not under state ownership but with potential for cascading impacts
 - Compile dataset that encompasses social data for equity considerations
- Task 2
 - Use library of climate datasets to derive hazard variable calculations
 - Steps for data selection and refinement
 - Qualitative assessment for downstream impacts
- Task 3
 - Assess exposure, sensitivity, adaptive capacity and report vulnerability scores at an asset, agency, and state level
 - Incorporate equity assessment as a layer
- Task 4
 - Role for Stanley Consultants to support engineered adaptation strategies, would benefit from details
 - Tracking progress is included as important, but relies heavily on agency input
 - Would benefit from recommended metrics tracking approaches

2. *Implementation – Work Plan*

- 12 months
- Clear assignment of responsibilities
- 4 stakeholder review sessions appropriately spaced

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Stantec

DATE: 11/7/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Experience in coastal flood hazard assessment across New England
- Skills in vulnerability assessment and planning, engineering, risk analysis, asset inventory, stakeholder engagement

• *Project Examples*

- Connecticut DOT Vulnerability Assessment and Resilience Improvement Plan
 - a. Supporting state agency to identify climate vulnerabilities and prioritize solutions.
- MA State Parkways Climate Vulnerability Assessment
 - a. Assessed physical and economic impacts of current and future flooding, vulnerability scores for parkway segments and stakeholder engagement.
- Eastern Michigan University Flood Responses and Hazard Mitigation Plan
 - a. Vulnerability assessment of campus assets, infrastructure, and populations, mitigation action strategy with options for reducing risk and increasing resilience.
- Virginia Coastal Resilience Master Plan
- FEMA Risk Map Production and Technical Services

2. Subcontractors

• Gulf of Maine Research Institute

- Advisory role with expertise on climate services, regional ecosystem, and Maine climate impacts

3. Organizational Chart

- Resiliency planning, natural hazards, vulnerability assessments, hazard mitigation, community engagement

- 18 Staff

- Project management, data management, vulnerability assessment, mitigation & adaptation strategies

4. Litigation

- “There are no unsatisfied judgments or arbitration awards outstanding against Stantec. Stantec does have some legal

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Stantec

DATE: 11/7/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

proceedings, lawsuits, or claims pending. These are a normal part of professional services industries. All have been reported to Stantec's insurers who are in the process of adjusting/managing them. None will have a material effect on the financial position of the company or its ability to undertake this assignment".

5. *Certificate of Insurances*

- Yes

II. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

- Project Management
 - Project tracking spreadsheet.
 - Establish roles and communication early on.
 - Meetings starting weekly, then biweekly.
- Task 1
 - Approach includes asset definition, data review, and agency data interviews. Gap analysis included.
 - Supplemental data collection, Survey123 tool proposed, may not be a realistic use of state agency time to train on this tool.
 - Social vulnerability index in task 1 would be used to confirm data to inform Task 3.
 - Strong proposed steps for asset archetype development, but project is likely looking for fewer, broader categories.
- Task 2
 - Identify hazards and data gaps.
 - Select climate scenario together, Stantec preference is SSP5-8.5, STS Subcommittee uses 5th ICC report.
 - Process suggestions for likelihood scoring includes example with occurrence, qualitative descriptor recurrence vs. single event.
 - Time horizon can coincide with end of asset life or 30year climate period.
- Task 3
 - Specialized tool for quantitative vulnerability assessment scoring. ArcGIS, Python, SQL to automate information and provide spatial results. Example - Tool scored over 100,000

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Stantec

DATE: 11/7/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

assets for Kansas DOT across 9 natural hazards and 2 climate scenarios.

- Proposing use of adaptive deficit instead of capacity for consistency in formula.
- Suggestion for initial assessment, then more detailed consequence and impact assessment for medium/high vulnerability assets.
- Risk rating matrix and sample risk timing table were useful graphics.
- Task 4
 - Includes considering costs of strategies via similar project examples.
 - Whole of government strategies developed using FEMA community lifeline and asset archetypes.
 - Individual strategies include timeframe, costs, potential funding source, co-benefits with whole of government actions.
 - Outcome metrics include top-tier and sub-tier indicators.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- 12 months
- Data collection takes up to 16 weeks, high but likely realistic.
- Task 2 starting in parallel with Task 1.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Tetra Tech

DATE: 11/13/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Engineers, scientists, planners, policy analysts, subject matter experts for vulnerability analysis
- Experience across state and local government vulnerability assessments

• *Project Examples*

- California State University Chancellor's Office Resilience Framework
 - a. Experience in system wide resiliency, analyzed hazards to specific infrastructure types across the system, identified financial and operational risk, mitigation strategies
- MBTA Comprehensive Emergency Management Planning
 - a. Risk assessment in face of climate change to ensure resilience and reliability of services, prioritization scoring for decision making process.
- Palm Beach County Climate Risk Assessment and Action Plan
 - a. Prioritization framework to evaluate and rank adaptation and mitigation strategies, analysis using Hazus, GIS, HEC-RAS, SLAMM.

2. Subcontractors

- None

3. Organizational Chart

- 12 staff
- Vulnerability assessment SMEs
- Financial management, energy resilience, hazard mitigation specialist, GIS support, facility life cycle assessment, floodplain management, energy modeling

4. Litigation

- Cover page

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Yes

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Tetra Tech

DATE: 11/13/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Task 1
 - Classification of categories may include critical infrastructure, emergency facilities, transportation, cultural resources, etc.
 - Included step to “coordinate with municipalities to obtain CPRG information to support analysis”, would need clarification about the purpose of this step. RFP focus is state agency coordination and data.
 - Collect and process data, establish file sharing and tracking early on. Portfolio database for baseline inventory, includes data gap analysis.
 - Evaluation of categories through workshop with GOPIF and state agencies.
- Task 2
 - Analyzing up to 5 hazards, up to 4 climate scenarios, with considerations for cascading impacts.
- Task 3
 - Vulnerability formula developed by adjusting weights and benchmark values.
 - Desktop analysis, composite exposure score on GIS. No additional modeling included.
 - Survey of stakeholders to assess adaptive capacity of assets.
- Task 4
 - Approach to developing strategies for state agencies would benefit from additional details.
 - Prepared for qualitative or quantitative data.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- 12 months
- QAQC process integrated.
- Proposed to complete draft vulnerability assessment report by September for contingency planning if earlier tasks require more time.
- No tasks are marked for May, June, and July.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Thorton Tomasetti

DATE: 11/13/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Climate vulnerability assessments, life-cycle resilience, effective communication, multi-hazard area-wide master plans
- Experience with local, state, federal government

• *Project Examples*

- Roux Institute
 - a. Engineering, sustainability, and resilience consulting, climate risk and resilience assessment with current and future natural hazards.
- McKinley Properties Climate Vulnerability Assessment
 - a. Current project evaluating properties for climate hazards and ensure operational continuity.
- Myrtle, Property Flood Risk and Resilience Assessment South Portland
 - a. Property flood risk assessment for current and future risk, objective is to exceed code requirements with resilient design criteria.

2. Subcontractors

• Flycatcher

- Land use consulting, based in Maine, GIS team, nature-based solutions

• Forerunner

- Floodplain management software

• Roux Institute

- Advisory services for data visualization

• GMRI

- Advisory services with Coastal Dynamics Lab

3. Organizational Chart

• 28 staff

• 3 key personnel

- Resilient assessments, engineering, ecological health

4. Litigation

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Thorton Tomasetti

DATE: 11/13/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- "From time to time our firm has been brought into lawsuits involving projects on which we have performed services. Most of these cases involve personal injury / site safety issues, which are not our responsibility. Accordingly, we have often had the cases dismissed as against our firm by filing an affidavit of non-involvement or by speaking with the plaintiff's attorney. In other instances, we decided to contribute towards settlement to avoid litigation costs, expending the time of our key staff, or the risk of an adverse court decision."

5. *Certificate of Insurances*

- Yes

II. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

- Overall Approach
 - Would benefit from improved clarity across all tasks and specific approach.
 - Role of one subcontractor for the external management and maintenance of dashboard on the State's behalf is likely out of scope.
 - Examining exposure trends across asset typologies.
 - Emphasized specialized team for municipal waste and water which are not an emphasis for this RFP.
 - Data framework for continuity and quality control.
- Task 1
 - Standardized data collection templates, support for data reformatting as needed.
 - Map out critical operations with agencies.
 - Incorporating approach for aligning hazards with State asset profile.
- Task 2 and 3
 - Phase 1: Screening framework generalized to identify priorities. Sensitivity analysis using criteria from American Society of Civil Engineers.
 - Phase 2: Vulnerability of specific asset typologies and hazards per agency. Unclear what tool is used for multi-hazard analysis.
 - Incorporating adaptation design into recommendations.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Thorton Tomasetti

DATE: 11/13/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Resilience categories for “low risk”, “investigation needed”, “investigation of resilience viability” are used to indicate where retrofits are needed
- Task 4
 - Would benefit from details about state agency engagement, and specific approach to developing relevant mitigation and adaptation strategies.
- 2. *Implementation – Work Plan*
 - 12 months

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: TRC

DATE: 11/14/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Technical, financial, risk management, environmental and construction services to industry and government clients
- Climate vulnerability assessments, technical knowledge of climate hazards, impacts, mitigation strategies

• *Project Examples*

- MA Executive Office of Labor and Workforce Development
 - a. Evaluated climate-related physical and operational risks and developed strategies to ensure continuity of services, identified facilities potentially at risk under recent and future conditions, evaluated climate induced risks associated with daily operations, developed climate adaptation strategies with roadmap and implementation tracker
- Maine Utility
 - a. Developing a climate change protection plan and climate vulnerability assessment of climate impacts on utility's assets and operations
- Maine Governor's Energy Office and Maine Emergency Management Agency
 - a. Provided subject matter expertise and project management for state's Energy Emergency Response Plan, calculated hazards and vulnerabilities, and responses actions and procedures.

2. Subcontractors

- None

3. Organizational Chart

- 12 key staff, 8 SMEs
- Project manager, emergency management services, technical leads, inventory and climate hazard support
- Emergency response planning, public safety, facility responses, stormwater management, landscape architecture, utility resilience, EJ, property assessment

4. Litigation

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: TRC

DATE: 11/14/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Cover page
- 5. *Certificate of Insurances*
 - Yes

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall
 - Project approach is clear and aligned with RFP scope of work.
 - Applies direct experience with state government and Maine.
- Task 1
 - “Tier 1” and “Tier 2” layers for data collection.
 - Streamlined data collection from agencies, doesn’t overburden agencies with involvement.
 - Data format available as GIS file and as CSV with taxonomy that can be used across state agencies.
 - Risk tolerance and criticality concepts include clear examples for how agencies will assign to their data.
- Task 2
 - TRC already has climate projections and climate processing tool set up for Maine through other project, starting with relevant project knowledge.
 - Recommend three climatic zones, 12 climate stressors, 3 time horizons, 2-3 future scenarios consistent with best practices.
 - Maintain screening level assessment for stressor exposure to assets.
- Task 3
 - Simple and effective approach to scoring on low, medium, high scale.
 - Vulnerability catalog will indicate scores and can be adjusted in real-time.
 - Included clear example of exposure, sensitivity, adaptive capacity scoring rubric from Fairfax County Virginia Risk Assessment.
 - Operational risk score deep dive for agencies.
- Task 4

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: TRC

DATE: 11/14/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Three measures proposed for each asset type/hazard combination.
- Roadmap tracker as “living document” is useful for agencies.
- Examples for facility and operational risks are aligned.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- 12 months
- Includes tasks leads.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: VHB

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Experience with state government agencies, vulnerability assessments, resiliency and adaptation plans across New England, public infrastructure planning for Massport, MBTA, Philadelphia Airport
- Engineers, scientists, planners, and designers

• *Project Examples*

- SMRT, Maine Bureau of General Services, Augusta State Facilities Master Plan
 - a. Assessment of Augusta area infrastructure to align with Maine's 2020 Climate Action Plan goals, priority ranking of risk, recommendations for occupancy, strategy for modernizing buildings
- City of Philadelphia Department of Aviation, Climate Vulnerability Assessment, Climate Adaptation and Resiliency Plan, H&H Resiliency Study, Design Standards
 - a. Vulnerability assessment, climate adaptation and resiliency plan currently under development
- Metropolitan Transportation Plan Resilience Strategy, Orlando, FL
 - a. Strategic long range planning through literature review, compiling best practices, developing climate adaptation and equitable resilience strategies, analyzed datasets to inform resilience strategies and identify vulnerable assets, GIS platform

2. Subcontractors

• *SMRT Architects and Engineers*

- Architecture, mechanical, electrical, and plumbing
- Partnered with VHB on State of Maine Augusta Area Facilities Master Plan, Senior Principal engaged in Maine Climate Council climate risk work

