

State of Maine
Master Score Sheet

RFP# 202408157					
Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual					
Bidder Name:		Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.	Fuss & O'Neill, Inc.		
Proposed Cost:		\$220,024	\$289,000		
Scoring Sections	Points Available				
Section I: Preliminary Information	Pass/Fail	Pass	Pass		
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	55	45	45		
Section III: Proposed Services	20	15	17		
Section IV: Cost Proposal	25	25	19		
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>85</u>	<u>81</u>		

Award Justification Statement
RFP# 202408157- Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

I. Summary

The Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) has sought proposals for updating the Storm Water (SW) Manual. The SW Manual primarily focuses on post-construction stormwater management best management practices (BMPs). The manual is frequently used in the context of state-level permitting of land development projects.

DEP requested professional services to accomplish the major objectives:

- a. Update the content of the SW Manual in accordance with Best Available Information to provide effective guidance for regulatory compliance,
- b. Improve the format of the SW Manual for better end user experience.

II. Evaluation Process

The RFP guidelines and best practices set forth by the State's Procurement Services have been followed in the evaluation process. The evaluation team members firstly completed their independent individual evaluation of the submitted proposals in the light of the RFP. Secondly, the evaluation team held three remote meetings via Teams on 12/18/24, 12/27/24, and 1/13/25 for the consensus evaluation of the proposals. The evaluation team completed its consensus notes and scored the Comprehensive Environmental Inc. (CEI) proposal on 12/18/24. The evaluation team completed its consensus notes on and finalized the score for the Fuss & O'Neill Inc. (F&O) proposal on 1/13/25 after reviewing the additional clarifying information and files provided by this Bidder.

The evaluation team consisted of three professionals who are subject experts in the field of stormwater management. The evaluation team members are intimately involved with the content and day-to-day use of the current SW Manual. The evaluation team also has significant experience of evaluating similar proposals.

III. Qualifications & Experience

Both Bidders received the same score under the qualifications and experience section and proposed to have the University of New Hampshire Stormwater Center (UNHSC) as their subcontractor. UNHSC is the only organization specialized in stormwater

research, development, education and outreach in New England. The evaluation team briefly reviewed the two example projects of Bidders: Massachusetts Stormwater Handbook by CEI, and Connecticut Stormwater Quality Manual by F&O. Both manuals were well done, and they met the expectations of the evaluation team.

IV. Proposed Services

F&O identified specific issues for each topic area mentioned in the RFP and presented them in the proposal. Furthermore, F&O proposed to develop a short survey to seek input from the Workgroup on the preliminary identified topic areas. The evaluation team considered these elements, which exceed the RFP requirements, and scored the F&O proposal accordingly.

V. Cost Proposal

Total cost of F&O proposal was higher than that of CEI proposal: \$289,000 versus \$220,024. Total cost of the CEI proposal was split between CEI and its subcontractor as follows: 84% (CEI) and 16% (UNHSC). The CEI project team's total effort was 1,588 hours in their proposal. The evaluation team used the scoring formula given in Part V.B.3 of the RFP to score the cost proposals. The CEI proposal received 25 points given that it was the lowest submitted cost proposal.

VI. Conclusion

Both Bidders are demonstrably qualified to provide the services sought by DEP. Overall cost of the CEI proposal was the reason that their proposal scored higher than the F&O proposal.



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner**

January 30, 2025

David Roman, P.E.
Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.
41 Main Street
Bolton, MA 01740
(508) 281-5160
droman@ceiengineers.com

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202408157, Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

Dear David Roman:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection for the Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Kerem Gungor", followed by a horizontal line extending to the right.

Kerem Gungor, P.E.
RFP Coordinator & Senior Environmental Engineer
Bureau of Land Resources
Maine Department of Environmental Protection
(207) 830-1002
kerem.gungor@maine.gov

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner**

January 30, 2025

Erik Mas, P.E.
Fuss & O'Neill, Inc.
1550 Main Street, Suite 400
Springfield, MA 01103
(413) 333-5466
Erik.mas@fando.com

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP #202408157, Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

Dear Erik Mas:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection for the Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual. The Department has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Department is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Department will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Department and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Department is executed. The Department further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Kerem Gungor', followed by a horizontal line extending to the right.

