

**State of Maine
Master Score Sheet**

RFP# 202408155						
Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities						
Bidder Name:		Christensen Associates Energy Consulting	Energy + Environmental Economics (E3)	London Economics International		
Proposed Cost:		\$122,368	\$124,900	\$146,089.50		
Scoring Sections	Points Available					
Section I: Preliminary Information	N/A					
Section II: Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	32	23	33		
Section III: Proposed Services	30	25	25	28		
Section IV: Cost Proposal	35	35	34.29	29.32		
TOTAL	<u>100</u>	<u>92.00</u>	<u>82.29</u>	<u>90.32</u>		

Award Justification Statement
RFP# 202408155
Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of
Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

I. Summary

The RFP was issued on behalf of the Maine PUC seeking proposals for expert consulting services to assist in the examination of regulatory tools based on performance that the Commission may develop and use in rate making proceedings for investor-owned transmission and distribution utilities..

II. Evaluation Process

The evaluation process was conducted in accordance with the rules and protocols of the State of Maine. Specifically, a team consensus approach was used to assign scores for Sections II and III, and Section IV was scored using the required mathematical formula. The evaluation team included three PUC Staff members, each of whom has extensive experience in the areas relevant to this project. Individuals on the team included a division director, senior analyst, and an analyst.

III. Qualifications & Experience

The proposal of the awarded bidder indicated extensive on-point experience and strong qualifications related to the subject matter areas and processes relevant to this project. The awarded bidder has presented a highly experienced team that has demonstrated significant subject matter expertise in performing relevant projects specific to this request.

IV. Proposed Services

The proposal of the awarded bidder provided detailed and comprehensive descriptions of the scope of the services to be provided as well as a thorough and logical process that covered all steps in the process and indicated a clear understanding of the key objectives of this analysis. The selection committee indicated that the awarded bidder has a deep understanding of the performance base ratemaking across jurisdictions in the United States and Canada.

V. Cost Proposal

Cost proposal of the awarded bidder: \$122,368.

VI. Conclusion

For the reasons summarized above, the consensus evaluation and scoring of the evaluation team resulted in the award to Christensen Associates Energy Consulting as indicated in the accompanying evaluation and scoring documents.



STATE OF MAINE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Philip L. Bartlett II
CHAIR

Patrick J. Scully
Carolyn C. Gilbert
COMMISSIONERS

Amy Dumeny
ADMINISTRATIVE DIRECTOR

November 4, 2024

Nick Crowley
Christensen Associates Energy Consulting, LLC
800 University Bay Dr., Suite 400
Madison, WI 53705

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202408155, Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

Dear Mr. Crowley:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission for Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities. The Commission has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Commission is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Christensen Associates Energy Consulting, LLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Commission will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Commission and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Commission is executed. The Commission further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Amy Dumeny".

Amy Dumeny
Administrative Director

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Philip L. Bartlett II
CHAIR

Patrick J. Scully
Carolyn C. Gilbert
COMMISSIONERS

Amy Dumeny
ADMINISTRATIVE DIRECTOR

November 4, 2024

Eric Cutter, Partner
Energy and Environmental Economics, Inc.
44 Montgomery St., Suite 1500
San Francisco, CA 94104

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202408155, Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

Dear Mr. Cutter:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission for Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities. The Commission has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Commission is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Christensen Associates Energy Consulting, LLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Commission will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Commission and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Commission is executed. The Commission further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Amy Dumeny".

Amy Dumeny
Administrative Director

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).



STATE OF MAINE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Philip L. Bartlett II
CHAIR

Patrick J. Scully
Carolyn C. Gilbert
COMMISSIONERS

Amy Dumeny
ADMINISTRATIVE DIRECTOR

November 4, 2024

Marie Fagan, Chief Economist
London Economics International, LLC
717 Atlantic Ave., Suite 1A
Boston, MA 02111

SUBJECT: Notice of Conditional Contract Award under RFP # 202408155, Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

Dear Ms. Fagan:

This letter is in regard to the subject Request for Proposals (RFP), issued by the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission for Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities. The Commission has evaluated the proposals received using the evaluation criteria identified in the RFP, and the Commission is hereby announcing its conditional contract award to the following bidder:

- Christensen Associates Energy Consulting, LLC

The bidder listed above received the evaluation team's highest ranking. The Commission will be contacting the aforementioned bidder soon to negotiate a contract. As provided in the RFP, the Notice of Conditional Contract Award is subject to execution of a written contract and, as a result, this Notice does NOT constitute the formation of a contract between the Commission and the apparent successful vendor. The vendor shall not acquire any legal or equitable rights relative to the contract services until a contract containing terms and conditions acceptable to the Commission is executed. The Commission further reserves the right to cancel this Notice of Conditional Contract Award at any time prior to the execution of a written contract.