• *Colby College*

- History of collaboration on climate and environmental challenges in Maine

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: VHB

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Computational infrastructure, geospatial analysis library, research assistants and interns, stakeholder engagement
 - 3. *Organizational Chart*
 - 35 staff listed
 - Project management, climate risk and analysis, stakeholder engagement, graphics and deliverables, climate solutions
 - 4. *Litigation*
 - Provided
 - 5. *Certificate of Insurances*
 - Yes
- II. *Proposed Services*
 - 1. *Services to be Provided*
 - Project Understanding
 - Distinction between interagency working group and agency-specific working groups matches scope.
 - MA Port Authority Building example of conditions assessment, framework for criticality, and prioritization of resilience implementation.
 - Task 1
 - Cross-walk analysis of agency climate efforts
 - Colby College students will help validate location and metadata, and supplemental data collection effort.
 - Multi-criteria decision analysis for evaluating asset type importance with agencies. Would need clarification about Bidder's analysis versus additional agency input requested.
 - Deliverables include: crosswalk analysis source document, data collection requirements, asset GIS inventory, MCDA evaluation framework, list of critical asset types and assets by agency, workshops and notes.
 - Task 2
 - Primary climate hazards across three climate zones, hazards organized by condition/impact.
 - Includes workshop for interagency working group to review findings and confirm primary hazards. May not be the most valuable use of state agency time and input.
 - Task 3

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: VHB

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Proposal to use “commit to manage” and “prepare to manage” targets to align with Maine’s existing goals.
- Sensitivity analysis seems to be more dependent on AWG than on external analysis / data.
- Predominantly qualitative risk assessment of probability scores. Intervention analysis developed from the combination of vulnerability and risk assessment scores.
- Task 4
 - Sample categories for agency recommendations with options across three levels of intervention.
 - Holistic approach for addressing individual asset vulnerabilities and systemic resilience.
 - Evaluation will include risk reduction benefits, co-benefits, and cost considerations. Example metrics align with scope.
- Project Management
 - QAQC and progress reports throughout project with cost control and routine monitoring.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- 12 months - Organized biweekly across 26 weeks
- Clarify integration of tasks with college semester timing, and amount of time needed to complete each task.
- Summary of job descriptions reflects distinct responsibilities across each team, but the scale of staff is a concern for the cohesiveness and timeliness of the project.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: VIEWSHED

DATE: 11/18/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Experience with state and local governments, vulnerability assessments
- Landscape architecture, GIS, planning

• *Project Examples*

- VIEWSHED - Casco Bay Regional Shellfish Working Group, Community Intertidal Data Portal
 - a. Data products to support planning and management decisions in intertidal zone, public outreach and user testing for accessible and relevant tools
- Cultivate Geospatial - Architect of the Capitol
 - a. Asset management and prioritization, risk analysis, hazard mitigation, consequence of failure assessments, GIS
- Planning Communities - City of Richmond Climate Vulnerability and Risk Assessment
 - a. Developed GIS analysis of heat and flooding risks to communities, built assets, and natural features, produced StoryMap, video series, graphic handout

2. Subcontractors

• Cultivate Geospatial Solutions

- GIS and asset management, data services

• Planning Communities

- Planning and geospatial services, sustainable and equitable practices for communities

3. Organizational Chart

- 10 staff
- Project manager, GIS analyst, landscape designer/resilience planner, asset management, community planner

4. Litigation

- None

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Yes

II. Proposed Services

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: VIEWSHED

DATE: 11/18/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

1. Services to be Provided

- Overall
 - Clear steps to ensure alignment, establish protocols, assess process and results.
- Task 1
 - Data capture, integration, QAQC documentation included.
 - Agency review for risk tolerance/criticality would benefit from additional details.
- Task 2
 - Would benefit from details about approach beyond RFP content and scope.
 - Climate hazard modeling through simulated projected impacts, provide location-specific risk assessments.
 - Holistic risk management with models that address chronic and acute risks.
- Task 3
 - Vulnerability scoring tool using Weighted Overlay Analysis.
 - Consequence and impact assessment would benefit from distinct approach and explanation.
 - Equity implications for public services.
 - Data visualization includes story map and comprehensive report.
- Task 4
 - Action timeline will include short, medium, and long term actions.
 - Team has experience with strategies from over 100 national and international climate action plans.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- 12 months

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 11/28/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• *Qualifications and Skills*

- Resiliency planning and infrastructure projects across New England, climate scientists with in-house predictive model
- Experience with state agencies and municipal governments, climate change vulnerability assessments, climate hazard mitigation & adaptation strategies, hazard mitigation plans, municipal vulnerability preparedness projects

• *Project Examples*

- MA Executive Office of Energy and Environmental Affairs, Climate Resilience Design Standards Tool
 - a. Developed tool for screening level exposure and risk analysis for state-owned and municipal buildings, infrastructure and natural resources, GIS application
- Town of Chebeague Island Maine, wharf improvements
 - a. Partnered with Woods Hole Group on mitigation and adaptation into infrastructure design, model flood scenarios
- NH Department of Environmental Services
 - a. With SLR Consulting, conducted CCVAs throughout NH for current and future climate change impacts on infrastructure, gathered asset data and assessed adaptive capacity, incorporating vulnerabilities into HMP and asset management platforms
- Previous relevant projects collaborating with at least two of the subcontractors.

2. Subcontractors

• *SLR Consulting*

- Technical consulting such as engineering, environmental assessment, permitting, natural resources management and planning

• *Woods Hole Group*

- Developing Maine Coast Flood Risk Model for MaineDOT, engineering solutions related to climate change planning

• *Siler Climate Consulting*

- Community engagement

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 11/28/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Quantified Ventures
 - Innovative funding and financing strategies
- Consensus Building Institute
 - Stakeholder engagement, Maine Won't Wait, Offshore Wind Roadmap

3. *Organizational Chart*

- 29 staff
- Project management, state asset inventory, climate impact scenarios, vulnerability and impact assessment, climate hazard mitigation and adaptation recommendations, agency engagement

4. *Litigation*

- Included details

5. *Certificate of Insurances*

- Yes

II. *Proposed Services*

1. *Services to be Provided*

- Overall Approach
 - Integration, action-oriented, science-based, adaptable.
 - Methodology aligned with RFP goals.
- Task 1
 - Standardized template to use across agencies for inventory, commitment to data accuracy and completeness.
 - Determine risk-tolerance and criticality, workshops to identify specific needs and vulnerabilities with social vulnerability as a lens.
 - Applying experience from Climate Resilient Design Standards Tool for MA state agencies.
 - Deliverables include: template, compiled asset inventory (excel and GIS), risk tolerance and criticality framework, stakeholder engagement plan, timeline, and materials, bi-monthly steering committee meetings, three agency-specific meetings, two interagency working group workshops
- Task 2
 - Three future planning horizons aligned with Maine Won't Wait. GIS exposure assessment to track shifts over time, Excel categorized by region and planning horizon, focus on usability.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 11/28/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Hannah Silverfine

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Enhanced modeling of marsh migration may be out of scope.
 - Use SHMP to interpret assets for prioritization in adaptation planning.
 - Proposed agency workshops with training sessions on technical information, may not be best use of agency time
 - Task 3
 - Combination of quantitative and qualitative analysis, assess redundancies at system level.
 - Clear example of evaluation criteria for adaptive capacity
 - Proposal for on-the ground observations of sites, would need to set parameters for criticality and need.
 - Vulnerability and risk scores for assets would be combined to prioritize different assets for resiliency improvements
 - Upstream impact and downstream impact distinction for agencies.
 - Conduct agency-specific engagement workshops to discuss climate hazard impacts on operations and assets.
 - Task 4
 - Relevant sample table of potential adaptation strategies.
 - Strong examples included from work supporting other government agencies.
 - Deliverables include: Adaptation strategy recommendations, metrics based approach for agency-specific strategies, cost-benefit analysis that evaluates the financial viability and long-term benefits, draft and final process/Standard Operational Procedure (SOP) for climate integration for agencies, two facilitated workshops, final report summarizing the vulnerability and risk assessment and adaption strategies
 - Project Management
 - Regular calls with project manager and task leads.
2. *Implementation – Work Plan*
- 12 months
 - 1 project manager, multiple task leads
 - Tasks able to take place concurrently

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AARC

DATE: 11/17/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - 19 recent relevant projects
 - Project Manager Dr. Pacia Diaz is listed as based in-state
- Project Examples
 - Demonstrate integration with climate action plans and hazard mitigation plans
 - Most examples include Clearview subcontractor
 -

2. Subcontractors

- Clearview Land Design (Tampa, FL) – experience with high-resolution flood maps, climate impact assessments, and asset vulnerability evaluations in response to future sea-level rise and extreme weather events
-

3. Organizational Chart

- Includes key staff and SMEs

4. Litigation

- None in past 5 years

5. Certificate of Insurances

- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Generally solid approach, cites examples of previous work and relevant resources, but lacking detail about execution in key areas
- Make allowances for site visits that may be necessary
- More detail about how climate scenarios will be developed for various hazards
- Unclear how process actually evaluates vulnerability and generate a vulnerability score
- Would benefit from additional detail for how/how often agencies will be engaged

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AARC

DATE: 11/17/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Gantt chart provided
- list of tasks/deliverables and project staff for each provided

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AECOM

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Currently conducting VA for SMPDC for transportation + climate planning in Kittery
 - MA and NY state agency VAs
 - Project will be led by New England staff
 - Developed MA SHM&CAP
- Project Examples
 - NYS project is highly relevant: "critical agency assets and internal operations, including programs and services"
 - Table of 16 projects that align with multiple RFP tasks

2. Subcontractors

- Aon, Climate Risk Advisory – climate modeling, including wildfire
- World's largest reinsurance broker

3. Organizational Chart

- Detailed with staff/SMEs assigned to each Task
- Highly experienced team

4. Litigation

- Multiple pending and settled lawsuits up to \$10M.
- "None of our current claims could reasonably be expected to have a material adverse effect on ATS or its ability to perform under the contract contemplated by the proposal"

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Includes Task 0 – work plan finalization and kickoff
- Experienced in developing and cleaning building inventories, including consequence ratings
 - Assumes no field work
- Task 2 combines state hazard data with Aon's models, distinguishing between acute and chronic perils

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AECOM

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- hazard list determined during kickoff but proposal assumes all SHMP Tier 1 hazards
 - Task 3 vulnerability screening identifies selected assets for catastrophe modeling
 - plots 5x5 matrix of probability vs consequences
 - screening level of equity impacts (cites consistency w MWW, ESC, SHMP) to access and 8 vulnerable population types (e.g., consequence rating may be increased if facility serves vulnerable population)
 - Task 4 will focus on a smaller group of assets or asset groups that have high vulnerability to climate hazards and/or are high consequence, also include a focus on areas of the state where socially vulnerable communities and vulnerable state-owned assets coexist
 - will select up to 10 priority assets or asset groups to provide more detailed analysis -- two to three detailed mitigation and adaptation options per key asset or asset group, including a relative cost ranking (i.e. \$, \$\$, or \$\$\$), general timeline, and next steps. Uses proprietary Fund Navigator to identify funding sources
 - Generally, thorough understanding of and responsive approaches to project needs and goals. Bidder and sub has extensive experience and knowledge of the work to be done.
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Gantt chart identifies key staff responsibilities by task
 -
 -

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Arup

DATE: 11/19/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - 15yrs in climate and resilience space, 150+ city plans
 - Expertise in risk assessments for natural hazards, exposure modeling, fragility and vulnerability functions.
 - design firm with thousands of engineers, we have an in-depth understanding of building and utility systems design and construction
 - Experience with projects that include large numbers of assets of varying types
 - Project Examples
 - Project 1 – 16 NY Hospitals, current and future vulnerabilities to coastal and stormwater flooding, heat, wind
 - a. 5 members of proposal team contributed to this project
 - Project 2 – Caltrans statewide vulnerability and risk assessment of coastal and inland flooding, wildfire, landslides, coastal erosion/cliff retreat, and subsidence
 - a. One member of proposal team contributed to this project
 - Project 3 – Bath Flood Vulnerability Assessment – GEI
 - a. Two members of subcontractor team contributed to this project
 - b. SCC and GEI collaborated on separate but related project in Bath
 2. Subcontractors
 - GEI – includes Lissa R
 - Siler Climate Consulting
 - Also a subcontractor on another proposal
 3. Organizational Chart
 - Identifies key project staff and SMEs for each task
 - Core team is experienced and participated in example projects
 4. Litigation
 - “no current or pending claims, litigation or arbitration, which are not adequately covered by the firm’s insurance policies”