Kerem Gungor, P.E.
RFP Coordinator & Senior Environmental Engineer
Bureau of Land Resources
Maine Department of Environmental Protection
(207) 830-1002
kerem.gungor@maine.gov

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157
RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual
BIDDER: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.
DATE: 12/18/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Environmental Protection
Name of RFP Coordinator: Kerem Gungor
Names of Evaluators: Jeff Dennis, Kerem Gungor, David Waddell

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	55	45
Section III. Proposed Services	20	15
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	25
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>85</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

DATE: 12/18/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

The forms were properly filled out and signed by the Bidder.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

DATE: 12/18/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	55	45

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Overview of the Organization

- Three early career professionals are the key technical team that will do the writing. The other team members will be in an advisory/oversight role. We have concerns regarding the experience of the key technical team regarding stormwater BMP design and implementation.
- The Bidder submitted two relevant projects: NH Stormwater Manual, and MA Stormwater Handbook projects. We have briefly reviewed the draft MA Stormwater Handbook which is available on the MassDEP website for public comment.

II. Subcontractor

- The University of New Hampshire Stormwater Center (UNHSC) is highly qualified. The Subcontractor will be putting in one hour as opposed to every four hours put into the project by the Bidder. It would be better if UNHSC put more time into the project, specifically Tasks 3 and 4.

III. Organizational Chart

- The Bidder has provided a reasonable organizational chart that conforms to the RFP requirements.

IV. Litigation

- The Bidder reported one open litigation case. The litigation is unrelated to the scope of this project.

V. Licensure/Certification

- Professional engineer licenses of four team members have been provided.

VI. Certificate of Insurance

- The Bidder is insured up to \$2 million.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

DATE: 12/18/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	20	15

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. SERVICES TO BE PROVIDED

- The Bidder’s submission aligns well with the RFP.

- Task 1. Project Management and Administration:
 - The information provided here is satisfactory.
 - The Bidder disproportionately budgeted 118 hours for the optional memo work associated with the public comment (Task 1.C). Most of those hours could be used for Task 2.

- Task 2. Scope of Work Finalization:
 - The Bidder allots insufficient time for Task 2 considering the importance of this task.

- Task 3. Draft Revisions to the Manual:
 - The Bidder’s original idea given in the “Note” section of this task: submit two drafts is well received.
 - The Bidder will hire a graphic designer to draft the new figures, which is well received by the team.

- Task 4. Final Revisions to the Manual:
 - We find this submission satisfactory.

II. IMPLEMENTATION – WORK PLAN

- The Bidder has submitted a reasonable work plan.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

DATE: 12/18/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	x	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$220,024	x	\$220,024	x	25 points	=	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

- The cost proposed for Task 1.c seemed high to the evaluation team.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER: Fuss & O'Neill

DATE: 1/13/2025

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Environmental Protection

Name of RFP Coordinator: Kerem Gungor

Names of Evaluators: Jeff Dennis, Kerem Gungor, David Waddell

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)	X	
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	55	45
Section III. Proposed Services	20	17
Section IV. Cost Proposal	25	19
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>81</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER: Fuss & O'Neill

DATE: 1/13/2025

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

The forms were properly filled out and signed by the Bidder.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER: Fuss & O'Neill

DATE: 1/13/2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	55	45

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. Overview of the Organization

- In the original proposal, there were eight team members assigned to the “Stormwater Manual Revisions” task in the project team organizational chart. In the updated organizational chart sent to the RFP coordinator, Tom Ballestero (UNHSC) was added to the group that will undertake the “Stormwater Manual Revisions” task. In the detailed cost proposal, all project team members (21 people) will work on Task 3. Two project team members (Bengtson and Hayden) will do most of the work under Task 3; however, they are not included under the related task in the organizational chart. The evaluation team was concerned about the inconsistencies between these two documents.
- The overall project team expanded from 14 to 21 people as indicated by the detailed cost proposal (see the original organization chart and the detailed cost proposal).
- Qualifications of the newly added project team members were not provided for the evaluation team’s review: James Andretta, Mat Tavara, Stella Sexton, Cindi Bisset, Eleanor Roberts, and Alex Lopez Del Vecchio.
- The Bidder submitted two relevant projects: CT Stormwater Quality Manual, and RIDOT Linear Stormwater Manual projects. We briefly reviewed the CT Stormwater Quality Manual which is available on the CTDEEP website which went into effect in 2024. We think the Bidder did a good job with the CT Stormwater Quality Manual.

II. Subcontractor

- The University of New Hampshire Stormwater Center (UNHSC) is highly qualified. The level of the Subcontractor’s involvement was not very clear in the original proposal. The Bidder clarified UNHSC involvement in the detailed cost proposal.