As stated in the RFP, following announcement of this award decision, all submissions in response to the RFP are considered public records available for public inspection pursuant to the State of Maine Freedom of Access Act (FOAA). 1 M.R.S. §§ 401 et seq.; 5 M.R.S. § 1825-B (6).

This award decision is conditioned upon final approval by the State Procurement Review Committee and the successful negotiation of a contract. A Statement of Appeal Rights has been provided with this letter; see below.

Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of Maine.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Amy Dumeny".

Amy Dumeny
Administrative Director

STATEMENT OF APPEAL RIGHTS

Any person aggrieved by an award decision may request an appeal hearing. The request must be made to the Director of the Bureau of General Services, in writing, within 15 days of notification of the contract award as provided in 5 M.R.S. § 1825-E (2) and the Rules of the Department of Administrative and Financial Services, Bureau of General Services, Office of State Procurement Services [formerly the Division of Purchases], Chapter 120, § (2) (2).

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: Christensen Associates Energy Consulting

DATE: 10/30/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Name of RFP Coordinator: Celeste Gaylord

Names of Evaluators: Derek Davidson, Michael Simmons, Ethan Grumstrup

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
•		N/A
•		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	32
Section III. Proposed Services	30	25
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	35
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>92</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: Christensen Associates Energy Consulting

DATE: 10/30/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: Christensen Associates Energy Consulting

DATE: 10/30/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	32

Evaluation Team Comments:

Overview of the Organization

- Project team is experienced with PIMS and other utility rate making concepts in the US and Canada.
- Recent work for MPUC on PBR.
- CA has provided examples of prior work that are specifically relevant to this RFP. This includes both the development of PIMs as well as review of existing utility PBR plans.
- CA project team has significant experience with PBR, and utility ratemaking.
- Private firm, does not publicly release financial information, reference letter from bank

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

Proposed Services / Work Plan:

- It is not clear that the CA proposal addresses or identify emerging regulatory mechanisms.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: Christensen Associates Energy Consulting

DATE: 10/30/2024

- Stakeholder engagement plan may be outside the scope of the RFP and be time consuming.
- CA provided examples of practices that have and have not been successful in other jurisdictions. CA has also displayed existing knowledge of PBR subject matter expertise.
- CA will review performance trends (before and after implementation of utility metrics).
- CA provided a detailed work plan with project team hours provided for each task. Deliverables were clearly identified.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: Christensen Associates Energy Consulting

DATE: 10/30/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	.	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
122,368	.	122,368	x	35 points	=	35

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: E3

DATE: 10/30/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Name of RFP Coordinator: Celeste Gaylord

Names of Evaluators: Derek Davidson, Michael Simmons, Ethan Grumstrup

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		
•		N/A
•		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	23
Section III. Proposed Services	30	25
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	34.29
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>82.29</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: E3

DATE: 10/30/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: E3

DATE: 10/30/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	23

Evaluation Team Comments:

Overview of the Organization

- E3 has supported the design and refinement of PBR frameworks for multiple jurisdictions, including Massachusetts, New York, Rhode Island, Minnesota, California, and Alberta.
- Only one experience cited directly related to PBR, others not specifically relevant.
- Primary focus appears to be related to greenhouse gas reductions and stakeholder engagement.
- E3's primary PBR referenced experience is from 2019 and may not reflect current PBR trends.
- Proposed project team is experienced, but none of the individuals listed have included PBR experience. Again, greenhouse gas emissions and climate policy seem to be highlighted.
- Concern that "bread and butter" utility performance functions are not specifically addressed.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: E3