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Arup

DATE: 11/19/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

5. Certificate of Insurances
 - provided

- II. Proposed Services
 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposes to develop and inland flood model
 - Two approaches to coastal flooding in case ME-CFRM is not completed
 - Will design assessment to be efficiently updated when CFRM data is available
 - Will gather info on asset age, design, state of repair
 - Systems approach to account for cascading impacts from non-state infrastructure where possible
 - Will consider integration with state risk management and capital planning
 - Will take a semi-quantitative approach to VA and risk analysis
 - Embedded values: collaborative model, local partners, capacity building, actionable metrics
 - Task 1 – 1.1 establish steering committee from agencies and affected communities, 1.2 initial methodology workshop, 1.3 develop methodology, 1.4 asset inventory
 - Appreciate the focus on getting the methodology right with steering committee
 - National Structure Inventory to augment MEMA asset data – assume 2500 structures
 - Task 2 – recommend combining present day and 2030 horizons into “near term” and adding a 2070 or 2100 horizon. Benefit to aligning with CFRM for future integration
 - Assumed hazards: coastal and inland flooding, heat, winter weather including snow/ice, wildfire and smoke
 - Hazard info from 2023 SHMP and 2024 STS
 - Review of local VAs and resilience plans
 - 2.1 GEI will develop inland flood models for up to 40 watersheds with assets – based on HAZUS, scenario based for several annual recurrence interval flows (ie, 100-, 200-, 500-yr)
 - a. Acknowledges limitations in this approach
 - b. Approach allows for evaluation of dam failures

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Arup

DATE: 11/19/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- 2.2 If CFRM not available, will estimate coastal flooding from Stillwater levels for 100-yr and 500-yr storms present day and future scenarios based on FEMA flood insurance studies and MCC SLR projections
 - Task 2.3 equity assessment not included in scope but could be added, not clear if this would add to project cost
 - Task 3.2 does include equity assessment of impacts of service interruptions to socially vulnerable communities (SCC, Arup, GEI)
 - Task 4.1 is important to the project and feels underdeveloped compared to the rest of the scope
 - Task 4.2, 4.3 implementation tracking metrics and KPIs, digital dashboard
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Robust structure for meetings and steering committee
 - Detail Gantt chart with organizational roles and review times for GOPIF
 -
 -

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: CLEARResult

DATE: 11/119/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Lists staff that MAY support project
 - Firm's work is energy efficiency and decarbonization.
 - Very new (Feb 2024) acquisition of Energetics, an energy and management firm with experience in vulnerability and resilience
 - 200 engineers and environmental specialists
 - Previous work with multiple state energy offices
- Project Examples
 - Program management for Efficiency Maine – not very relevant but displays firm's footprint in Maine
 - Lake Tahoe Basin project is more relevant
 - NYSERDA program evaluation, including climate vulnerability of programming – modest relevancy

2. Subcontractors

- none

3. Organizational Chart

- Very basic chart, small team

4. Litigation

- Company subject to legal proceedings that "have not materially impacted client work and the Company does not expect the ultimate costs to resolve these matters to have a material adverse effect on Company's consolidated financial condition, results of operations or cash flows"

5. Certificate of Insurances

- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Task 1 is thin on detail. No mention of the asset information sources provided by the RFP. Does not address asset condition

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: CLEARresult

DATE: 11/119/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

and very little detail on how risk tolerance and asset criticality will be determined.

- Task 2 has modestly more detail but still lacks information about what hazards will be evaluated
- Task 3 – generalizations about a complex assessment of vulnerability
- Much of the methodology appears to be drawn from a single previous client project in Lake Tahoe Basin.
- Overall approach is logical but lacks detail on specific activities, data sources, decision points for GOPIF, and potential challenges and limitations. Proposal is overly confident in team's ability despite citing relatively few previous examples that are modestly relevant to this scope of work.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Basic work plan, no Gantt chart. Does not clearly identify intermediate and final deliverables for each Task.
-
-

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte

DATE: 11/20/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Large firm providing services to multiple federal agencies, and states
 - Cites skills honed in FEMA projects. Would prefer to hear more about relevant work for state governments.
- Project Examples
 - Narrative neatly speaks to example project alignment with RFP tasks
 - Projects 1 & 2 are federal/military and significantly larger in scope than this RFP
 - Project 3 is a data/AI project for Broward County, FL.
 - Would prefer to see relevant state projects. Cited projects are adjacent to but unsatisfactorily aligned with RFP.
 - Cited clients seem more technically savvy than many of our state agencies. Education will be key component of this project.

2. Subcontractors

- None listed
-

3. Organizational Chart

- Project team and advisors
- Senior team has less stated experience with climate and vulnerability, though very experienced in complex government environments.
- Project manager and core team members have a FEMA and other federal hazard mitigation backgrounds
- Project advisors have more relevant expertise, still heavy on hazard mitigation. Only one advisor has stated extensive experience in climate adaptation.

4. Litigation

- Firm does not believe that current legal actions “will have a significant impact on Deloitte & Touche’s ability to provide services, or that they will affect our ability to serve our clients.”

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte

DATE: 11/20/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- “Within the past five (5) years, there has been no litigation brought by a state, local, or federal governmental client against Deloitte & Touche related to a Deloitte & Touche services engagement”
5. Certificate of Insurances
- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Three phases
 - Task 1 and 2 to be addressed in parallel
- Generally lacking specific detail. Only modestly builds on RFP.
- Methodology feels very regimented. Would like to see more co-development of methods and decision making with GOPIF and agencies.
- Excel based asset inventory deliverable is a plus for agencies
- Will calculate probable cost of inaction over 40+ years
- Task 1 – risk appetite work with agencies seems thorough and reasonable, but in virtual conversations, would like to see more emphasis on education of agencies, which will be important as this is new subject matter to many state staff.
 - Can develop reports, comms/visual aids as needed – how will these affect pricing and timeline?
- Task 2 lacks transparency. Does not identify which/how hazards will be selected for evaluation. Would have been a good time to solicit input from state, or from SHMP.
- Task 3 would benefit from greater transparency into proposed processes for assessing vulnerability. Even the example of previous work is an unnamed federal organization. Approach to equity integration is equally vague.
- Task 4 is minimally to modestly responsive to RFP. Mentions experience with LEED and Envision standards but would benefit from additional detail about how these might inform recommendations. Mentions, but would benefit from greater detail about, a robust capital planning model.
- Provides Deloitte tools for future work – beyond scope

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- 19-week work period feels short

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte

DATE: 11/20/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- All work to be performed virtually
- Would seek to negotiate certain provisions of state service contract (Riders B and C)
- Basic Gantt Chart
- Deliverables and responsibilities for each task

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ERG

DATE: 11/21/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills

- ERG's Climate and Resilience Solutions group has over 70 climate modelers and specialists
- Developed VT's municipal vulnerability tool.
-

- Project Examples

- MA EMA, Resilient Mass Plan – VA of state agencies and assessment of capabilities and capacities. Survey, risk assessment, workshops
- Supported MWW1 with multiple products
- Climate resilience plan for the Pentagon facility
-

2. Subcontractors

- none

3. Organizational Chart

- Project team members have 5-10 years experience. Most members participated in the MA or VT example projects (Arleen O'Donnell may have been part of the MWW support team?)
- Project Manager has been with ERG for 1 year
- Org chart would benefit from an explanation of the structure. Different leads for tasks is ok but not seeing a clear lead POC for the project and unclear how technical advisors will contribute.
- None of project leads are located in New England

4. Litigation

- none

5. Certificate of Insurances

- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Task 0 Project Management

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ERG

DATE: 11/21/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Multiple opportunities for GOPIF to provide input and feedback on workplan development
 - 4 virtual meetings with agencies throughout workplan
 - Appears that entire project will be virtual
 - Task 1 – will QAQC asset inventory and suggest ways to fill data gaps
 - Includes transportation assets that were expressly not included in RFP
 - Deliverable is an Excel file
 - Task 2 coincident with Task 1
 - Tier 1 natural hazards from SHMP minus non-climate hazards, plus draft list of tier 2 and STS impacts
 - Will ensure projections are compatible with CFRM
 - Time horizon recommendations are not consistent with the RFP
 - Relies on existing data and models, minimal new modeling proposed – will keep costs lower.
 - Task 3
 - Sample methods for evaluating exposure provided. SLR approach would need refinement given high variances in coastal elevations that can occur over the distances suggested
 - Vulnerability score relies on weighted averages, which can be questioned
 - Agency survey plan includes training, office hours, etc. that will be important. Sample survey provided.
 - Equity approach is primarily geospatial, which might miss service impairment impacts that are not geographic in nature.
 - Tasks 3.2, 3.3, 3.4 are moderately underdeveloped
 - Task 4
 - Reasonable, detailed approach
 - Provides sample prioritization criteria
 - Will suggest short, medium, and long term actions
 - Overall, this scope of work is consistent with a low-cost approach – desktop level evaluations, fully virtual process, early-to-mid career project team
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Modest Gantt chart detail, no narrative

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ERG

DATE: 11/21/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Some concern about project management being split among three team leaders – opens opportunities for missed communication and dropped balls

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ICF

DATE: 11/21/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - ICF is conducting a VA for one of Maine's utilities
 - Has an in-house climate analytics tool
 - Experience with VAs for state and local governments
- Project Examples
 - Utility VA in Maine – while the client is unnamed, the hazard modeling should be very similar
 - MWCOG project is useful example showing skill with cascading impacts and interdependencies between institutions and communities – important for assessing ME service impairment impacts. Also demonstrates experience with co-development of methodologies.

2. Subcontractors

- GMRI
 - Will contribute to coastal flood risk modeling (Hannah Baranes) and stakeholder engagement (Gayle Bowness).
 - GMRI is capable but this feels like a light footprint meant to substitute for ICF's lack of presence in Maine.

3. Organizational Chart

- PM is currently working on Hawaii's state-owned facilities VA
- Would benefit to see project team members participation on the example projects
- Basic org chart with leads for each task
-

4. Litigation

- none

5. Certificate of Insurances

- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ICF

DATE: 11/21/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Task 0
 - GMRI to help establish and manage advisory committee – unnecessary, GOPIF can do this
 - Scope of proposed committee feels larger than envisioned by RFP
 - Task 1
 - Taking a typology approach to assets - up to 10 critical and regionally significant asset types – unclear how this informs the rest of the proposal
 - Utilize only existing asset data
 - GMRI to lead stakeholder engagement – unclear what audience – agency staff? Public?
 - Task 2 – generates scenarios from in-house probabilistic and downscaled model that relies on IPCC's CMIP6 model
 - probably cost effective but how would this integrate with CFRM and inland flood modeling Maine will have in the next few years?
 - Up to 10 hazard variables (samples provided), two future time horizons, two emissions pathways
 - Inland flood risk will rely on FEMA FIRMS which we know are out of date
 - Task 3
 - Sample scoring tables provided, how/will the various scores be aggregated?
 - Task 4
 - Relies on quite a bit of input and expertise from GOPIF and agencies
 - Up to 40 adaptation measures and 15 prioritized strategies
 - Generally, feels like a lower-cost approach, though with some proprietary modeling but less consultant expertise applied to Task 4.
 - Would benefit from clarity on several key points, including stakeholder engagement, vulnerability aggregation
 - GMRI's organizational focus and strengths feel somewhat mismatched to this project.
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Gantt chart provided with task leaders and deliverables
 - No narrative

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: IEM

DATE: 11/21/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - IEM and project team are highly aligned with FEMA structures and hazard mitigation approaches
 - Key project team members have previous experiences in FEMA and state/local EMAs
 -
- Project Examples
 - Example projects are all HMP updates. Two include vulnerability assessments.
 - NY example utilizes HAZUS for
 -

2. Subcontractors

- none

3. Organizational Chart

- Basic org chart provided. Would benefit from indication of staff that will support each task
- PM is former SHMO for Kansas
- Day to day lead is Kimberly Anthony

4. Litigation

- Five cases pending for wage disputes or breach of contract

5. Certificate of Insurances

- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Writing style is awkward and vague in places. Concerned that technical reports and products may lack clarity.
- Proposed services touts Bidder's experience frequently but omits critical detail about execution and includes tangential or irrelevant information. For example, Task 2 does not discuss specifically how scenarios will be developed (as required by RFP) but says that it will "provide information on greenhouse emissions to raise

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: IEM

DATE: 11/21/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

awareness" (out of scope). Task 2 would benefit from a more clear and detailed description of the proprietary Integrate Environmental Modeling approach.

- Tasks 3 and 4 are inadequately described
- Mentions evaluation of MaineDOT assets several times, despite this be explicitly excluded by the RFP
- Generally, lack of detail in specific approaches conflicts with the proposal's confidence in the bidder's abilities.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Basic Gantt Chart. Would benefit from assignment of project team members to specific tasks.
- Missing proposed meeting cadence
- No discussion of whether project team would be present in state or if this would be a fully virtual process.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/21/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Academic oriented organization is rooted in research at UC Boulder
 -
- Project Examples
 - Boulder County, CO project is a VA plus siting and design tool
 - DeBary, FL project has relevant tasks. Still in progress.
 - EPA project is interesting but only tangentially relevant due to massive difference in geographic scope and assets type

2. Subcontractors

- Stanley Consultants (sister company) is engineering technical advisor
- Sub's team members include specialties that are not relevant to this scope – roads, bridges, culverts, power generation and transmission.