III. Organizational Chart

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER: Fuss & O'Neill

DATE: 1/13/2025

- Inclusion of a local engineering firm is a positive aspect of the proposal.
- The Bidder has brought in 7 new people into the project team as shown in the detailed cost proposal. Six of these people are not shown in the updated organizational chart.

IV. Litigation

- Six claims have been filed against the Bidder over the past five years.

V. Licensure/Certification

- We have counted certificate/license submissions for nine team members. Certification numbers were provided for the rest.
- No licensure/certification information was provided for the newly added project team members: James Andretta, Mat Tavara, Stella Sexton, Cindi Bisset, Eleanor Roberts, and Alex Lopez Del Vecchio.

VI. Certificate of Insurance

- The Bidder is insured up to \$5 million, which expires on 12/31/2024.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER: Fuss & O'Neill

DATE: 1/13/2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	20	17

Evaluation Team Comments:

I. SERVICES TO BE PROVIDED

- The Bidder's submission aligns well with the RFP. The Bidder included additional suggestions elaborating on the RFP. Specific suggestions of the Bidder are mentioned below along with the time allocated for specific tasks (see the detailed cost proposal):
- Task 1. Project Management and Administration:
- The information provided here is overall satisfactory. The Bidder estimates 214, 45, 112, and 45 hours for Task 1.a, Task 1.b, Task 1.c, Task 1.d, respectively.
- Task 2. Scope of Work Finalization:
- The Bidder recognizes the importance of Task 2 in the overall success of the project. This is demonstrated by the time allocated for this task: 143, 121, and 156 hours are budgeted for Task 2.a, Task 2.b, and Task 2.c, respectively.
- The Bidder provided a significant evaluation of each topic area mentioned in Task 2 of the RFP and submitted specific issues for each topic area.
- In addition to the RFP requirements, the Bidder proposes to develop a short survey to seek input from the Workgroup on the preliminarily identified topic areas, which is a very good idea.
- Task 3. Draft Revisions to the Manual:
- The Bidder mostly addressed RFP requirements under this task. The Bidder budgets 770 hours for Task 3, which is satisfactory to accomplish the task.
- Task 4. Final Revisions to the Manual:
- The Bidder budgets 173 hours to accomplish Task 4, which is satisfactory.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER: Fuss & O'Neill

DATE: 1/13/2025

II. **IMPLEMENTATION – WORK PLAN**

- The Bidder has submitted a reasonable work plan. The number of hours budgeted for Task 2 constitutes an important cost item.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER: Fuss & O'Neill

DATE: 1/13/2025

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	x	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
\$220,024	x	\$289,000	x	25 points	=	19

Evaluation Team Comments:

- Significant contributors to the proposal cost are Task 1.a and Task 2.
- According to the detailed cost proposal submitted by F&O in response to the evaluation team's request, total cost was split between F&O and its two subcontractors as follows: 64% (F&O), 27% (Acorn Engineering), and 9% (UNHSC). The project team's total effort was 1,779 hours in the F&O proposal.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: UPDATE OF THE STORMWATER BMP MANUAL

BIDDER NAME: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

DATE: 12/17/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Jeff Dennis

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- CEI's current work on the MA and NH manuals is probably a plus*
- It appears that there is only very limited expertise detailed BMP design in the CEI Team that will be working on this manual. All of the seasoned expertise seems to be from the UNH team, although that does not add much in the way of actual design. I wish we could see manuals/draft manuals to inform this decision.*

2. Subcontractors

- UNHSC - All of the seasoned expertise seems to be from the UNH team, although that does not add much in the way of actual design. I wish we could see manuals/draft manuals to inform this decision. Having Mark Voorhees and James Houle, since their combined expertise created the performance curves that SCM selection relies on is a plus.*

3. Organizational Chart – Very simplistic and doesn't describe individual roles to any degree

4. I am concerned about a lack of stormwater design expertise on the team that will actually do the individual BMP design and siting specs. Limited experience means lack of exposure to many of the situations that will have to be addressed in the manual.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: UPDATE OF THE STORMWATER BMP MANUAL

BIDDER NAME: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

DATE: 12/17/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Jeff Dennis

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

- *Scope of Work Finalization: The proposal aligns with the RFP for this task with little modification.*
- *Manual Revisions: The proposal aligns with the RFP but assumes the tools developed will be relatively simple. CEI recommends that two drafts, the first without tools and shared with the department by Volume. In my opinion, this is a good recommendation as it will at least partly address my concern that consultation with DEP staff about the details of each BMP design will be limited and the result will be an initial draft that will be weaker than it might otherwise be if there was more more informal interaction built into the process.*

•

2. *Implementation – Work Plan*

- *The proposed work plan is reasonable but I am concerned insufficient time and resources will be applied to Task 2, which I think is extremely important and, if done comprehensively, will make Task 3 much easier.*

•

•

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER NAME: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

DATE: 12/17/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Kerem Gungor

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

My review findings for Section II (Appendix C) submission of the Bidder are presented below.