DATE: 10/30/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section III. Proposed Services	30	25

Evaluation Team Comments:

Proposed Services / Work Plan:

- E3 relies heavily on their work for Fortis- Alberta. This work is from 2019 and it is unclear how relevant it is.
- E3 provided a list of jurisdictions that would be considered in its review of where PBR has been implemented.
- Heavy focus on stakeholder engagement.
- E3 proposed timeline looks reasonable and meets the date requirements specified in the RFP.
- Each task of workplan identified E3 staff responsible for task as well as completion estimates and staff hours.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: E3

DATE: 10/30/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal	,	Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
122,368	,	124,900	x	35 points	=	34.29

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: LEI

DATE: 10/30/2024

SUMMARY PAGE

Department Name: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Name of RFP Coordinator: Celeste Gaylord

Names of Evaluators: Derek Davidson, Michael Simmons, Ethan Grumstrup

<u>Pass/Fail Criteria</u>	<u>Pass</u>	<u>Fail</u>
Section I. Preliminary Information (Eligibility)		N/A
•		
•		
•		
<u>Scoring Sections</u>	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	33
Section III. Proposed Services	30	28
Section IV. Cost Proposal	35	29.32
<u>Total Points</u>	<u>100</u>	<u>90.32</u>

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: LEI

DATE: 10/30/2024

**OVERVIEW OF SECTION I
Preliminary Information**

Section I. Preliminary Information

Evaluation Team Comments:

N/A

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: LEI

DATE: 10/30/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION II
Organization Qualifications and Experience**

	<u>Points Available</u>	<u>Points Awarded</u>
Section II. Organization Qualifications and Experience	35	33

Evaluation Team Comments:

Overview of the Organization:

- LEI has experience with PBR and demonstrated prior experience, including for other utilities in New England.
- Maine specific experience with 2022-00038 examining est. CMP incentives to invest and establish PIMs.
- LEI demonstrates knowledge of Maine legislative background related to PBR.
- LEI has researched PBR and PIMs across jurisdictions and has benchmarked utility performance.
- Projected team is qualified and has specific experience with PBR.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: LEI

DATE: 10/30/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION III
Proposed Services**

	<u>Points Available</u> e	<u>Points Awarded</u> d
Section III. Proposed Services	30	28

Evaluation Team Comments:

Scope of Services / Work Plan:

- Presents potential list of jurisdictions to review.
- Illustrative seven step chart clarifies LEI's approach to the process
- Will choose case studies based on states with MRP, some form of PBR, metrics with rewards or penalties, and rigorous PIM process.
- LEI will compare case study findings with traditional mechanisms and will rank mechanisms based on potential to achieve goals, implementation feasibility, and stakeholder acceptance.
- Deliverables are clearly identified and explained.
- Timeline is consistent with the RFP. LEI has adequately explained the steps necessary to complete the work.

**STATE OF MAINE
TEAM CONSENSUS EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER: LEI

DATE: 10/30/2024

**EVALUATION OF SECTION IV
Cost Proposal**

Lowest Submitted Cost Proposal		Cost Proposal Being Scored	x	Score Weight	=	Score
122,368		146,089.50	x	35 points	=	29.32

Evaluation Team Comments:

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: Christensen Associates Energy Consulting

DATE: October 28, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Derek Davidson

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Project team has significant amount of experience with incentive regulation and developing PIMs across the country
- Bid cited various projects related to PIMs and marginal cost studies; not specific regarding the clients (I)

2. Subcontractors

- N/A

3. Organizational Chart

- Four person team, three economists (I)

4. Litigation

- None

5. Financial Viability

- Private firm, does not publicly release financial information, reference letter from bank

6. Licensure/Certification

- N/A

7. Certificate of Insurance

- Check

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Lessons from other jurisdictions (Task 1)
 - Will synthesize information collected across multiple generations of regulatory framework to understand reasons why regulatory changes were made over time (I)
- Development of Goals/Metrics/PMIs (Task 2)
 - Identify options for Maine to better align utility performance with states policies and goals. (this was a little vague) (N)
 - Participate with stakeholders. Posed two options: understate a survey (too time consuming, unnecessary); or participate in stakeholder mtgs (preferable) (I)
- Identify emerging regulatory mechanisms
 - Did not specifically address this task (N)