3. Organizational Chart

- Org chart provided.
- Bios also include the role and task assignments for each team member
-

4. Litigation

- none

5. Certificate of Insurances

- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- On site kickoff
- Despite saying on page 3 that roads are not part of the study, tasks and examples repeatedly appear oriented to transportation assets, which are not included in in the scope of this RFP.
- Task 2

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/21/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Would benefit from more detail on scenario selection, planning time horizons,
 - Task 3
 - VA will be quantitative where possible but augmented by qualitative assessment
 - Would like to see an example of outputs for exposure, sensitivity, and adaptive capacity
 - Task 4 is underdeveloped
 - PA map is at block group level, which will not be as informative in ME because of very rural areas with large blocks
 - Generally, moderately developed proposal, mostly sound approach but missing some key details.
 - Appreciate the in-person meetings but imagine that costs will be higher for repeated travel from Colorado
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- On-site meetings at end of each task, plus monthly project team meetings
 - Detailed Gantt chart with task leads and on-site meetings.
 - Proposal would benefit from identifying specific interim and final deliverables
 -

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Stantec

DATE: 11/22/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• Qualifications and Skills

- PM has worked with Brunswick and South Portland
- Experience team with local and state vulnerability assessments in New England
- Experienced project team, 15+ years each for key staff
- Listed experiences tend to focus on coastal flood vulnerability. Would benefit from additional information on inland flood and other hazards

• Project Examples

- Examples have relevance to the scope of work, would like to see example of state asset VA
- Would like to know if any project team members contributed to example projects

2. Subcontractors

- GMRI Gayle Bowness and Hannah Baranes – advisory role

3. Organizational Chart

- Provided, identifies staff by task
- PM has at least 4 Maine projects
- Missing resume for Deputy Project Manager Danielle Curri

4. Litigation

- “None will have a material effect on the financial position of the company or its ability to undertake this assignment”

5. Certificate of Insurances

- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- In-person kickoff, all other meetings are virtual
- Project tracking spreadsheet, comms plan, project website
- Task 1
 - “Asset archotyping approach” for large numbers of assets of varying types

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Stantec

DATE: 11/22/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- 1-hr meetings with up to 10 agencies to gather asset data
 - Relies on GOPIF/state staff to supplement asset data via mobile app – probably not a realistic role for state agency staff
 - 80-100 archetypes, asset criticality and asset performance criteria
 - Task 2
 - List of 13 suggested hazards, inland/riverine flooding not listed
 - Importantly noted STS's recommendation to "retain temperature projections from IPCC 5th Assessment Report" – will work with GOPIF to select the appropriate GHG scenarios
 - Unclear why bidder is suggesting planning time horizons that are inconsistent with the RFP
 - Task 3
 - Uses proprietary quantitative VA scoring program – used for tens of thousands of assets in Kansas and CT
 - Task 4
 - Detailed approach
 - Overall, very detailed, quantitative approach that accommodates a large number of assets and asset types
 - Some concern that Maine's asset data may not be sufficiently complete and detailed to work within bidder's assessment system
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Tasks 1 and 2 in parallel
 - Gantt chart is detailed with tasks, deliverables and proposed meetings
 - GMRI is identified in Gantt chart but not discussed anywhere in the proposed tasks

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: TetraTech

DATE: 11/22/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• Qualifications and Skills

- Matt Nixon based in Portland, Maine
- Team has offshore wind and hazard mitigation experience
- Several members have climate VA and resilience planning experience.

• Project Examples

- Calif. State University – 23 campuses – moderately relevant
- MBTA project developed a custom quantitative model – less relevant to Maine's VA
- Palm Beach Co. project is the most relevant of the three examples. Ongoing. Uses Hazus, HEC-RAS, and Sea Level Affecting Marsh Model (SLAMM)
- Would prefer to know what team members worked on these projects
 - a. Task 2 and 3 lead worked on LA Climate VA and MBTA project

2. Subcontractors

- none

3. Organizational Chart

- provided

4. Litigation

- “the resolution of any such claims will not have a material effect on its financial position or results of operations”

5. Certificate of Insurances

- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

• Task 1

- Anticipates numerous meetings with GOPIF and agencies to collect asset data and determine criticality, exposure, and risk-tolerance.
- Will identify critical assets within the database

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: TetraTech

DATE: 11/22/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Task 2
 - Relies on existing hazard data and models
 - a. will review up to five assessments to understand hazards (e.g., SHMP, STS report, local VAs, other publicly available models
 - b. “Where spatial or modeling data is not available, hazard exposure indicators (e.g., proximity, projected climate change) will be discussed for a qualitative approach”
 - Up to 5 hazards, presuming flooding (excessive rainfall, snowmelt, riverine), sea level rise (SLR), coastal storm surge, air quality, and wildfire.
 - a. Five hazards falls short of SHMP tier 1 hazards
 - 4 time horizons
 - Task 3
 - Develops a custom quantitative model/formula for calculating vulnerability scores
 - Equity analysis not discussed
 - Task 4 is substantially underdeveloped
 - Overall, proposal is only moderately responsive to RFP.
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Inadequate Gantt chart/project timeline, major gaps of 2-3months in workplan
 - Omits key interim and final deliverables, roles and responsibilities
 -

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ThorntonTomasetti

DATE: 11/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• Qualifications and Skills

- Bidder demonstrates experience with assessing specific sites for climate vulnerability, but not with assessing many hundreds or thousands of sites in portfolio

○

• Project Examples

- Roux Institute - climate risk and resilience assessment considered the impacts of current and future natural hazards including coastal and tidal flooding, seismic activity, high winds, severe winter weather, and extreme precipitation and heat
 - a. resulted in adaptive and performance-based design objectives that go beyond the City of Portland's code minimums for resilient design
- McKinley Properties, FL - assessment of vulnerabilities related to flooding and other climate hazards.
 - a. objective of the project is to provide actionable guidance that enhances the resilience of assets, ensuring a swift return to operations after an adverse event
- Commercial residential shorefront property in South Portland
- Example projects have moderate relevance to the hazards, but do not demonstrate an approach that would manage a large and varied asset portfolio like the State of Maine's

2. Subcontractors

- Flycatcher – “Maine-based environmental and land use consulting company that provides field survey, strategic siting and permitting support, and environmental inspection services to developers, municipalities and utilities”

- Examples of work focus on environmental permitting which is of less relevance to this RFP

- Forerunner – “comprehensive floodplain management software platform”

- Unclear why this tool is necessary for the scope of services

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ThorntonTomasetti

DATE: 11/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Advisors – Hannah Baranes, GMRI and Roux Institute
 - Unclear that this set of subcontractors provides relevant services. Regulatory review is not part the scope and RFP does not require floodplain management software
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - Large project org chart, would benefit from description of how SMEs and PMs support the 4 tasks of the RFP
 - 4. Litigation
 - “From time to time our firm has been brought into lawsuits involving projects on which we have performed services. Most of these cases involve personal injury / site safety issues, which are not our responsibility. Accordingly, we have often had the cases dismissed as against our firm by filing an affidavit of non-involvement or by speaking with the plaintiff’s attorney. In other instances, we decided to contribute towards settlement to avoid litigation costs, expending the time of our key staff, or the risk of an adverse court decision.”
 - 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - provided
- II. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
 - Bidder locates project in the context of many State of Maine plans, initiatives, and offices
 - Bi-weekly project calls
 - Task 1
 - Proposes a very detailed asset inventory – concerned that this might not be feasible with existing agency info and within state’s project budget
 - Task 2
 -
 - Task 3
 - Public and proprietary data sources inform GIS model
 - 2 phases: Screening framework to identify priority facilities, detailed assessment of key assets by agency
 - Does not elaborate on the process for an equity assessment
 - Task 4

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ThorntonTomasetti

DATE: 11/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Underdeveloped, would benefit from examples or suggested recommendations and metrics
 - Generally, proposal seems at times confused on whether this is a broad assessment of hundreds of facilities, or a detailed asset level engineering assessment – I'm doubtful that both are possible within the state's project budget
 - Poorly organized proposal – section numbering does not align with RFP task numbering
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Gantt chart includes partners/subcontractors but their roles are largely undescribed in the services to be provided section

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: TRC

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Founded as Traveler's Research Center to support weather risk analysis for insurance company
 - Strong example projects
 - Well regarded principle in charge
 - Over 200 employees in Maine but unclear if project team is in-state
 - Current/previous work for GEO, BGS, ME CDC, MEMA
- Project Examples
 - MA Exec Office Labor & Workforce Development – highly relevant assessment climate-related physical and operational risks, succinctly described workplan and deliverables
 - CMP Climate Protection Plan (in progress) – will give bidder strong sense of hazards and climate projections in Maine
 - GEO/MEMA Energy Emergency Response Plan – assessed vulnerabilities in Maine's energy sector, does not mention use of forward-looking climate projections

2. Subcontractors

- none

3. Organizational Chart

- PIC and technical lead, Dr. Rawlins Miller, 28 yrs experience, is a climate scientist, and director of TRC's Climate Risk and Resilience practice
- PM, Jonah Garnick, 8yrs experience. According to LinkedIn only 4mos with TRC, <3yrs consulting experience, not previously a PM.
 - Will be closely supported by PIC
- Tech Lead Stacy Williams, 18yrs experience, worked on MA Office of Labor Project
- Same team supporting CMP climate hazard selection will work on this project

4. Litigation

- "No past or current litigation against State of Maine in past 5 years"
- "Adequately insured for ... pending claims and lawsuits"

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: TRC

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

5. Certificate of Insurances
 - provided
- II. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
 - Strong project management plan
 - SharePoint site, tracker, weekly or bi-weekly meetings
 - Recommend in-person kickoff and 2-3 in-person deliverables meetings
 - PIC and PM to participate in biweekly calls – big plus that PIC will be so actively involved
 - “Throughout this process, it is understood that the GOPIF is responsible for coordinating engagement with participating state agency representatives.”
 - Task 1
 - 2 tiers of asset data
 - “would like to understand from GOPIF if it is possible to have agencies provide fields for Tier 2 data” – shows firm understands that asking agency staff for time and effort is not a given.
 - Thorough descriptions of risk tolerance and criticality
 - Task 2
 - Same team supporting CMP climate hazard selection will work on this project
 - a. Climate projections for 10 hazards already produced
 - Hazards align with SHMP
 - combination of quantitative qualitative results that are based on the latest science.
 - 3 geographic climate zones
 - Time horizons align with RFP, may suggest additional 2070 period
 - Solid approach to integrating disadvantaged communities into exposure analysis
 - Task 3
 - Will provide several options for scoring rubrics
 - Equity evaluation approach provided – equity score included with consequence score

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: TRC

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Two deep dives per agency – bidder provides extensive sample questions agencies about operational risk
 - Task 4
 - Develop roadmap/tracker for each agency – format?
 - Considers both facility risks and operational risks, aligned with RFP
 - Overall, bidder has a very strong understanding of processes for assessing vulnerability, is conscientious of working with state government, and makes a very thorough response to RFP and description of services to be provided
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Gantt chart provides task leads and descriptions of their roles.
 - Deliverables identified for each task in the scope of services section

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: VHB

DATE: 11/26/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Multiple projects for State of Maine, mostly DOT
 - PMs each have 10+ years experience, with multiple projects for State of Maine and in New England, including vulnerability assessments and resilience plans
- Project Examples
 - Augusta State Facilities Master Plan – unclear from summary that a climate vulnerability assessment was part of the scope. However, demonstrates that firm has knowledge of many of the critical facilities for the State.
 - PHL Airport VA and Climate Resilience Plan (in progress) – probably high relevance but thin on detail and approach
 - MetroPlan Orlando Transportation Plan Resilience Strategy (in progress) – moderate relevance

2. Subcontractors

- SMRT architects and engineers
 - Contributed to Augusta Master Plan
 - Primarily advisory role. Some unclear technical roles.
- Colby College
 - Advisory
 - role for students indicated by org chart
 - thoughtful to include students but ultimately beyond scope and, since this assessment is primarily for internal audiences

3. Organizational Chart

- Complex org chart
- Summary of job/task descriptions for team members helpful

4. Litigation

- Pending cases provided

5. Certificate of Insurances

- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: VHB

DATE: 11/26/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Project management (“Task 5”)
 - Interagency Work Group will be audience for 7 workshops for input and review of deliverables
 - Agency-specific Working Groups – for each agency?
 - a. Agency surveys to be administered by Colby faculty and students
 - Might be overly meeting-intensive, especially for agency staff, with two types of work groups and workshop series
 - Biweekly project team meetings
- Task 1
 - Crosswalk with existing work: MDOT VA, DMR Coastwise, DEP Maine Adaptation Toolkit
 - Students will help fill gaps in inventory data – perhaps cost effective but what effect on timeline and data quality?
 - Risk tolerance and criticality criteria suggested. Will include MSVI.
- Task 2
 - Will utilize STS’s 3 climate zones
 - Lists of hazards, impacts, and potential data sources.
 - No climate modeling
- Task 3
- Task 4
 - VHB will concentrate on planning areas related to infrastructure and land, while SMRT will focus on buildings
 - Students “will contribute creative and innovative perspectives”
 - Would benefit from examples of mitigation and adaptation strategies.
 - Sample metrics provided.
- 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Gantt chart with GOPIF and AWG meeting schedules
 - Detailed roles and responsibilities for project team and subs
 -

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Viewshed

DATE: 11/26/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Viewshed is a small landscape architecture, GIS, and planning firm based in Maine. Staff of 11.
- Project Examples
 - Intertidal Data Portal – not relevant to scale and tasks of RFP
 - Architect of the Capitol – example provided to demonstrate experience of subcontractor CGS. Moderately relevant to RFP
 - City of Richmond, VA climate vulnerability and risk assessment -

2. Subcontractors

- Cultivate Geospatial Solutions provides technical consulting to governments. Strong GIS skills. Does not describe any climate VA skill for firm.
- Planning Communities – vulnerability and resilience planning experience mostly at the local government level. Smaller number of state projects, none appear to match RFP scope.