1. Overview of Organization

- Recent involvement in a project very similar to the Department's Chapter 500 rulemaking project: MassDEP Wetlands Regulations & Stormwater Handbook Update Project,*
- The Bidder offers a diverse skill set. Stormwater modeling capabilities can be useful for the stormwater manual update project (Appendix C page 2),*
- Three example projects: Two of the projects are directly relevant to the RFP: NH Stormwater Manual (NHDES), MA Stormwater Handbook (MassDEP). The third example is municipal technical services for stormwater management, which does not necessarily reflect the Bidder's qualifications to update a comprehensive stormwater manual,*

•

2. Subcontractors

- The Bidder has one subcontractor: The University of New Hampshire Stormwater Center (UNHSC),*
- UNHSC is the only organization specialized in stormwater management research and development in New England region. The subcontractor is highly qualified for the Department's stormwater manual update project.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER NAME: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

DATE: 12/17/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Kerem Gungor

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

3. Organizational Chart

- *The project team consists of six professionals working for the Bidder and three professionals working for the Subcontractor. The team members are predominantly engineers,*
- *My understanding is that the key technical staff consisting of three engineers will be doing the bulk of the work. The remaining six will be mostly reviewing the key technical staff's work.*

4. Litigation

- *One litigation case within the past five years, still open and in mediation.*

5. Licensure/Certification

- *Four team members' professional engineering licenses were provided. It is highly likely that the Bidder's submission is not comprehensive.*

6. Certificate of Insurance

- *The certificate states the Bidder is covered up to \$2 million.*

II. Proposed Services

The Bidder mostly maintained the Department's RFP language in this submission and inserted text in italicized blue. Considering the Bidder's experience in the field, I would expect the Bidder to elaborate more on the services to be provided and make suggestions on supplementary tools/materials, manual format etc.

1. Services to be Provided

- *I have noted that the Bidder will be responsible for all deliverables. The Subcontractor will be only in an advisory role. Heavy-lifting will be done by the key technical staff.*
- *The Bidder's only substantial edit is under Task 3. The example provided for impervious area disconnection and vegetated buffers is a representative one.*
- *The Bidder's recommendation to submit two drafts: one without the figures/tools and the other one with the figures/tools is good and acceptable.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER NAME: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

DATE: 12/17/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Kerem Gungor

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *The work plan is reasonable overall: nine months for drafting the manual, and five months for the manual finalization,*
- *The Bidder proposes that Task 3 will have two drafting subtasks. The first one, (see “Draft 1: Manual”), will include drafting the manual text. I understand that the Bidder intends to work on the tools/figures/examples after the Department ok’s the text “Draft 2: Manual”. I envision that these two subtasks will overlap: once a chapter’s text is ok’d, the drafting work on its tools/figures/examples will commence.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER NAME: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

DATE: 12/17/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: David A. Waddell

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Env. Protection

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I. Preliminary Information: Includes all elements addressed above in Part IV, Section I.

P: aligns well

Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience: Includes all elements addressed above in Part IV, Section II.

Proposal:

Task 1: Project Management and Administration

- a. Meetings with the Department Staff & the Workgroup (Maximum Number of Meetings = 12*)
- b. Public Informational Webinar (One Webinar)
- c. Public Comment Process (Maximum One Memorandum)
- d. Manual Workshop (Assistance with One Workshop)

P: aligns well

Task 2: Scope of Work Finalization

- a. Needs Assessment
- b. BAI Research
- c. Technical Memorandum

P: aligns well

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER NAME: Comprehensive Environmental, Inc.