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: Christensen Associates Energy Consulting

DATE: October 28, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Derek Davidson

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Kick off mtg
- Task 1 Jurisdictional Review – Will develop workplan that details agreed-upon approach
- Task 2 Identify Potential Options for Maine
- Task 3 Stakeholder Engagement
- Task 4 Develop Goals and Metrics
- Task 5 Draft Final Report

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: Christensen Associates

DATE: 10/28/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: M Simmons

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- (+) Projected team is qualified and has specific experience with PBR, benchmarking and PIM.
- (+) CA has relevant experience working with regulators and other utilities in the New England market, including providing testimony and leading stakeholder events.
- (+) CA has provided examples of prior work that are specifically relevant to this RFP. This includes both the development of PIMs as well as review of existing utility PBR plans.
- (+) CA project team has significant experience with PBR, and utility ratemaking.
- (?) CA provided a bank letter in lieu of financial statements.

2. Subcontractors – N/A

3. Organizational Chart – project team was defined, and roles and responsibilities were clearly stated. Short bios were provided for each team member.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- (I) CA proposed a slightly revise approach to performing the RFP scope of work.
- (+) CA will review performance trends (before and after implementation of utility metrics)
- (+) CA will provide memos related to each stage of the investigation. These will be rolled into the final report.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- (+) CA provided a detailed work plan with project team hours provided for each task.
- (+) Deliverables for each task were clearly identified.
- (+) The schedule is consistent with the intent of the RFP to have a final report by the end of April 2025.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: Christensen Associates Energy Consulting, LLC

DATE: 10/24/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Ethan Grumstrup

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Qualifications and Experience

A. Overview of the Organization

P – Recent projects include work on PIMs, performance targets, and jurisdictional review

P – Developed PBR plans for several utilities in Massachusetts and Canada.

P – Recent work for MPUC on PBR

P – Work has involved expert testimony in various jurisdictions on several projects

B. Organizational Chart

P – Lots of analytical skills and expertise

P – Two team members have direct experience in PBR

Financial viability (reference letter) and certificate of insurance provided

II. Proposed Services

A. Services to be Provided

P – Mentions examples of practices that have and have not been successful in other jurisdictions

P – Clear understanding of the tasks

P – Displays existing knowledge of PBR research

B. Work Plan

Q – Details a stakeholder engagement plan which may be outside the scope of the RFP

Fits the timeline of the RFP

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: E3 Consulting

DATE: October 28, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Derek Davidson

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Large Company with 300 consultants who's been in business since 1989. (P)
- Modest amount of experience establishing PBRs, primary focus on greenhouse gas reductions and stakeholder engagement. (I)
- Project 3 in bid directly related to establishing PIMs in New England, other two projects somewhat related. (I)

2. Subcontractors

- N/A

3. Organizational Chart

- Project Team consists of four staff members with three project advisors. Team is highly experienced in area of reducing greenhouse gas emission and advising states on how to reach climate change goals. (I/N)

4. Litigation

- N/A

5. Financial Viability

- See SEC filings cited in bid.

6. Licensure/Certification

- N/A

7. Certificate of Insurance

- Check

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Lessons from other jurisdictions (Task A)
 - E3 will identify and review relevant jurisdictions (vertically integrated and restructured) that that have implemented PBR.(Cal., Hawaii, Mass., New York, North Carolina, Vermont, and Washington) (P)

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: E3 Consulting

DATE: October 28, 2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Derek Davidson

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

- Will rely heavily on FortisAlberta testimony as base for review. (I)
- Review will result in a report to the Commission – can be used internally or as part of stakeholder process. (I)
- Development of Goals/Metrics/PMIs (Task B)
 - Kick off with workshop led by E3 to summarize findings of Task A and align performance goals and metrics with seven identified Commission objectives.
 - E3 will draft memo on priority goals and standards based on workshop feedback.
 - Heavy reliance on stakeholder process. (I)
- Identify emerging regulatory mechanisms
 - E3 will review Maine’s current regulatory framework, define objectives, and determine potential regulatory frameworks that align utilities interests with objectives.
 - Finally, E3 will evaluate benefits and risks of potential mechanisms and incorporate findings into a memo. (I)
 - Reasonable plan, not super specific on details.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Will start process by developing a detailed workplan with staff that outlines due dates and deliverables.
- Bi-weekly check-ins with staff
- E3 proposed timeline looks reasonable and meets the date requirements specified in the RFP.
- Each task of workplan identified E3 staff responsible for task as well as completion estimates and staff hours. (P)