3. Organizational Chart

- Viewshed is project management lead but subs will be primary leads on all Tasks.
- Some concern that the scope of assets in this project and may overwhelm a smaller project team that is not familiar with state-level VAs.

4. Litigation

- Viewshed has no litigation in past 5 years

5. Certificate of Insurances

- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Task 1

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Viewshed

DATE: 11/26/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- Moderately developed task. Lacking specific detail of how gaps in asset data might be addressed with state agencies. Risk tolerance and criticality assessment basically restates the RFP without detail.
- Task 2
 - Again, moderately developed task. Would benefit from more detail on which primary hazards and secondary impacts would be included, more detail on scenario modeling approach, etc.
- Task 3
 - Bidder makes frequent reference to “aligning with FEMA’s risk model” without describing their understanding of it and approach to alignment.
 - Would benefit from additional detail on Consequence and Impact Assessment and on Adaptive Capacity and Resilience Analysis, and additional specifics on how equity assessment feeds into the vulnerability assessment.
- Task 4
 - Bidder largely restates the RFP without providing a robust approach to developing mitigation and adaptation strategies beyond a literature review.
- Overall, underdeveloped tasks that do not sufficiently describe processes and methodologies. Outputs seem focused on creating visualizations rather than a feasible, defensible methodology. Not clear from proposal that the bidder has the skill for the vulnerability assessment.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Prefers to meet in person when possible
- Gantt chart identifies which task the subcontractors will contribute to, but there is no discussion of how Viewshed will manage the team and ensure smooth integration of subs’ work, especially where both subs are contributing to the same task (e.g., Tasks 2 and 3 rely on components from all subs).

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 11/26/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - MA Div. of Capital Asset Mgt – adaptation and resilient design guidance for 8,000 state assets
 - Subcontractors have various muni resilience planning projects in Maine, but not state-level
 - Project Examples
 - RMAT siting and design tool – development of underlying hazard data is relevant to VA; project is relevant to Maine's Phase II project
 - Chebeague Is. Stone Wharf improvements – modeling future SLR and storm surge. Modest relevancy to RFP.
 - NHDES – currently conducting VAs for municipal WWTPs and related infrastructure. Developed an exposure, sensitivity, and adaptive capacity scoring framework to determine a vulnerability score. Relevant to this RFP
 2. Subcontractors
 - CBI - engaging with a broad range of state agencies
 - Siler Consulting will support Task 3 equity analysis
 - Quantified Ventures will support Task 4 in estimating costs and financing mechanisms
 - SLR Consulting will support all tasks with expertise in inland flooding and resilience strategies
 -
 3. Organizational Chart
 - Large and complex team that will require attentive project management. Some concern that this team is overly complex for the scope of this project, which may lead to miscommunication.
 - Team members have experience across several of the example projects
 4. Litigation
 - “not been involved in any litigation that would adversely affect our performance on your projects”
 5. Certificate of Insurances

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 11/26/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Significant resources devoted to engagement – some of which may be beyond scope
- Task 1
 - Will create a pre-populated template “to be used across agencies”, “agencies will be tasked with reviewing assets populated in the template, to confirm the data is accurate, and updating the list to include any additional state assets”
 - a. Would benefit from additional detail about level of effort expected from agencies
 - b. Would benefit from additional information on “quality control measures”
 - Bidder says they will draw on MA experience for risk tolerance and criticality assessment but would benefit from more detail or examples of how this important step would occur
 - Bidder will seek to understand how climate vulnerable groups might be impacted – we might prefer to think about socio-economically vulnerable or disadvantaged groups more generally than “climate vulnerable”
 - Neat idea to establish working groups by asset type (e.g., buildings, infrastructure, land), would want to understand this better
- Task 2
 - Hazards and tier 2 cascading impacts drawn from SHMP
 - Planning horizons framed differently than RFP but largely align – would benefit from explanation of this difference
 - Coastal flooding analysis assumes availability of and access to WHG data from ME-CFRM
 - a. Coastal marsh migration and habitat assessment is beyond scope
 - b. Concern that delays in the ME-CFRM development may cause delays in this project if relying on that for coastal hazards analysis

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 11/26/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Brian Ambrette

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future

- FEMA FIRMs and Hazus for inland flooding plus riverine and pluvial flooding exposure
 - Detailed approaches to assessing exposure provided for flooding and heat, not provided for other hazards like wildfire
 - Task 3
 - Adaptive capacity assessment requires on the ground observations by state agency staff – probably not feasible for more than a handful of assets for each agency.
 - Equity implications assessment is underdeveloped and relies heavily on agency input
 - Will prioritize key assets for further study
 - Task 4
 - Provides examples of types of adaptation strategies and actions, and planning horizons
 - Bidder says they will “advocate for nature-based solutions”. We don’t want advocacy, we want objective recommendations.
 - Approach to cost-benefit analyses and “financing and policy lens” is substantially underdeveloped and would benefit from additional information
 - Mostly solid approach to recommendations, with a few gaps.
 - Overall, approach to tasks is comprehensive and mostly complete, but somewhat overbuilt and team is perhaps too complex for project to be executed cleanly – engagement is heavy and may be a burden on agency staff (too much input required from working groups); some hazard assessments (marshes, for example) are beyond scope; long lists of deliverables for each task.
 - Provides unsolicited options for additional work
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Basic Gantt chart provided
 - Would benefit from inclusion of the complex schedule of meetings, work group meetings, etc. from the table on page 8
 -
 -

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AARC Consultants LLC

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Involved in assessing vulnerabilities of municipalities assets nationwide
 - 19 recent climate vulnerability assessments of infrastructure assets and system services
- Project Examples
 - Water Utility Resilience Assessments
 - a. 36 all-hazard, Risk and Resilience Assessment
 - Oil and Gas Weatherization Resilience
 - a. Provided tech assistance and input on RRC's weatherization rulemaking
 - Resilient Florida Grant Vulnerability Study
 - a. Address impacts of flooding and sea level rise that the state of Florida faces
 - b. Coordinating and compiling inventory of critical assets
- Otay Climate Adaptation and Resilience Plan
 - Climate change risk and impacts using scenarios
 - Developing a Climate Adaptation and Resilience Plan

2. Subcontractors

- Clearview Land Design
 - 15 years of experience using geospatial and flood modeling techniques

3. Organizational Chart

- Scientist, project resilience professional, planner & lead facilitator, civil engineer, GIS Analyst (subcontractor), two support staff

4. Litigation

- None in the last 5 years

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Provided

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Approach consists of a multi-step approach
 - Data collection
 - Climate analysis

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AARC Consultants LLC

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Vulnerability assessment
- Adaptation plan
 - Result of work published via a report
- 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Work completed in November 2025

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AECOM

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Office in Portland, Maine
 - Worked with municipalities throughout Maine
 - Ongoing project with Southern Maine Planning and Development Commission
 - AECOM recently completed climate vulnerability assessments for 35 of New York State’s agencies
 - Project Examples
 - New York State Agency Climate Vulnerability Assessments and Climate Adaptation Planning
 - a. Assessments include Department of Environmental Conservation, Office of General Services, the Office of Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation, and the Department of Transportation.
 - b. Identifies the ways that current and projected climate change impacts can affect each agency’s ability to carry out its mission successfully.
 - MBTA Red Line Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment (CCVA)
 - a. CCVA looked at exposure of Red Line stations, maintenance yards/facilities, and tracks to climate stressors (extreme temperatures, heavy precipitation, and inland flooding)
 - Portsmouth Naval Shipyard Floodplain and SLR
 - a. Has been experiencing flooding and wanted to understand the potential impacts of future conditions flooding on the structures and infrastructures,
 2. Subcontractors
 - Aon
 - Provide climate modeling capabilities for climate impact scenarios
 - Reinsurance broker for physical climate risk
 3. Organizational Chart

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: AECOM

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Principal in charge, quality manager and technical reviewer, project manager, climate adaptation & nature-based solutions, public sector/natural catastrophe climate modeling
 - Task leads
 - Technical support – 13 people
4. Litigation
 - Yes
 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes
- II. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
 - Develop an inventory of state assets through a GIS-based database. Asset would be given a rating – 1 to 5.
 - Conduct screening-level assessment. Asset will be given a rating based on a scale of 1 to 5 that indicates the degree that asset would be impacted from an event. Assets will be further evaluated using catastrophe models
 - Recommend mitigation and adaptation options such as stricter building codes to protect against flood or wind impacts, increasing stormwater capacity, etc.
 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - December – January

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ARUP

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• Qualifications and Skills

- Directly supporting more than 150 city climate and resilience plans worldwide. Resilience services focus on assessing climate and natural hazard impacts, managing risk, designing mitigation measures
- Worked recently with MDMR on State's Living Shoreline Pilot Program
- Worked with many Maine municipalities

• Project Examples

- NYC Health and Hospitals
 - a. Understanding their climate risks and identifying strategies to increase the resilience of their facilities in a changing climate
- California DOT
 - a. Analyzes the vulnerability of caltrans-owned or operated infrastructure to current and future climate.
- City of Bath
 - a. Assess and mitigate flood risks along Kennebec River

2. Subcontractors

- N/A

3. Organizational Chart

- 19 people
- Project leadership (2), risk assessment (4), engagement and governance (2), Inland flood model and local knowledge (5), SMEs (6)

4. Litigation

- No current or pending claims, litigation or arbitration, which are not adequately covered by the firm's insurance policies

5. Certificate of Insurances

- Yes

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ARUP

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Develop inventory of state assets
 - Propose to use National Structure Inventory to support development of the asset inventory database.
 - Develop climate impact scenarios for multiple hazards across the state
 - Assume key climate hazards will be included in this assessment – coastal flooding, inland and riverine flooding, extreme heat, winter weather, wildfire and wildfire smoke
 - Hazard data informed by hazard plans
 - GEI will develop an inland flood model to assist with this screening-level risk assessment
 - Propose to use FEMA Hazus software to perform scenario based modeling
 - Use ME-CFRM if available
 - Tables that represent thresholds for various hazard assets
 - Screening level assessment
 - Establish risk metrics
 - Prepare a technical methodology
 - Mitigation and Adaptation Options
 - “high impact”
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 11 months

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: CLEARresult

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Energy efficiency and decarbonization services in North America
 - Project Examples
 - Efficiency Maine’s Residential Energy Efficiency Programs
 - a. Promotion of energy efficient products sold to contractors at distributor locations and customers at retail locations.
 - Climate Change Infrastructure Resilience Analysis and Adaptation Strategies for the Tahoe Basin
 - a. Assessed vulnerability of transportation, telecommunications, energy and waste/water infrastructure
 - b. Used a risk-based qualitative ranking framework to prioritize vulnerabilities
 - Planning for Resilience Across NYSERDA’s Programs
 - a. Recommendations for identifying and responding to climate challenges that could affect NYSERDA
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - N/A
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - 5 people
 - Management (3), Engineering, Consultant
 - 4. Litigation
 - Company has been subject to legal proceedings, claims and litigation arising in the ordinary course of business.
 - 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Inventory of state assets
 - Mutli-agency engagement strategy

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: CLEARresult

DATE: 11/18/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Screening level assessment
 - Geospatial analysis to identify areas of heightened risk and rank those risks
 - Create a vulnerability matrix
 - Use MSVI, Justice40
- 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Complete the work by November 30th, 2025