DATE: 12/17/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: David A. Waddell

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Env. Protection

Task 3: Draft Revisions to the Manual

I: Break up of Draft submittals, *“Note: Given recent experience, the Project Team recommends that two (2) Drafts of the manual be developed. The first draft will include all suggested content and will not include new figures or calculation tools. To enable more efficient review, the first draft will be shared with the Department by Volume. The second draft of the manual will include all figures and calculation tools and will be shared with the Department as a complete draft (i.e., all volumes and tools).”*

Q: “The Project Team will create up to 10 new figures (e.g., diagrams, illustrations, drawings) for the manual”

Task 4: Final Revisions to the Manual

P: aligns well

Section III. Proposed: Includes all elements addressed above in Part IV, Section III.

Section IV. Cost Proposal: Includes all elements addressed above in Part IV, Section IV.

Q: BAI Budget

P: Detailed Budget is useful.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: UPDATE OF THE STORMWATER BMP MANUAL

BIDDER NAME: Fuss & O'Neill, INC.

DATE: 12/17/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Jeff Dennis

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department's RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Directions: *Follow the sections of your RFP to develop a bulleted outline for notes. Delete the sample below and these directions and replace with your own outline based on your RFP.*

I. *Organization Qualifications and Experience*

1. *Overview of Organization*

- *Fuss and O'Neill team is large but many members appear to have only limited experience with innovative BMP design. It's hard to say who will be working on the actual BMP design specs and what they will bring to the table*
- *The Team has worked, with UNHSC, on the update of the Connecticut BMP Manual. I have not had time to review the manual so will be interested in Kerem's thoughts.*

2. *Subcontractors*

- *Acorn has done a lot of work designing BMPs for Maine and is willing to think outside the traditional box on BMP design. Aubrey's experience as a DEP stormwater engineer and her strong participation in the Ch 500 update process is a big plus.*
- *UNH Stormwater Center involvement is key to the manual re-write effort. They, particularly James Houle, have a wealth of relevant knowledge on BMP effectiveness, design detail considerations, and were instrumental in development of the performance curves that will be the foundation of our stressor guided SCM selection process*

3. *Organizational Chart: With the exception of James Houle, it is hard to judge the ability of the competence and innovation of the rest of the*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: UPDATE OF THE STORMWATER BMP MANUAL

BIDDER NAME: Fuss & O'Neill, INC.

DATE: 12/17/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Jeff Dennis

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

Stormwater Management Revisions Team. Some have only limited experience and not necessarily with detailed BMP design and the devil's in the details.

4. *I am concerned about a lack of stormwater design expertise on the team that will actually do the individual BMP design and siting specs. Limited experience means lack of exposure to many of the situations that will have to be addressed in the manual.*

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- *2. Scope of work – the proposal reflects a good understanding of the process described in the RFP and has indicated how important they feel this task is.*
- *3. Draft revisions to the manual – Proposal reflects the the RFP but I am concerned that consultation with DEP staff about the details of each BMP design will be limited and the result will be an initial draft that will be weaker than it might otherwise be if there was more more informal interaction built into the process.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *The proposed Work Plan seems reasonable.*
-
-

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER NAME: Fuss & O'Neill, Inc.

DATE: 12/17/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Kerem Gungor

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

My review findings for Section II (Appendix C) submission of the Bidder are presented below.

1. Overview of Organization

- The project team, including the subcontractors, consists of 12 professionals who are predominantly engineers. There is one landscape architect in the team,*
- The Bidder and one of its subcontractors are consulting engineering firms which have hands-on experience with the design and implementation of stormwater management systems, which can be useful for the stormwater manual update project,*
- Three example projects: CT Stormwater Quality Manual (CTDEEP), RI Linear Stormwater Manual (RIDOT), and Long Creek Watershed Management Project. The first two projects are directly relevant to the RFP, and they are recent projects undertaken within the past five years. The most relevant is the CT Stormwater Quality Manual project,*

2. Subcontractors

- The Bidder will be working with two subcontractors: Acorn Engineering & the University of New Hampshire Stormwater Center (UNHSC). Three team members are from Acorn Engineering and one team member is from UNHSC,*
- UNHSC is the only organization specialized in stormwater management research and development in New England region. The subcontractor is highly qualified for the Department's stormwater manual update project,*
- Acorn Engineering has ample hands-on experience with stormwater management projects in Maine.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER NAME: Fuss & O'Neill, Inc.