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: E3

DATE: 10/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: M Simmons

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- (+) Broad knowledge base on regulatory incentives and climate policy.
- (+) Supported the design and refinement of PBR frameworks for multiple jurisdictions, including Massachusetts, New York, Rhode Island, Minnesota, California, and Alberta.
- (+) Familiar with the New England's electricity market.
- (+) Experience supporting state energy regulators, utilities and ENGO.
- (+) Well-defined organizational chart with attached resumes. Senior level project team with necessary expertise to fulfill the scope of the RFP.

2. Subcontractors – N/A

3. Organizational Chart – Provided.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- (+) Provided example of prior work for Fortis- Alberta.
- (Q) Not clear how the optional stakeholder presentation in Task 1 is different that what is proposed for Task 2.
- (+) Illustrative mapping is helpful.
- (I) Committed to stakeholder input to gain support for potential metrics.

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- (+) Workplan is well explained and includes the necessary deliverables.
- (+) Projected timelines are within the expectations established in the RFP.
- (+) Final written report will be in word and will include the deliverables in the earlier phases of the project.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: Energy and Environmental Economics, Inc.

DATE: 10/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Ethan Grumstrup

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

A. Overview of Organization

- P – Jurisdictional review of PBR practices, metrics, and PIMs
- P – Developed recommended metrics and PIMs, and set measurement baselines
- Q – One project description several years out of date.
- Q – Many projects listed are irrelevant to the RFP.
- N – Placeholder text still present

B. Organizational Chart

- P – expert witness experience
- N – No relevant PBR experience or expertise listed

Financial Viability and Certificate of insurance provided

II. Proposed Services

A. Services to be Provided

- P – Presents list of potential jurisdictions to review
- P – Understands the goals of the RFP
- P – Demonstrates how past experience relates to RFP goals
- P – Has a plan to research innovations in regulatory mechanisms

Achieves tasks in the RFP

B. Work Plan

Fits the RFP timeline

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: LEI

DATE: 10/28/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Derek Davidson

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- Global experience with PBRs
- Maine specific experience with 2022-00038 examining est. CMP incentives to invest and establish PIMs.
- Experience with other New England electric and gas utility companies developing PBRs (EverSource)

2. Subcontractors

- N/A

3. Organizational Chart

- Will use 5 highly experienced staff to manage project (P)

4. Litigation

- None

5. Financial Viability

- Check

6. Licensure/Certification

- N/A

7. Certificate of Insurance

- Check

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- Lessons from other jurisdictions (Task 1)
 - LEI proposes to perform four case studies, including vertically integrated utilities as well as restructured (P)
 - Will choose case studies based on states with MRP, some form of PBR, metrics with rewards or penalties, and rigorous PIM process (P)
 - Will use case studies to examine different options for stakeholder engagement (I)
- Development of Goals/Metrics/PMIs (Task 2)
 - LEI will assist commission with developing goals to be used in phase 3 of project. Vague on details. (N)

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: LEI

DATE: 10/28/24

EVALUATOR NAME: Derek Davidson

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

- Identify emerging regulatory mechanisms (Task 3)
 - Will compare case study findings with traditional mechanisms. (P)
 - LEI will rank mechanisms based on potential to achieve goals, implementation feasibility, and stakeholder acceptance. (P)

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- Kick off mtg to discuss project/refine workplan if necessary
- Task 1 completed by 12/27/24.
- Task 2 completed by 2/21/25
- Task 3 completed by 3/21/25
- Final report by 4/16/25 (draft) final by 4/30/25.

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: London Economics

DATE: 10/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: M Simmons

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

1. Overview of Organization

- (+) Projected team is qualified and has specific experience with PBR.
- (+) LEI has experience with the New England electricity market and specifically working in Maine.
- (+) Projected team is qualified and has specific experience with PBR.
- (+) Experience references reflect prior work with similar scope of work.
- (-) LEI will provide the required financial statement if awarded the bid.