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte

DATE: 11/19/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Serving the SOM for more than 15 years
 - Has conducted critical infrastructure risk assessment at all levels of government and across sectors
 - DHHS – developed asset database and facilitated risk analysis for critical infrastructure protection
 - Project Examples
 - Department of Navy
 - a. Gathered data on over 49,000 assets within the DON
 - b. Developed an inventory guide
 - US Coast Guard
 - a. Operationalize risk appetite
 - b. Leveraged data collected in the register to identify overarching risk themes, document associated risk context, risk scoring severity rationale, and risk response strategies for inclusion in the Risk Profile
 - Broward Metropolitan Planning Organization (MPO)
 - a. Using Geospatial and AI tools to enhance monitoring and decision-making capabilities related to climate impacts
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - No
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - 12 people
 - Project managers, core delivery team, project advisors
 - 4. Litigation
 - No litigation within the past 5 years
 - 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Deloitte

DATE: 11/19/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Inventory of state assets
 - Choose a format that is user friendly and easily navigate
 - Excel inventory to store and manage the asset data
 - Geospatial Mapping and spatial data
 - a. Pinpointing exact locations and overlaying with spatial data on climate hazards
 - Potentially distribute survey to state agencies asking them to 'tier' their assets or asset types based on a set of criteria
 - Risk appetite and tolerance
 - GIS maps and visualizations
 - Climate impact scenarios
 - Use reports and work with state agencies and others to identify natural hazard concerns
 - Scenario register – outline a set of future climate impact scenarios of greatest concern for SOM.
 - Screening level assessment of vulnerability
 - Execute on risk analysis framework by assessing the likelihood and consequence of climate scenarios identified in Task 2. Risk exposure = likelihood x consequence
 - Could use a heat map to illustrate the relative vulnerability
 - Climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options
 - Framework of adaptation solutions could include a combination of grey/green infrastructure, nature-based solutions, asset retrofits, and non-structural protection measures.
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Hold a bi-weekly meeting with all project advisors to get their insights and input on deliverables
 - Asset inventory developed between Month 1 and the first half of Month 2

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Eastern Research Group (ERG)

DATE: 11/19/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Local presence in Maine
 - Staff include climate scientists, adaptation and resilience experts, economists, communications professionals...
 - Completed over 30 projects conducting hazard analysts and developing adaptation strategies for EPA, NOAA, USACE and state and local governments related to climate change and resilience.
 - Developed Vermont's Municipal Vulnerability Indicator Tool
 - Project Examples
 - Massachusetts Emergency Management Agency
 - a. Supported in developing ResilientMass Plan
 - b. Worked with state agencies and partners to develop hazard mitigation and climate adaptation actions to address the risks specific to sectors, peoples, etc
 - GOPIF
 - a. Four volumes of reports for Maine's 2020 Climate Action Plan
 - b. Analyzed the vulnerability of the SOM to future impacts of climate change
 - c. Develop adaptation strategies based on priority climate vulnerabilities in Maine
 - Department of Defense, Washington Headquarters Services (WHS)
 - a. Asset level vulnerability assessments to climate hazards
 - b. In progress
 2. Subcontractors
 - None
 3. Organizational Chart
 - 9 people
 - Project manager, technical lead, infrastructure expert, technical advisor (2), support (4)

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Eastern Research Group (ERG)

DATE: 11/19/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

4. Litigation
 - None
 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes
- II. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
 - Mentioned 1-hour virtual monthly meetings
 - 4 State Agency workshops
 - Inventory of state assets
 - Excel document and have agencies review for final review
 - Climate impact scenarios
 - Starting with Tier 1 Natural Hazards List from 2023 MSHMP
 - Provide an upper and lower bound on possible future changes
 - Screening level assessment of vulnerability and impact for each asset
 - Calculate a vulnerability score
 - Take into consideration vulnerability, equity and adaptive capacity
 - State agency survey
 - a. Provided an example survey
 - Identify “hotspots” of vulnerable state assets located in underserved communities
 - Climate hazard mitigation and adaptive
 - Develop evaluation criteria before projects are identified
 - Use a similar approach as the one they did for the Commonwealth of Massachusetts
 - Strategies include short-, medium, and long-term actions
 - Incorporate already identified and developed adaptation and resilience strategies
 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Figure shows Task, month, and engagement workshop
 - Will be completed by November 2025

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ICF

DATE: 11/19/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Completed first sea-level rise impact assessment for the U.S. EPA in early 1980s
 - ClimateSight – in-house climate analytics tool that leverages dynamic parallel computing and Amazon Web Services
 - Project Examples
 - Confidential Utility in Maine
 - a. Climate change vulnerability study for the company’s assets and operations to identify vulnerability to critical climate change hazards
 - b. Results of vulnerability analysis were used to develop tailored resilience strategies to address specific vulnerabilities within the company’s system.
 - Metropolitan Washington Council of Governments (MWCOG)
 - a. Community vulnerabilities relevant to military installations
 - b. Identify achievable, effective strategies to increase resilience in the community and installations
 - i. Threats of flooding, extreme heat, winds, ice storms, population growth, and encroachment
 - Town of Tremont Climate Vulnerability
 - a. Gulf of Maine Research Institute (GMRI)
 - b. Report that assesses potential impacts to Tremont
 - c. Uses both quantitative data and the Tremont Community’s local knowledge to identify climate impacts
 2. Subcontractors
 - GMRI
 3. Organizational Chart
 - 17 people
 - Project manager, task leads, technical experts
 - Two people with GMRI

STATE OF MAINE INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: ICF

DATE: 11/19/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

4. Litigation
 - None
 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes
- II. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
 - Regular check-ins with GOPIF's core team throughout the project
 - Inventory of state assets
 - Conduct stakeholder interviews
 - a. Participants to share their experiences regarding key state assets to assess
 - Impact scenarios
 - Climate hazard intensity and likelihood projects will be downscaled to Maine, when available
 - ClimateSight – in-house tool
 - Primary and secondary hazards or cascading impacts
 - Could do wildfire projections
 - Give lots of examples of where they will get the data from – most of those being local sources
 - Climate projects will be used to complete a screening-level geospatial climate hazard exposure analysis
 - Screening level assessment
 - Exposure, sensitivity, adaptive capacity
 - Score each asset with a relative exposure rating on a scale ranging from no exposure to high exposure
 - Stakeholder engagement interviews
 - Recommended climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options
 - ICF will conduct a literature review on additional adaptation options and consult internal experts
 - GMRI will lead facilitated discussions with advisory committee
 - Time horizon – short, medium, long; Category – engineering, nature-based, policy; Cost; metrics – track improvements
 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Work will be completed by November 2025
 - Unclear on what the X's mean - stakeholder engagement?

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: IEM

DATE: 11/22/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• Qualifications and Skills

- For more than 39 years, IEM has supported the nation's most significant disaster mitigation, preparedness, and recovery efforts.
- Managed over \$277 billion of federal assistance from various sources and programs, including FEMA and funding from State, Local, and other sources
- Serving SOM since 2008 – MEMA, Waldo County, Portland airport and Northern Maine Regional Airport

• Project Examples

- New York State and New York City Emergency Management
 - a. Demonstrated that they can work on a tight timeline
 - b. State hazard mitigation plan – integrated climate smart resiliency planning, statewide building codes, state risk maps
 - c. Performed vulnerability assessments for each hazard on their state assets throughout the process
 - d. Individual models for coastal, inland flooding and coastal storms
- Chittenden County, Vermont
 - a. Updated the 2017 Multi-Jurisdictional All Hazards Plan
 - b. Built upon strategies from existing plan while also updating strategies to address needs and concerns of approaching development
- Delaware Emergency Management Agency
 - a. Supported the development of Delaware State Hazard Mitigation Plan
 - b. Researched and included future conditions related to climate change and potential vulnerability to their assets

2. Subcontractors

- No

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: IEM

DATE: 11/22/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

3. Organizational Chart
 - 14 people
 - Program manager, Project manager, subject matter expert, planning team, geospatial, support
 4. Litigation
 - Yes - Provided a list of litigation
 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes
- II. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
 - 27 major disaster declarations in Maine
 - Range of experts
 - Develop sharepoint site, storymap, dashboard
 - Map areas of vulnerability and concern
 - Utilize FEMA Hazus 6.1 Risk Assessment Tool to estimate damage from the hazards
 - Maps and data analysis can be used to overlay areas of known vulnerabilities or important community lifelines
 - Inventory of State Assets
 - Use Tier system that was established in the MSHMP
 - Mentions transportation facilities (page 6)
 - Ongoing collaboration with universities, research institutions, and federal agencies – is this outside of scope of work?
 - Climate impact scenarios
 - Incorporate existing data
 - Stakeholder engagement will play an essential role in the process – company plans to involve local communities, gov agencies, industry representatives – outside of scope of work.
 - Screening level assessment
 - Combo of quantitative and qualitative methods
 - Provide vulnerability assessment examples
 - Mitigation and Adaptation Options
 - Mentions input from numerous stakeholders

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: IEM

DATE: 11/22/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Mentions that IEM can assist in identifying funding sources, prioritizing projects, allocating resources based on the findings – outside scope of work?
- 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Ends in November 2025

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 1. Overview of Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - 20 years of pioneering climate resilience research
 - Rail analysis methodology
 - Wide range of experts
 - Worked on many Federal projects as well as municipal level
 - Project Examples
 - Boulder County, Colorado
 - a. Quantify vulnerability and prioritize adaptation projects based on cost, equity, and other factors. Included multiple climate scenario projections through 2050. Developed an interactive level GIS-tool.
 - City of DeBray, Florida
 - a. City wide assets inventory – included transportation, water facilities, and private and public facilities.
 - b. Project is ongoing
 - U.S. EPA
 - a. Quantified the cost of a variety of climate change adaptation options on the rail and road system of the continental US.
 - b. Three adaptation scenarios
 2. Subcontractors
 - Stanley Consultants
 - Function as technical advisors for key tasks on the project
 - Support Task 1 and Task 4
 3. Organizational Chart
 - 15 people
 - Project manager, project scheduler, QA/QC, Climate vulnerability and resilience, engineering technical advisory
 - May not need the Bridges, Culverts, and Roads staff as those assets are not part of the scope of work
 - Different people will lead different tasks
 4. Litigation
 - None
 5. Certificate of Insurances

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Resilient Analytics

DATE: 11/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Yes

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- On-site meeting for the Kickoff
- Inventory of state assets
 - Divide data into two categories – assets directly owned or leased by the state and those not under state ownership but that possess the potential for cascading effects
 - Compile dataset on low-income and disadvantaged communities
 - What format will the database be in?
- Impact Scenarios
 - Hazard data will be divided into two categories – primary and secondary
- Vulnerability and impact assessment
 - Vulnerability will be evaluated and scored using indicators for exposure, sensitivity, and adaptive capacity
 - Exposure score based on each asset type
 - Sensitivity will be established for each asset type
 - Adaptive established for each asset
 - Three scores will be combined to create asset-level, agency level and state level vulnerability scoring metrics.
 - Use MSVI to identify socially vulnerable populations
- Adaptation strategies
 - Short-, medium- and long-term actions
 - Reference federal and state guidance on climate adaptation for public infrastructure
- Could benefit from more detail
- On-site meetings at the conclusion of each task

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Ends in December
- Has in-person meetings noted for specific tasks
- Different leads

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Stantec

DATE: 11/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Located in Topsham, Maine
 - Extensive experience with the completion of flood impacts evaluations and strategic planning
 - Wide range of experts
 - Team includes Maine based people
 - Vulnerability Assessment Program
 - a. Provides asset-level vulnerability scores based on exposure, sensitivity, and adaptive capacity to multiple climate scenarios.
 - b. Program uses ArcGIS, Python and SQL
 - Strong focus on flooding
 - May develop resilience strategies that involve initial phase of easily implemented methods and than longer-term methods
 - Stantec has developed a risk assessment approach based on ISO standards
 - Project Examples
 - Connecticut DOT
 - a. Develop a resilience improvement plan to help the agency identify climate-related vulnerabilities and prioritize solutions across its surface transportation network, while maximizing funding from BIL
 - b. Identify projects using a risk-based evaluation of transportation assets that are vulnerable to climate change
 - c. Sounds like the project is ongoing
 - Massachusetts Department of Conservation and Recreation
 - a. Planning level climate change vulnerability study – 200 miles of roadways, calculating the physical and economic impacts of current and future flooding. Vulnerability scores were calculated for each parkway segment based on exposure, sensitivity, and adaptive capacity attributes.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Stantec