DATE: 12/17/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Kerem Gungor

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

3. Organizational Chart

- *The chart breaks down the project team into four subgroups based on the major activities: Quality Assurance/Quality Control (QA/QC), Needs Assessment and Best Available Information Research, Stormwater Manual Revisions, and Stormwater Tools Development. Eight people are tasked with the stormwater manual revisions including the subcontractors,*
- *Since the project team is considerably large, it is important to clearly define tasks for each team member. The Bidder proposes an assistant project manager in addition to the project manager in the chart.*

4. Litigation

- *Six claims have been filed against the Bidder over the past five years.*

5. Licensure/Certification

- *I have counted certificate/license submissions for nine team members. Certification numbers provided for the rest.*
- *Tom Ballestero's (UNHSC) certification information has been provided. Ballestero is not a member of the project team.*

6. Certificate of Insurance

The Bidder has provided evidence of liability coverage up to \$5 million.

II. Proposed Services

The Bidder mostly maintained the Department's RFP language in the submission. The Bidder provided estimated time used for budgeting. The Bidder's original edits are concentrated under Task 2 and Task 3.

1. Services to be Provided

- *The Bidder highlighted critical tasks in the submission: scope of work finalization and the associated technical memorandum,*
- *The Bidder expanded upon the structure and format of the final manual under Task 3 and identified important organizational and structural elements (e.g., ADA compliance) of the final manual,*
- *The Bidder offers to complete a survey for the needs assessment, which is an original addition not required by the RFP,*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER NAME: Fuss & O'Neill, Inc.

DATE: 12/17/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Kerem Gungor

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Environmental Protection

- *The Bidder expanded on Table 2 of RFP and provided “issues” that need to be addressed under each topic. These issues are mostly aligned with the Department’s priorities.*
- *The Bidder has not given any examples on what type of tools can be developed or what type of services it can provide for tool development.*

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- *The Bidder has submitted a project schedule addressing each specific task as presented in the RFP,*
- *The project schedule is reasonable overall: eight months for drafting the manual, and five months for the manual finalization.*

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157
RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual
BIDDER NAME: Fuss & O’Neill
DATE: 12/17/2024
EVALUATOR NAME: David A. Waddell
EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Env. Protection

Instructions: *The purpose of this form is to record proposal review notes written by **individual** evaluators for this Request for Proposals (RFP) process. It is **required** that each individual evaluator make notes for each proposal that he or she reviews. No numerical scoring should take place on these notes, as that is performed only during team consensus evaluation meetings. A separate form is available for team consensus evaluation notes and scoring. Once complete, please submit a copy of this document to your Department’s RFP Coordinator or Lead Evaluator for this RFP.*

Individual Evaluator Comments:

Section I. Preliminary Information: Includes all elements addressed above in Part IV, Section I.

P: aligns well

Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience: Includes all elements addressed above in Part IV, Section II.

Proposal:

Task 1: Project Management and Administration

- a. Meetings with the Department Staff & the Workgroup (Maximum Number of Meetings = 12*)
- b. Public Informational Webinar (One Webinar)
- c. Public Comment Process (Maximum One Memorandum)
- d. Manual Workshop (Assistance with One Workshop)

P: aligns well

Task 2: Scope of Work Finalization

- a. Needs Assessment
- b. BAI Research
- c. Technical Memorandum

P: aligns well

Q: BAI “Non-exhaustive”

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408157

RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

BIDDER NAME: Fuss & O'Neill

DATE: 12/17/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: David A. Waddell

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Env. Protection

Q: BAI research 95 hours

Task 3: Draft Revisions to the Manual

I: 5 Examples

I: *“will create up to 5 new tools to supplement the manual”*

I: *“Enriched with supplementary materials including new tools and background information to enhance the end users’ understanding of the subject matter.”*

Q: *“The Fuss & O’Neill team will create no more than 10 new figures (e.g., diagrams, illustrations, drawings) for the manual”*

Task 4: Final Revisions to the Manual

Q: Appendix C Qualifications and Experience Mentions UNH involvement as an after thought.

Section III. Proposed: Includes all elements addressed above in Part IV, Section III.

Section IV. Cost Proposal: Includes all elements addressed above in Part IV, Section IV.

Q: No detailed budget.



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202408157
RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

I, Jeff Dennis accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Jeff Dennis'.

12/17/2024

Signature

Date



**STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION**

**Janet T. Mills
Governor**

**Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner**

**AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202408157
RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual**

I, Kerem Gungor, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Kerem Gungor', followed by a horizontal line.

Signature

12/17/2024
Date



STATE OF MAINE
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Melanie Loyzim
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202408157
RFP TITLE: Update of the Stormwater BMP Manual

I, David A. Waddell accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Department of Environmental Protection. I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "David A. Waddell".

12/9/2024

Signature

Date