2. Subcontractors – N/A

3. Organizational Chart – provided and clearly defines roles and responsibilities.

II. Proposed Services

1. Services to be Provided

- (+) Experience references reflect prior work with similar scope of work.
- (+) Services are well thought out and reflect a strong understanding of services being requested in this RFP.
- (+) Illustrative seven step chart is helpful in understanding LEI's approach to the process.

•

2. Implementation – Work Plan

- (+) Deliverables are clearly identified and explained.
- (+) Timeline is consistent with the RFP. LEI has adequately explained the steps necessary to complete the work.

•

•

•

**STATE OF MAINE
INDIVIDUAL EVALUATION NOTES**

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

BIDDER NAME: London Economics International LLC

DATE: 10/25/2024

EVALUATOR NAME: Ethan Grumstrup

EVALUATOR DEPARTMENT: Maine Public Utilities Commission

Individual Evaluator Comments:

I. Organization Qualifications and Experience

A. Overview of the Organization

P – PBR design experience all over the world including Connecticut

P – Researched PBR and PIMs across jurisdictions

P – Performed benchmarking analysis

P – Designed PIMs

I – Familiarity with New England and Maine power markets

I – Past work with Maine PUC

B. Organizational Chart

P – Managed PBR related projects

P – expert testimony experience

P – PBR and PIMs analysis experience

I – Analytical skills

Q – Several team members' profiles listed twice

Will provide Financial viability if selected.

Certificate of insurance provided

II. Proposed Services

A. Services to be Provided

P – Demonstrates knowledge of Maine legislative background related to PBR

P - Demonstrates knowledge of PBR in other jurisdictions

P – Understands the goals of the RFP

P – Presents potential list of jurisdictions to review

P – Identifies specific considerations associated with each task

P – Identifies potential emerging regulatory mechanisms

Achieves the goals of the RFP

B. Work Plan

Fits the RFP timeline



STATE OF MAINE
MAINE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Philip L. Bartlett, II
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

I, Derek Davidson, accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Derek Davidson".

10/17/24

Signature

Date



STATE OF MAINE
MAINE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Philip L. Bartlett, II
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

I, **(print name at right)** Michael Simmons

_____ accept the offer to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Michael Simmons

Signature

10/10/2024

Date



STATE OF MAINE
MAINE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

Janet T. Mills
Governor

Philip L. Bartlett, II
Commissioner

AGREEMENT AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT
RFP #: 202408155

RFP TITLE: Consulting Services to Examine Regulatory Tools Based on Performance of Investor-Owned Transmission and Distribution Utilities

I, (print name at right)

Ethan Gramstrup

accept the offer

to become a member of the Request for Proposals (RFP) Evaluation Team for the State of Maine Public Utilities Commission I do hereby accept the terms set forth in this agreement AND hereby disclose any affiliation or relationship I may have in connection with a bidder who has submitted a proposal to this RFP.

Neither I nor any member of my immediate family have a personal or financial interest, direct or indirect, in the bidders whose proposals I will be reviewing. "Interest" may include, but is not limited to: current or former ownership in the bidder's company; current or former Board membership; current or former employment with the bidder; current or former personal contractual relationship with the bidder (example: paid consultant); and/or current or former relationship to a bidder's official which could reasonably be construed to constitute a conflict of interest (personal relationships may be perceived by the public as a potential conflict of interest).

I have not advised, consulted with or assisted any bidder in the preparation of any proposal submitted in response to this RFP nor have I submitted a letter of support or similar endorsement.

I understand and agree that the evaluation process is to be conducted in an impartial manner without bias or prejudice. In this regard, I hereby certify that, to the best of my knowledge, there are no circumstances that would reasonably support a good faith charge of bias. I further understand that in the event a good faith charge of bias is made, it will rest with me to decide whether I should be disqualified from participation in the evaluation process.

I agree to hold confidential all information related to the contents of Requests for Proposals presented during the review process until such time as the Department formally releases the award decision notices for public distribution.

Ethan Gramstrup
Signature

10/10/2024
Date