DATE: 11/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- b. Included engagement with staff and stakeholders
 - o Eastern Michigan University
 - a. Provided an assessment of flood risk posed to EMU's assets
- 2. Subcontractors
 - Gulf of Maine Research Institute
 - o Municipal Climate Action Program
 - o Serve as an advisor to Stantec
 - o GMRI will meet with Stantec's project team to provide expertise and insights for project communications, stakeholder engagement, and incorporate local knowledge into the vulnerability assessment process and deliverables.
 - o Review climate science and provide recommendations on projected sea level and storm impacts for the SOM
- 3. Organizational Chart
 - 18 people
 - Project manager, project manager deputy, principal in-charge, senior technical advisor, teams for each task
- 4. Litigation
 - "There are no unsatisfied judgments or arbitration awards outstanding against Stantec. Stantec does have some legal proceedings, lawsuits, or claims pending."
- 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Task 1 and 2 overlap
- Develop and maintain a Project tracking spreadsheet of action items with associated start and completion dates, etc.
- Initial in-person kickoff meeting with subsequent meetings held virtually.
- Create a project website for sharing data
- State Assets Inventory
 - o 2-hour meeting to review asset descriptions drafted from the initial data request

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Stantec

DATE: 11/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Hold 1-hour calls with GIS specialists for up to 10 state agencies
 - Using Survey123 to collect missing data
 - Archetype analysis
 - a. Provide examples
 - Risk tolerance in the form of a risk matrix
 - Climate Impact Scenarios
 - Use existing information from MSHMP
 - Tier from State HMP will serve as a starting point
 - 5-point scale
 - a. Example of 5-point sample asset archetypes
 - Asset vulnerability risk assessment
 - Quantitative vulnerability assessment scoring program. Tool utilizes ArcGIS, Python, and SQL to automate large scale vulnerability assessments and provide interactive spatial results
 - a. Used this at Kansas Department of Transportation and Connecticut DOT
 - Vulnerability is defined as a function of exposure, sensitivity and adaptive deficit $V = E \times S \times D$
 - Provide sample vulnerability matrix
 - Risk assessment – risk = likelihood of climate hazard occurring * consequence/Severity of the Impact
 - Hazard mitigation and adaptation
 - Prioritize actions using four primary measures: relevancy, resiliency, cost, and time
 - Short-, medium-, and long-term actions
 - a. Use existing plans to develop those actions
 - Single spreadsheet
 - FEMA Community Lifelines and the asset archetypes to develop projects by typologies
 - Actions could include gray, blue, and green projects, and policy options
 - Didn't mention GMRI throughout services provided
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 12 months
 - GMRI is mentioned in Task 1, 2, and 3 but was not discussed in Task 1 and 2 above in the services provided section

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Tetra Tech, Inc

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Qualifications and Skills
 - Provides consulting, engineering, and technical services
 - Extensive experience developing VAs, adaptation plans, and community resilience strategies in New England.
 - Vulnerability assessments experience with municipalities, counties, and state agencies
 - Provided a list of extra relevant examples
- Project Examples
 - California State University Chancellor's Office
 - a. Develop a state-wide resiliency framework to support the 23 individual CSU campuses in improving the resiliency of infrastructure systems
 - b. Relevant to Task 2, 3, 4
 - Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority
 - a. Conduct a comprehensive risk assessment to identify vulnerabilities and mitigation strategies in the face of climate change
 - b. Developed a custom quantitative model to assess the vulnerability of transportation assets across various hazard scenarios
 - c. Involved a literature review, discussions with MBTA staff, geospatial analysis
 - Palm Beach County, Florida
 - a. Address environmental hazards and climate risks exacerbated by climate change and sea level rise
 - b. Deliverable – provide a comprehensive roadmap for Palm Beach County to enhance resilience
 - c. Drafting framework to evaluate and rank adaptation and mitigation strategies
 - d. Developed a community outreach plan
 - e. Ongoing project

2. Subcontractors

- No

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Tetra Tech, Inc

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

3. Organizational Chart
 - 13 people
 - Project manager, task 1 lead, climate and vulnerability assessment SMEs, hazard and vulnerability lead, resilience/mitigation GIS support, energy resilience planner, energy consultant
 - Project manager, has extensive experience in Maine
 4. Litigation
 - Yes
 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes
- II. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
 - Inventory of state assets
 - Create a portfolio-building database with information about existing conditions
 - Mentions coordinating with municipalities to obtain CPRG information – outside scope of work?
 - Request as-built drawings for key assets within the scope
 - Climate impact scenarios
 - Obtain quantitative and qualitative data regarding what hazards pose the greatest risk to the identified assets
 - Review/use existing studies that have been completed - “up to 5”
 - Spatial hazards will be presented in the ArcGIS Online platform to illustrate the hazard displays relative to State assets and discuss the scenarios available for inclusion in the assessment.
 - Screening level assessment
 - Score based on sensitivity, exposure, and adaptive capacity
 - Will work with GOPIF to customize the vulnerability formula by adjusting the weights of each component
 - Presented via a brief white paper (up to 10 pages)
 - Distribute an adaptive capacity survey to provide to stakeholders so that the adaptive capacity for each asset can be evaluated for input into the assessment.
 - Mitigation and Adaptation options

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Tetra Tech, Inc

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Consolidate work from previous tasks into a cohesive SOM Vulnerability Assessment Report
- 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - Completed by November 2025
 - Draft VA Report in September 2025
 - Would benefit from a more detailed breakdown of Task
 - There is a gap from Jan - April and then April – August. Some work may need to happen simultaneously.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Thornton Tomasetti, Inc

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• Qualifications and Skills

- Utilize the expertise of our Portland, Maine office and draw upon resources from over 1,700 professionals
- Experience conducting campus wide and municipal wide vulnerability assessments
- Includes an advisory panel – flycatcher, The Roux Institute, Gulf of Maine Research Institute, Forerunner
- Forerunner is a comprehensive floodplain management software platform that helps governments streamline flood risk assessment and community resilience planning
- Identified a potential opportunity for there to be a collaboration with Forerunner to maintain climate database after project completion

• Project Examples

- The Roux Institute At Northeastern University
- McKinley Properties Portfolio Climate Vulnerability Assessment, Winter Park Florida
 - a. Focused on vulnerabilities related to flooding and other climate hazards in the region
 - b. Identify properties at risk from flood and other climate related threats
 - c. Project was recently kicked off
- 9 Myrtle, Property Flood Risk and Resilience Assessment
 - a. Provided flood risk assessment services to a waterfront property that experienced flooding during a January 2024 storm
 - b. Existing flood vulnerabilities at their property and established both code-required and projected design flood elevations for future flood resistant retrofits

2. Subcontractors

• Flycatcher

- Maine-based environmental and land use consulting company
- Understanding environmental and permitting requirements

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Thornton Tomasetti, Inc

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Provided multiple examples of the work they have done in Maine – most of it focused on environmental and permitting requirements
- Forerunner
 - Comprehensive floodplain management software platform that helps governments streamline flood risk assessment and community resilience planning
- GMRI
- Roux Institute
- 3. Organizational Chart
 - Roughly a team of 26 people
 - Principal in charge, advisory team, deputy project manager, project manager, climate resilience team
- 4. Litigation
 - Yes
- 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- “We will collaborate with MDOT to evaluate the already assessed risks posed to DOT-owned culverts”
- Brief bi-weekly project calls to coordinate progress and discussions
- Inventory of state assets
 - Provides examples of standardized asset inventory data and prioritization of asset types by department
 - Useful design life
 - a. Integrate climate data projections that align with the anticipated lifespan of assets allowing for materials and systems to be selected based on their expected performance.
 - Develop a structured index system of classifying acceptable levels of downtime for each asset or service and establish recovery objectives for hazard survivability and continuity of operations
 - Thorough engagement with state agencies
- Impact scenarios

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Thornton Tomasetti, Inc

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Identifies primary natural hazards affecting Maine assets
 - In identification and evaluation – will ensure a hazard layer for water depth, flow velocity, and debris load
 - Data will be sourced from federal, state, and local agencies
 - For high resolution flood vulnerability assessments, there is an opportunity to collaborate with Forerunner to ensure accuracy and precision in mapping flood risks
 - Provided a list of key data sources
 - Screening level
 - Vulnerability score, impact or consequence, adaptive capacity, equity implications for service interruptions
 - Screening will be conducted using a multi-hazard analytical model that integrates both public and proprietary data sources to inform our GIS model.
 - Screening framework will be conducted in two phases
 - a. 1 = GIS-based analysis
 - i. Establish engineering-informed criteria to support both immediate and long-term adaptation strategies
 - b. 2 = screening framework involves a detailed and targeted vulnerability assessment for priority assets identified in phase 1.
 - Findings will be presented through asset score cards, map interfaces, and dashboards
 - Mitigation and adaptation
 - Short-, medium-, and long-term actions
 - Would benefit from more detail
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Completed November 2025

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: TRC

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - TRC has grown to over 7,300 employees nationwide in over 150 offices, including three in Maine
 - Supported numerous vulnerability system-scale assessments
 - Project Examples
 - Massachusetts Executive Office of Labor and workforce Development
 - a. Evaluate climate-related physical and operational risks and developing strategies to ensure their continuity of services
 - b. Identified LWD facilities potentially at risk to climate hazards under recent and future conditions
 - c. Conducted a series of interviews with department staff and a comprehensive review of existing written programs across the EO to assess its polices, plans, and organizational structure.
 - d. Developed a wide range of strategies
 - e. Deliverable = climate adaptation strategy roadmap and implementation tracker
 - f. Cost estimates, time horizons, mitigation steps
 - Central Maine Power
 - a. Working with CMP to develop its climate change protection plan
 - b. Conducting a VA that evaluates climate impacts on the utility's assets and operations
 - c. Using findings TRC will develop a plan that will include an array of resilience measures to address moderately and highly rated climate risks
 - Maine Governor's Energy Office via MEMA
 - a. State's energy emergency response plan
 - i. Living blueprint for members of the state's energy emergency response team

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: TRC

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

2. Subcontractors
 - N/A
 3. Organizational Chart
 - 10 people
 - Subject matter experts may be called upon to advise the principle in charge and project manager
 - Principle in charge, project manager, emergency management services advisors, 4 task leads, inventory support, climate hazard and mitigation support as well as subject matter experts if needed
 4. Litigation
 - Provided
 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes
- II. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
 - 200 in-state employees in three permanent office locations
 - Project sharepoint site for sharing resources, data, deliverables, and project management artifacts
 - Develop a tracker for keeping track of task status
 - Option of virtual, hybrid, and in-person meeting
 - Recommend at least one of the project management meetings and two to three key deliverable presentations be held in-person
 - Inventory of state assets
 - Use SHMP
 - Gather further detail – they give examples
 - Up to 20 additional GIS layers from agencies
 - Risk tolerance
 - Criticality
 - “For example, if an asset has an extremely low criticality value and extremely high vulnerability, it will not be prioritized for additional screening”
 - Climate impact scenarios
 - Experience with developing climate stressors through work conducted with CMP
 - Inhouse climate processing tool

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: TRC

DATE: 11/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Create a preliminary climate stressor matrix
 - Columns will include those identified in the SHMP
 - Conduct a literature review of existing climate assessment and hazard mitigation planning
 - Breaking the state into three zones
 - Up to 12 climate stressors
 - “middle of the road” and “fossil fuel intensive scenarios”
 - May add an additional social or economic layer
 - Screening level assessment
 - Scoring matrix
 - Asset scoring
 - Develop 2 deep dives per department
 - Climate hazard mitigation and adaptation options for the state and individual agencies
 - Range of timeframes, scales, and costs
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 12 months
 - Tasks 1 and 2 overlap

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: VHB

DATE: 11/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

- I. Organization Qualifications and Experience
 - 1. Overview of Organization
 - Qualifications and Skills
 - Over 2,000 employees across 30 locations including in Maine
 - Offices located in Augusta, South Portland, and Westbrook
 - Experience working with state agencies
 - Civil engineering, transportation planning, environmental, water resources, coastal engineering, GIS and Data Analytics, internal graphic team
 - Faculty from Colby College will play a key role in this engagement
 - a. Mentioned Cobly as a place to hold events and workshops
 - Project Examples
 - SMRT, Inc/Maine Bureau of General Services
 - a. Development of a plan focused on meeting the objectives of Maine’s 2020 Climate Action Plan
 - b. Team toured nearly 2 million square feet of building and infrastructure assets, spread over 305 acres, to assess their condition and vulnerability
 - c. Established a priority ranking for each structure assessing risk
 - City of Philadelphia Department of Aviation
 - a. Conducted a Climate Vulnerability Assessment at PHL for the City of Philadelphia’s DOA
 - b. Outlines vulnerabilities, details the research, analysis, and stakeholder engagement effort
 - c. Climate Adaptation and Resiliency Plan
 - i. Identify high-criticality assets as a way to prioritize key investments
 - ii. Currently under development
 - MetroPlan Orlando
 - a. Address climate hazards impacting its transportation network and diverse communities

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: VHB

DATE: 11/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- b. Prepare a literature review
 - c. Analyzed federal, state, regional, data sets
 - 2. Subcontractors
 - SMRT Architects and engineers
 - Maine-based integrated team of 130 architects, engineers, interior designers, planners
 - Conducted a multi-campus vulnerability and risk mitigation study for the department of veterans affairs
 - Senior principal and architect is engaged in MCC
 - Colby College Environmental Studies program
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - 31 or so people
 - Principal-in-charge, project manager, deputy project manager, climate and risk analysis, stakeholder engagement, graphics and deliverables, climate solutions
 - Most likely wouldn't need structures, transportation or water resources folks
 - Some of the Team members have been involved in the example projects
 - 4. Litigation
 - Provides list of pending litigation
 - 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes
- II. Proposed Services
 - 1. Services to be Provided
 - Proposes to establish a project specific interagency working group on climate vulnerability and risk reduction
 - Include agencies with lead by example coordinators
 - Proposes 7 interagency working group workshops
 - Agency-specific working groups workshops – 5
 - VHB will engage GOPIF on a biweekly basis
 - Inventory of state assets
 - Collect publicly available geospatial data from the Maine Office of GIS and other sources provided by GOPIF
 - Will be Intergrated into ESRI ArcGIS

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: VHB

DATE: 11/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Faculty and students from Colby College will also undertake a supplemental data collection effort
- Review state assets first at the asset type level and then at the individual asset level
- Assess each asset type for general criticality through a multi-criteria decision analysis
- Incorporate MSVI
- Climate impact scenarios
 - Reference existing maine literature/plans
 - Confirm primary climate hazards organized by maine's three climate zones
 - Identify secondary hazards
 - Could benefit from more detail
- Screening-level assessment
 - Will work with AWGs to determine the degree to which all identified critical state assets with the primary climate hazards specific to their region
 - a. Results in exposure scores (1-5) for each asset
 - Collaborate with the AWGs to assess the sensitivity of each critical asset to its primary hazards
 - a. Scores range from 1-5
 - Engage AWGs in assessing the adaptive capacity of each asset
 - a. Scores range from 1 –5
 - Average the exposure and sensitivity scores to calculate potential impact scores and than combine them with the adaptive capacity score to get a vulnerability rating.
 - Assigning probability and consequences scores both ranging from 1 to 5.
 - a. Consequences scores will be assigned based on qualitative assessments
- Mitigation and adaptation
 - Co-develop tailored risk reduction strategies and actions with the IWG and AWGs
 - Quantitative-qualitative evaluation based on risk reduction, co-benefits, and cost
 - VHB will focus on infrastructure and land, SMRT = buildings, Colby College = creative and innovative perspectives

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: VHB

DATE: 11/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Draft a final report
 - QA/QC
 - Monthly progress report will be submitted
- 2. Implementation – Work Plan
 - 12 months
 - Includes AWG and IWG meetings
 - Gantt chart doesn't show who is doing what task

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Viewshed

DATE: 11/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• Qualifications and Skills

- Experience in Maine with State and Local government
- Architecture, GIS and Planning firm based in Yarmouth, Maine
- Staff of 11
- Backgrounds in landscape architecture, community planning, public engagement, GIS analysis, visual resource assessment, 3D modeling, graphic design, and land use permitting

• Project Examples

- Casco Bay Regional Shellfish Working Group
 - a. Develop the community intertidal data portal – collection of data products that support planning and management decisions in the intertidal zone
 - b. Each application synthesis both statewide and local data
 - c. Extensive stakeholder engagement
- Architect of the Capitol – Cultivate Geospatial
 - a. Responsible for the maintenance, operation, development, and preservation of 16.5 million square feet of buildings and more than 450 acres of land throughout capital hill
 - b. Onboarding of asset data specifications
 - c. Includes risk analysis, hazard mitigation, and consequence of failure assessments.
- City of Richmond, Virginia – Planning communities
 - a. Climate vulnerability and risk assessment process for the city of Richmond.
 - b. Developed an extensive GIS analysis of heat and flooding risk to communities, built assets and natural features to understand how climate change is impacting Richmond communities and assets.

2. Subcontractors

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Viewshed

DATE: 11/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Cultivate Geospatial Solutions
 - Providing technical consulting services for government organizations
 - GIS and asset management solutions for their clients
 - Provide GIS services, data services, asset management
- Planning Communities
 - Delivering socially and environmentally responsible planning and geospatial services
 - Wide range of staff disciplines
- 3. Organizational Chart
 - 9 people (combination of Viewshed and the two consultants)
 - Project manager, engagement & visualization lead, asset management lead, climate assessment lead.
- 4. Litigation
 - No litigation in the past 5 years
- 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Deliverable = final report
 - For each task there will be a separate deliverable
- Meet in-person whenever feasible
- Inventory of state assets
 - GIS-based inventory of Maine's state assets
 - Viewshed will collect and review all existing publicly available resources
 - Viewshed will work with State agencies to define asset risk tolerance and criticality – how?
 - Create interactive dashboards
 - Final report for Task 1
- Climate impact scenarios
 - Time horizons – present day, 2030, and 2050
 - Develop a climate risk profile for Maine
 - a. Integrate existing climate data
 - Identify secondary hazards and cascading impacts

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Viewshed

DATE: 11/29/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Geospatial tools to simulate projected impacts of climate hazards
 - Flexible rapid assessment is a tool that will provide a quick assessment of asset data layer.
 - Provide interactive workshops with GOPIF and State agency partners
 - Screening level assessment
 - Aligning with FEMA's risk model
 - Develop a vulnerability scoring tool using weighted overlay analysis incorporating variables such as asset condition, hazard exposure, and service criticality
 - Mentions using national and maine indicators for equity considerations
 - Deliverable will be a Storymap
 - Mitigation and adaptation options
 - Short-, medium-, and long-term actions
 - Costs
 - "Strategies from over 100 national and international climate action and response plans"
 - a. Sources/examples to support that claim
 - Develop a comprehensive mitigation options model to evaluate adaptation strategies – outside scope of work?
 - Present work in a final workshop
 - Project lead will meet with GOPIF on a biweekly basis
 - Re-states what is in the RFP but does not provide further explanation
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- 11 months
 - Would benefit from providing the task lead and deliverables
 - Concerns with having multiple leads from different firms

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 12/02/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

• Qualifications and Skills

- Climate resilience as top priority and company wide initiative
- Been evaluating and designing resilient and low impact components for infrastructure and building projects throughout New England
- Involves climate modeling, design, adaptation, mitigation and sustainability, risk and vulnerability assessments, design guidelines, planning, stakeholder engagement
- More than 5,000 projects throughout new England
- 52 communities in Maine
- Knowledge of regional infrastructure and state agency operations
- Draw from work done in Massachusetts for SHMCAP
 - a. Contributed to CCVA also
- Worked with Department of Conservation and Recreation in Massachusetts
 - a. Focused on their 480 properties and facilities
- New Hampshire Department of Environmental Services
 - a. To help NH better understand the impacts of climate change on their infrastructure
- Massachusetts division of capital asset management and maintenance portfolio of 8,000 vertical assets for their vulnerability to climate impacts
- Experience with local communities
 - a. Chebeague Stone Wharf Improvement Project
 - b. Damariscotta Waterfront District
 - c. Boothbay Harbors working waterfront area
- Experience with developing models/tools
- Map coastal flooding will use locally available data and coastal modeling from Woods Hole Group

• Project Examples

- Massachusetts Executive Office of Energy and Environmental Affairs

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 12/02/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- a. Developed a tool for conducting screening level exposure and risk analysis for state-owned and municipal buildings, infrastructure, etc. and climate resilience design standards
 - b. Incorporates priority populations
 - c. Interactive GIS based application
 - d. Included robust public engagement
 - Town of Chebeague Island
 - a. Weston and Sampson and Woods Hole Group
 - b. Refining its planned improvements to Stone Wharf – incorporating climate mitigation and adaptation into infrastructure design
 - New Hampshire Department of Environmental Services
 - a. Weston and Sampson and SLR Consulting
 - b. Conducted CCVAs throughout NH
 - c. Assets included wastewater treatment facilities, pump stations, siphons, collection system infrastructure, drinking water treatment plants, etc
 - d. Proposes measures to build resilience into infrastructure
 - e. Developed an exposure, sensitivity, and adaptive capacity scoring framework to determine vulnerability score with a uniform approach
- 2. Subcontractors
 - SLR Consulting
 - 470 employees
 - Range from engineering, planning, landscape design, permitting, environmental assessment
 - Two of the folks have worked on the example projects
 - Woods Hole Group
 - 100 employees
 - Leverage applied science and forward-thinking engineering with advanced field measurement and satellite remote sensing capabilities
 - Siler Climate Consulting
 - Facilitate climate plans, projects, and programs that realize the transformative potential of climate action while addressing the underlying structure and systemic

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 12/02/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Quantified Ventures
 - Pioneering organizations to design, capitalize and scale investible solutions that improve wellbeing of people and the planet
 - Consensus Building Institute (CBI)
 - Working at the forefront of collaboration and conflict resolution, helping generate breakthrough results on tough social, environmental, and economic issues
 - 30 professional staff including in Maine
 - Unsure what value is added through 5 subcontractors
 - 3. Organizational Chart
 - At least 20+ people
 - Project manager, QA/QC manager, different task lead for each task, agency engagement lead
 - Shows the use of subcontractors in the organizational chart
 - 4. Litigation
 - Provided litigation claims/history
 - 5. Certificate of Insurances
 - Yes
- II. Proposed Services
1. Services to be Provided
 - Listed projects that are relevant to the RFP including subcontractors
 - Shared templates for asset inventory and analysis, educational presentation, shared digital workspace
 - Steering committee with inter-agency working groups, workshops
 - Inventory of state assets
 - Draw from existing documents – MNHMP, MWW, Maine Risk Map, etc
 - Start with asset categories included in Maine Risk Map
 - Use MSHMP
 - Work with stakeholders from state agencies to further gather data
 - Create a standardized template to be used across agencies
 - Develop a framework for risk tolerance and asset criticality

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 12/02/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- a. During workshops with agency will explain the assessment criteria
- Leverage experience in developing criticality scenarios from past experience
- Social vulnerability metrics, such as those from the CDC's social vulnerability index will be incorporated
- Steering committee will be encouraged whether and when additional stakeholders and organizations could be included in working groups
- Consolidated into a central database
- Develop a series of workshops and informational materials
- Steering committee – meet every other month, virtually or in-person
- Interagency working groups – held virtually, 90 minutes
 - a. Three thematic WG
- Compiled list of asset inventory in excel and GIS format
- Climate impact scenarios
 - Use 2024 Maine Climate Council Scientific and Technical Subcommittee Report and climate change projections
 - Use a broad range of climate hazards that apply to multiple state agencies
 - Assess vulnerabilities for Tier 2
 - Future planning – near-term, mid-term, and long-term
 - GIS based approach
 - a. Track shifts
 - Concerns that the proposed work is outside the scope of work for the RFP
 - Proposes workshops and presentations with agencies
 - a. CBI and Siler will work with state agencies
 - b. WHG and SLR would develop methodology
- Screening level assessment
 - Vulnerability, exposure, sensitivity, and adaptive capacity
 - Apply both quantitative and qualitative analyses
 - Provided other sensitivity and adaptive capacity measures
 - Risk (R) = Probability x Consequence
 - Under the equity section, it is heavily focused on agency engagement
 - Provided upstream and downstream impacts

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202409168

RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

BIDDER NAME: Weston & Sampson

DATE: 12/02/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Sierra Millay

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Department of Transportation

- Mitigation and adaptation
 - Recommend structural and non-structural adaptation strategies for high-priority assets and system services specifically identified as most vulnerable
 - Use nature-based solutions whenever possible
 - Provided a detail table that shows potential adaptation strategies
 - Listed adaptation strategies – policy, retreat, protect, accommodate
 - Subcontractor will evaluate a range of potential funding and financing pathways to achieve stated goals and enable agencies to mobilize resources more efficiently
 - Two facilitated workshops
 - Proposed follow-on tasks that are not included in the proposed budget
2. Implementation – Work Plan
- Completed project by next November
 - Shows task lead for each task
 - Overlap between task 1, 2, and 3



STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy
Innovation and the Future

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Hannah Pingree
Director

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of
State Assets

I, Hannah Silverfine accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Handwritten signature of Hannah Silverfine

11/1/2024

Signature

Date



**STATE OF MAINE
Governor's Office of Policy Innovation
and the Future**

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Hannah Pingree
Director

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets**

I, Brian Ambrette accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Governor's Office of Policy Innovation and the Future. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Brian Ambrette', written over a horizontal line.

Signature

11/8/2024

Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Bruce A. Van Note
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202409168
RFP TITLE: Climate Vulnerability Assessment of State Assets

I, Sierra Millay accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Transportation. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Signed by:
Sierra Millay
7350553D5BE8434...

11/12/2024

Signature

Date